The Journal of Buddhist Ethics

Volume 1 (1994)

Buddhist Ethics in Western Context: The Virtues Approach
Whitehill, James
Contemporary Buddhism increasingly seeks to make itself understood in modern terms and to respond to contemporary conditions. Buddhism's legitimation in the West can be partially met by demonstrating that Buddhist morality is a virtue-oriented, character-based, community-focused ethics, commensurate with the Western "ethics of virtue" tradition. The recent past in Western Buddhist ethics focused on escape from Victorian moralism and was incomplete. A new generation of Western Buddhists is emerging, for whom the "construction" of a Buddhist way of life involves community commitment and moral "practices." By keeping its roots in a character formed as "awakened virtue" and a community guided by an integrative soteriology of wisdom and morality, Western Buddhism can avoid the twin temptations of rootless liberation in an empty "emptiness," on the one hand, and universalistic power politics, on the other. In describing Buddhist ethics as an "ethics of virtue," I am pointing to consistent and essential features in the Buddhist way of life. But, perhaps more importantly, I am describing Buddhist ethics by means of an interpretative framework very much alive in Western and Christian ethics, namely that interpretation of ethics most recently associated with thinkers like Alasdair MacIntyre and Stanley Hauerwas. The virtue ethics tradition is the Western tradition most congenial to the assumptions and insights of Buddhist ethics. Hence, virtue ethics provides a means of understanding Buddhist ethics . . . and, reciprocally, Buddhist ethics also offers the Western tradition a way of expanding the bounds of its virtue ethics tradition, which has been too elitist, rationalistic, and anthropocentric. On the basis of this view, I predict some likely, preferable future directions and limits for Buddhism in a postmodern world.

A Buddhist Ethic Without Karmic Rebirth?
King, Winston L.
Is a viable and authentic Buddhist ethic possible without the prospect of rebirth governed by one's karmic past? This article explores traditional and contemporary views on karma with a view to determining the importance of this doctrine for practical ethics in the West. The Theravāda emphasis on the personal nature of karma is discussed first, followed by a consideration of the evolution of a social dimension to the doctrine in the Mahāyāna. The latter development is attributed to the twin influences of the Bodhisattva ideal and the metaphysics of Nāgārjuna and Hua Yen. Following this survey of traditional perspectives, attention is turned for the greater part of the article to a consideration of the relevance of the notion of karmic rebirth for Buddhist ethics in the West. The notion of "social kamma" advanced by Ken Jones in The Social Face of Buddhism is given critical consideration. The conclusion is that a doctrine of karmic rebirth is not essential to a viable and authentic Buddhist ethic in the West. Is a viable and authentic Buddhist ethic possible without the prospect of rebirth governed by one's karmic past?

Causation and Telos: The Problem of Buddhist Environmental Ethics
Harris, Ian
Environmentalist concerns have moved center stage in most major religious traditions of late and Buddhism is no exception to this rule. This article shows that the canonical writings of Indic Buddhism possess elements that may harmonize with a de facto ecological consciousness. However, their basic attitude towards the causal process drastically reduces the possibility of developing an authentically Buddhist environmental ethic. The classical treatment of causation fails to resolve successfully the tension between symmetry and asymmetry of relations and this has tended to mean that attempts to inject a telos, or sense of purpose, into the world are likely to founder. The agenda of eco-Buddhism is examined in the light of this fact and found wanting.

Vinaya in Theravāda Temples in the United States
Numrich, Paul David
Vinaya (the monastic discipline) plays an essential role in defining traditional Theravāda Buddhism. This article examines the current state of Vinaya recitation and practice in the nearly 150 immigrant Theravāda Buddhist temples in the United States and also speculates on the prospect of traditional Theravāda's firm establishment in this country. Specific Vinaya issues discussed include the pātimokkha ceremony, the discussion about Vinaya adaptation to the American context, adaptations in the areas of monastic attire and relations with women, and principles of adaptation at work in Theravāda temples in the United States.

Volume 2 (1995)

Are There "Human Rights" in Buddhism?
Keown, Damien
It is difficult to think of a more urgent question for Buddhism in the late twentieth century than human rights. Human rights issues in which Buddhism has a direct involvement, notably in the case of Tibet, feature regularly on the agenda in superpower diplomacy. The political, ethical and philosophical questions surrounding human rights are debated vigorously in political and intellectual circles throughout the world. Yet despite its contemporary significance, the subject has merited hardly a footnote in mainstream academic research and publication in the field of Buddhist Studies. Why is this? One reason would seem to be the lack of a precedent within Buddhism itself for discussing issues of this kind; scholars, by and large, continue to follow the tradition's own agenda, an agenda which appears to some increasingly medieval in the shadow of the twenty-first century. If Buddhism wishes to address the issues which are of concern to today's global community, it must begin to ask itself new questions alongside the old ones.

Meditation as Ethical Activity
Dreyfus, Georges
Despite the fact that the various Tibetan Buddhist traditions developed substantive ethical systems on the personal, interpersonal and social levels, they did not develop systematic theoretical reflections on the nature and scope of ethics. Precisely because very little attention is devoted to the nature of ethical concepts,

problems are created for modern scholars who are thus hindered in making comparisons between Buddhist and Western ethics. This article thus examines the continuity between meditation and daily life in the context of understanding the ethical character of meditation as practiced by Tibetan Buddhists. The discussion is largely limited to the practice of meditation as taught in the *lam rim* (or *Gradual Stages of the Path*).

A Buddhist Response to the Nature of Human Rights
Inada, Kenneth
It is incorrect to assume that the concept of human rights is readily identifiable in all societies of the world. The concept may perhaps be clear and distinct in legal quarters, but in actual practice it suffers greatly from lack of clarity and gray areas due to impositions by different cultures. This is especially true in Asia, where the two great civilizations of India and China have spawned such outstanding systems as Hinduism, Buddhism, Jainism, Yoga, Confucianism, Taoism and Chinese Buddhism. These systems, together with other indigenous folk beliefs, attest to the cultural diversity at play that characterizes Asia proper. In focusing on the concept of human rights, however, we shall concentrate on Buddhism to bring out the common grounds of discourse.

Judeo-Christian and Buddhist Justice
King, Winston
This article compares and contrasts the traditional Judeo-Christian and Buddhist notions of justice. It begins with an examination of some traditional biblical resources, such as the Job story, and moves ahead to trace Buddhist ideas about justice as developed in the Pāli Canon. In the Conclusion, more recent Buddhist considerations are developed, such as those found in Zen and in modern socially engaged Buddhism.

Cutting the Roots of Virtue: Tsongkhapa on the Results of Anger
Cozort, Daniel
Anger is the most powerful of the *kleśas* that not only "plant seeds" for suffering but also "cut the roots of virtue" for periods of up to a thousand eons per instance. This article examines and assesses the exegesis by Tsongkhapa, founder of the Tibetan Gelukba order, of Indian sources on the topic of anger. It argues that despite Tsongkhapa's many careful qualifications he may not be successful in avoiding the conclusion that if the *sūtras* are to be accepted literally, there almost certainly will be persons for whom liberation from *saṃsāra* is precluded.

Buddhism and Medical Ethics: A Bibliographic Introduction
Hughes, James J.
Keown, Damien
This article provides an introduction to some contemporary issues in medical ethics and the literature which addresses them from a Buddhist perspective. The first part of the article discusses Buddhism and medicine and outlines some of the main issues in contemporary medical ethics. In the rest of the article three subjects are considered: (1) moral personhood, (2) abortion, and (3) death, dying and euthanasia.

Ethics and Integration in American Buddhism
Prebish, Charles S.
This article identifies and explicates several of the most difficult and problematic issues facing the North American Buddhist movement today. It considers not only the obvious conflict between Asian-American and Euro-American Buddhism, but also those concerns that most directly impact on the ethical dilemmas facing modern American Buddhists. The article considers the tension that exists in American Buddhism's struggle to find the ideal community for Buddhist practice in its Western environment, as well as some potentially creative solutions.

Criteria for Judging the Unwholesomeness of Actions in the Texts of Theravāda Buddhism
Harvey, Peter
After briefly reviewing the role of ethics on the path in Theravāda texts, the article moves on to discuss the various criteria for distinguishing between wholesome and unwholesome actions. It then explores the gradation of unwholesomeness of actions according to several variables, and then applies this to wholesome actions, here highlighting the importance of right view. Finally, the question of the relation between precept-taking and the moral worth of actions is assessed.

Practicing Peace: Social Engagement in Western Buddhism
Kraft, Kenneth
This essay examines some current concerns of socially engaged Buddhists in the West. How does one practice nonviolence in one's own life and in the world? How can the demands of "inner" and "outer" work be reconciled? What framework should be used in assessing the effects of Buddhist-inspired activism? Today's engaged Buddhists do not refer extensively to Buddhism's ethical tradition, and some of their activities may not appear to be distinctively Buddhist. Nonetheless, their efforts reflect a longstanding Mahāyāna ideal—that transcendental wisdom is actualized most meaningfully in compassionate action.

Getting to Grips With Buddhist Environmentalism: A Provisional Typology
Harris, Ian
This article offers a survey of current writing and practice within the area of Buddhist environmental ethics. Consideration of the manner in which sections of contemporary Buddhism have embraced a range of environmental concerns suggests that four fairly distinct types of discourse are in the process of formation, i.e., eco-spirituality, eco-justice, eco-traditionalism and eco-apologetics. This fourfold typology is described, and examples of each type are discussed. The question of the "authenticity", from the Buddhist perspective, is addressed to each type in turn.

The Kurudhamma: From Ethics to Statecraft
Huxley, Andrew
This article compares two literary treatments of a Buddhist ethical motif. In the prose sections of the *Kurudhamma Jātaka* the motif is expanded into a collection of ethical casuistry. In the Kurudhamma *kaṇḍa pañho*, it is expanded into a series of job descriptions for the king and ten of his subordinates. Description of these provokes discussion of the history of the practice of ethics by Buddhist monks and Buddhist courtiers.

Volume 3 (1996)

Two Notions of Poverty in the Pāli Canon
Fenn, Mavis
The article is divided into two sections. The first focuses on an analysis of the *Cakkavatti-Sīhanāda Sutta*, a sutta that provides the most extensive discussion of poverty as deprivation in the *Nikāyas*. Poverty in this text is primarily a socio-political issue that effects the spiritual development of all members of society. The second section of the article focuses on the notion of poverty as simplicity, a notion associated with renouncers who are *akiñcana*, "without anything," "lacking possessions." Central to this section is an analysis of the *Aggañña Sutta*.

Good or Skilful? *Kusala* in Canon and Commentary
Cousins, L. S.
This article examines the use of *kusala* in the commentarial sources and finds that, although the commentators are aware of various senses of the word *kusala*, they tend to give primacy to meanings such as "good" or "meritorious." A detailed examination of the canonical Pāli sources gives a rather different picture. The original meaning of *kuśala* (Sanskrit) in the sense with which we are concerned would then be "intelligent." Its sense in early Buddhist literature would be "produced by wisdom." The article concludes with a brief discussion of the concept of *puñña*—"fortune-bringing action" rather than "merit."

Continuity and Change in the Economic Ethics of Buddhism: Evidence From the History of Buddhism in India, China and Japan
Ornatowski, Gregory K.
This article offers an outline of the development of Buddhist economic ethics using examples from early Theravāda Buddhism in India and the Mahāyāna tradition as it evolved in India, medieval China, and medieval and early modern Japan, in order to illustrate the pattern of continuities and transformations these ethics have undergone. By "economic ethics" the article refers to four broad areas: (1) attitudes toward wealth, i.e., its accumulation, use, and distribution, including the issues of economic justice and equality/ inequality; (2) attitudes toward charity, i.e., how and to whom wealth should be given; (3) attitudes toward human labor and secular occupations in society; and (4) actual economic activities of temples and monasteries which reflect the lived-practice of Buddhist communities' economic ethics.

Volume 4 (1997)

The Early Buddhist Tradition and Ecological Ethics
Schmithausen, Lambert
This article is concerned with ecological ethics, and examines the contemporary ecological crisis from the perspective of early Buddhism. Through an examination of early texts (mainly the Pāli Canon) it asks to what extent ecological ethics has formed part of the teachings of Buddhism and whether contemporary ecological

concerns can be integrated into this tradition. A range of divergent opinions held by modern authors are critically reviewed in the first section, followed in section two by a discussion of nature in the light of the Buddhist evaluation of existence. Section three considers the adequacy of the doctrine of Origination in Dependence as a basis for ecological ethics, and section four discusses early Buddhist spirituality and ethics in the context of ecological concerns. Section five is devoted to evaluations of nature versus civilization and section six discusses the status of animals. The conclusion is that early Buddhism was impressed not so much by the beauty of nature as by its somber aspects. It seeks not to transform or subjugate nature but to transcend it spiritually through detachment. However, although Buddhism does not romanticize nature it does not mean it is altogether impossible to establish an ecological ethics on the basis of the early tradition.

Teleologized "Virtue" or Mere Religious "Character"? A Critique of Buddhist Ethics From the Shin Buddhist Point of View

Lewis, Stephen J., Amstutz, Galen

When comparative ethicists consider the question of ethics in Buddhism, they are tempted to implicate conceptions of teleology and virtue from Western philosophy. Such implications cannot apply to Mahāyāna exemplified in the Japanese Shin tradition. Shin is characterized not only by emptiness philosophy but also by its emphasis on spontaneous (*tariki*) enlightenment; both of these features undercut the notion that Buddhism can ultimately concern an intentional goal. But a teleological or virtue-oriented sensibility is not needed for the purposes of ordinary life. On the contrary, Shin social history has demonstrated that a powerful tradition of practical life based on Buddhist teaching can exist perfectly well without it. Such wisdom manifests itself both socially and at the individual level as a kind of character, if not ethics in the usual sense.

The General and the Particular in Theravāda Ethics: A Response to Charles Hallisey

Schilbrack, Kevin

In the most recent issue of *JBE* (volume 3, 1996), Charles Hallisey calls into question what he sees as a pernicious assumption at work in the study of Theravāda ethics. The problem, according to Hallisey, is that many scholars who study Theravāda ethics assume that the Theravāda tradition has only a single moral theory, and they therefore try to reduce the plurality of the tradition to fit their single-theory view. Hallisey recommends that scholars see the Theravāda ethical tradition as an instance of ethical particularism, a position he describes both as pluralistically including many theories and as having no theory at all. For this reason, Hallisey recommends that scholars abandon the abstract search for the nature of Buddhist ethics in general. After clarifying Hallisey's recommendation, I argue that it is wrong. Although the Theravāda tradition, like any religious tradition, includes more than one ethical theory, there is no good reason not to inquire into its general or formal features. With Russell Sizemore, I recommend an inclusive understanding of comparative religious ethics that sees a place for both for the historical study of the particular and the philosophical study of the general.

A Response To Kevin Schilbrack

Hallisey, Charles

Masao Abe, Zen Buddhism, and Social Ethics
Palmer, Daniel
As the discourse in the West comes to focus more upon social issues, any form of understanding that is to remain alive must be able to respond to such concerns. If Western Buddhism is to survive it must illustrate how it can address these issues. I will argue that Abe recognizes that this has been an area in which Buddhism has been traditionally deficient, but that by reinterpreting several key Buddhist concepts Abe offers a new paradigm of Buddhism that does allow for the possibility of social critique while still retaining the essential insights of traditional Zen Buddhism. In the first section of the article I will develop the specific nature of the criticisms in relation to the traditional understanding of Buddhist doctrine. In the second section I will show how Abe's transvaluation of Zen Buddhism in light of his dialogical hermeneutic takes account of these criticisms and develops the resources within Zen thought to deal with them.

The Dharma Has Come West: A Survey of Recent Studies and Sources
Baumann, Martin
This survey article will point out and discuss existing studies and sources that provide historical information of Buddhist developments in Western, industrialized countries. The aspect of Buddhist influences on European philosophy and psychology as well as results of East-West interaction cannot, unfortunately, be dealt with here. The survey will begin by mentioning the few general overviews, followed by a stock-taking of the respective regional studies.

A Bibliography on Sinhala Buddhism
Deegalle, Mahinda
Scholars identify the Theravāda form of Buddhism that grew in Sri Lanka as Sinhala Buddhism. The adjective Sinhala is both a reference to an ethnic group—Sinhala people, the majority population in Sri Lanka—and to an Indo-European language—Sinhala, spoken by the Sinhala public. Thus, Sinhala Buddhism has two meanings—Buddhism in the Sinhala language and Buddhism practiced by the Sinhala people.

Volume 5 (1998)

Abortion in Thailand: a Feminist Perspective
Lerdmaleewong, Malee
Francis, Caroline
The objectives of this article are threefold: (1) To examine the abortion debate in Thailand, identifying issues raised by Thai feminist scholars about the status of women; (2) To overview some of the more prominent feminist arguments regarding abortion (particularly those written by Canadian and American scholars) as a tool for defining women's reproductive rights; and (3) To focus on a study of attitudes toward abortion among health care personnel and post-induced abortion patients in Bangkok, Thailand in order to discern the degree of support (if any) for feminist abortion arguments.

Changing Master Narratives in Midstream: Barlaam and Josaphat and the Growth of Religious Intolerance in the Buddhalegend's Westward Journey

MacQueen, Graeme

As the legend of the Buddha moved into Europe in the medieval period in the form of the story of the Christian saints Barlām and Josaphat it became marked for the first time by deep religious intolerance. The article find this structural shift to have been accomplished through two separate but integrated moves: a master narrative of emancipation through enlightenment is replaced by a master narrative of salvation through faith, and a model of religions as linked and overlapping is replaced by a perception of religions as closed systems that compete with and endanger each other.

Working in the Right Spirit: The Application of Buddhist Right Livelihood in the Friends of the Western Buddhist Order

Baumann, Martin

This article shall concentrate on adaptive forms with regard to the interpretation of Buddhist economic ethics in the West as presented by Western Buddhists. A brief outline of ethics in Buddhist teachings will be followed by a presentation of Weber's image of the "world withdrawn Buddhist," allegedly not involved in any social and economic activities. Buddhist ethics, as portrayed by Weber, nowhere promotes socio-political engagement and entrepreneurial activities. Contrary to Weber's stereotyped view, which was widely accepted but rarely questioned, members of The Friends of the Western Buddhist Order have started to develop businesses and cooperatives, thus combining Buddhist teachings and involvement in the world. Their team-based Right Livelihood endeavors already have created a Buddhist economy on a small scale; their ultimate aim is to bring about a transformation of Western society. Thus, supposedly "world withdrawn Buddhists" have become socio-economically active in the Western world.

Echoes of Nalinika: A Monk in the Dock

Adam, Enid

How can Nalinika, one of the Buddhist Jātaka tales, be used in the Perth District Court in Perth, Western Australia, as an illustration in the defense of a Buddhist monk from Sri Lanka? In the dock sat Pannasara Kahatapitye, a high-ranking monk from Colombo, facing eleven charges of sexual assault. Was this a case of cultural, religious, and political bias and misunderstanding, or of a monk breaking monastic vows and practicing immorally? Was this man a charlatan or a genuine monk being framed by dissident Sinhalese groups in Australia? Over ten days the drama developed as evidence was given before judge and jury. Throughout, the accused sat motionless in the dock, smiling benignly at all in the courtroom. Innocent or guilty? This article describes how the issues were resolved as seen from the author's role as a consultant to the crown prosecutor, and examines their implications for the general Buddhist community in Western Australia.

Buddhism and the Morality of Abortion

Barnhart, Michael G.

It is quite clear from a variety of sources that abortion has been severely disapproved of in the Buddhist tradition. It is also equally clear that abortion has been tolerated in Buddhist Japan and accommodated under exceptional circumstances by some modern Buddhists in the US. Those sources most often cited that

prohibit abortion are Theravādin and ancient. By contrast, Japanese Buddhism as well as the traditions out of which a more lenient approach emerges are more recent and Mahāyāna traditions. Buddhism itself, therefore, speaks with more than one moral voice on this issue, and furthermore, the nature of the moral debate may have important applications for similarly situated others and constitute an enlargement of the repertoire of applicable moral theories and rationales.

Abortion, Ambiguity, and Exorcism

LaFleur, William R.

In Japan, persons who have had abortions but believe that a fetus has more value than merely disposable matter may act on that belief, most commonly by making a ritual apology to the spiritual aspect of the fetus, referred to as a *mizuko* or "child of the waters." R. Zwi Werblowsky wrote a scathing attack on the practice of *mizuko kuyô* across the board, claiming that it has been nothing more than a scam from beginning to end. And now, in Marketing the Menacing Fetus in Japan, Helen Hardacre has given us a study which, in essence, makes much the same claim. The issues Hardacre raises are important, not just for an understanding of Japanese religion but because of what they may tell us about the state of our own debates in North America. By this I mean not only our debates about abortion but also about religion, especially as expressed in societies different from our own.

Ethics in the *Lotus Sūtra*

Introduced By Robert E. Florida

Rissho Kosei Kai organised an international conference on the Lotus Sūtra that was held in Bandaiso, Japan, in July of 1997. Twelve scholars from Europe, North America and Japan met together for three days in a pleasant retreat center to discuss various issues and themes in the *Lotus Sūtra.* Five of the articles, those by Robert Florida, Damien Keown, John R.A. Mayer, Peggy Morgan, and Gene Reeves, seemed to fit nicely into the mandate of the *Journal of Buddhist Ethics,* and they are being presented here together.

The *Lotus Sūtra and* Health Care Ethics

Florida, Robert E.

In the last several years there has been an increase in interest in the field of Buddhist ethics, particularly health care ethics. In this article I will review the medical implications found in the *Lotus Sūtra.* I will first discuss some general ethical principles that apply in health care with reference to the *Lotus Sūtra,* and then go on to specific references in the *sūtra* to medicine.

Paternalism in the *Lotus Sūtra*

Keown, Damien

Medical and other analogies which depict the Buddha as a physician or wise parent are found in the Lotus Sūtra and are common in Buddhist literature. To what extent does this image of the wise father-figure encourage paternalism in Buddhist ethics? Making reference to the approach to medical ethics developed by Beauchamp and Childress (the "four principles"), this article discusses the ethics of the Lotus Sūtra in the light of debate about the justifiability of paternalism in contemporary medical practice. It offers a critique of what appears to be an incipient moral paternalism in Mahāyāna Buddhism which manifests itself in a

particular development of the concept of skillful means. It is suggested that Buddhist sources which apply the concept of skillful means to normative ethics may be characterized as "paternalist" insofar as the principle of beneficence is allowed undue predominance over respect for autonomy.

Reflections on the Threefold *Lotus Sūtra*
Mayer, John R.A.
The Threefold Lotus Sūtra provides some very illuminating insights with respect to many of the debates and oppositions which take place in late twentieth-century Western philosophy. The present article represents reflections on how this Mahāyāna text is applicable to issues in contemporary philosophy.

Ethics and the *Lotus Sūtra*
Morgan, Peggy
This article seeks to introduce and reflect upon not only some important ethical issues that emerge in any consideration of this important text, the Lotus Sūtra, but also the many different ways in which this and other questions can be approached in the study of religions. Demonstrably an area or dimension of a religion such as ethics is inextricably related to the other dimensions of religious life such as narratives, doctrines, experience, rituals and even the visual arts. It is also inextricably linked with the distinctive interpretations of the religious communities whose text it is, as well as scholarly dialogue where questions and insights may be a part of the environment within which traditions themselves skillfully adapt and change.

Appropriate Means as an Ethical Doctrine in the *Lotus Sūtra*
Reeves, Gene
In this article I claim that upāya or hōben in the Lotus Sūtra, contrary to how it has often been translated and understood, is an ethical doctrine, the central tenet of which is that one should not do what is expedient but rather what is good, the good being what will actually help someone else, which is also known as bodhisattva practice. Further, the doctrine of hōben is relativistic. No doctrine, teaching, set of words, mode of practice, etc. can claim absoluteness or finality, as all occur within and are relative to some concrete situation. But some things, doing the right thing in the right situation, can be efficacious, sufficient for salvation.

Volume 6 (1999)

In Defense of Dharma: Just-War Ideology in Buddhist Sri Lanka
Bartholomeusz, Tessa
Sri Lankan Buddhists avail themselves of a variety of Buddhist stories, canonical and post-canonical, to support their point of view regarding war. And because there are no pronouncements in the stories attributed to the Buddha or in those stories told about him that declare unequivocally and directly that war is wrong, the military metaphors of the stories allow for a variety of interpretations. Some Buddhists argue that the stories directly or indirectly permit war under certain circumstances, while others argue that war

is never acceptable. Whether they justify war or not, these Buddhists engage the stories, sometimes the very same ones, to argue their points of view.

Changing the Way Society Changes: Transposing Social Activism into a Dramatic Key
Hershock, Peter D.
While many Buddhists are rightly committed to working in the public sphere for the resolution of suffering, there are very real incompatibilities between the axiomatic concepts and strategic biases of (the dominant strands of) both current human rights discourse and social activism and such core Buddhist practices as seeing all things as interdependent, impermanent, empty, and karmically configured. Indeed, the almost startling successes of social activism have been ironic, hinging on its strategic and conceptual indebtedness to core values shared with the technological and ideological forces that have sponsored its own necessity. The above-mentioned Buddhist practices provide a way around the critical blind spot instituted by the marriage of Western rationalism, a technological bias toward control, and the axiomatic status of individual human being, displaying the limits of social activism's institutional approach to change and opening concrete possibilities for a dramatically Buddhist approach to changing the way societies change.

A Buddhist View of Women: A Comparative Study of the Rules for Bhikṣuṇīs and Bhikṣus Based on the Chinese Prātimokṣa
Chung, In Young
A generalized view of women in Buddhism is imposed by almost one hundred additional rules and the "Eight Rules" upon nuns. Some scholars, writers, and practitioners have asserted that the rules in the *Prātimokṣa* subordinate nuns to monks. However, I argue that the additional *pārājikas* for nuns treat sexual matters seriously because of the fertility of females. Some *samghāvaśeṣas* for nuns provide safeguards against falling victim to lustful men. Some *nihsargika-pāyantikas* for monks forbid them from taking advantage of nuns. Two *aniyatas* for monks show a landmark in trust in women. Furthermore, seven *adhikaraṇa-śamathas* provide evidence of the equality of men and women. Many of the additional *pāyantikas* for nuns originated because of nuns' living situations and social conditions in ancient India. Finally, the totally different tone and discrepancies in penalties for the same offenses between the *pāyantikas* and the "Eight Rules" suggest that the "Eight Rules" were appended later.

Attitudes to Euthanasia in the *Vinaya* and Commentary
Keown, Damien
The prohibition on taking human life is one of the cornerstones of Buddhist ethics, but there is often confusion about the interpretation of this prohibition in different contexts. In his commentary on the third *pārājika* in the *Samantapāsādikā*, Buddhaghosa sets out to clarify the legal provisions of the monastic precept against taking life. The root text and his comments on it are relevant to the contemporary debate on euthanasia, and this article considers what light Buddhist jurisprudence can shed on this moral dilemma.

Damming the Dhamma: Problems with *Bhikkhunīs* in the Pāli *Vinaya*
Blackstone, Kate
Why should one of the contesting voices insist on the decline of *saddhamma*? How can women's subordination help preserve the dhamma? This article poses a possible answer. The *Vinaya* represents a very formalized statement of both the individual and communal dimensions of monastic life. It prescribes the activities, appearance, decorum, and lifestyle of individual *bhikkhus* and *bhikkhunīs*. It also specifies the procedures and protocol for the administration of the sangha. In so doing, the *Vinaya* authorizes and delimits the mandate of the monastic community over its members and in relation to its supporting community. In the terms of my analysis, it articulates a model of self-identity and a set of guidelines for the expression of that identity.

***Vinaya* Principles for Assigning Degrees of Culpability**
Harvey, Peter
The Buddhist literature that goes into most explicit detail on factors affecting degree of culpability in wrong actions is the *Vinaya*. While this includes material that goes beyond the scope of ethics per se, it contains much of relevance to ethics. Focusing on overt physical and verbal actions, it also has much to say on states of mind which affect the moral assessment of actions: knowledge, perception, doubt, intention, carelessness, remorse, etc. These factors interact in sometimes complex and subtle ways, and their relevance varies according to the type of action being assessed, rather than being applied in an indiscriminate blanket fashion. The sources used for the article are primarily the Pāli *Vinaya* and its commentary, with some reference to the *Milindapañha*, *Kathvātthu*, and *Abhidharma-kośa-bhāṣya* when they discuss *Vinaya*-related matters.

Buddhist Case Law on Theft: the *Vinītavatthu* on the Second *Pārājika*
Huxley, Andrew
Of the twenty-eight pages of the *vinayapāli* devoted to theft, fifteen contain case law. They are the object of this study. The *vinayapāli* (which was collated and reduced to writing in the first century BCE) consists of oral memorized texts and jottings of various kinds from the prior Buddhist centuries, the core of which must have been fixed by the reign of King Aśoka (circa 273-232 BCE) The four most dramatic offences known to the *vinayapāli* are the *pārājika*, the conditions of defeat, dealt with in the first of its six volumes. The second *pārājika*, identified by a Pāli abstract noun that means taking things which have not properly been offered to you, is what we call theft.

Volume 7 (2000)

The Ethics of Esteem
Hibbets, Maria
This article discusses a number of South Asian discourses on the gift that were composed in the medieval period, mostly in the eleventh-thirteenth centuries C.E. I consider several Theravada anthologies on lay conduct that discuss *dana*, together with several Hindu *Dharmasastra* digests on the gift (*dananibandhas*) and

Jain texts on lay morality (sravakacaras), and trace out quite remarkable similarities in their terminology, interests, and formal concerns regarding the gift. I am interested in how these discourses scrutinize the face-to-face hospitality encounter, and how this scrutiny is a kind of critical and second order reflection on ethical questions. I argue that these gift discourses articulate a moral point of view, which I call an "ethics of esteem," in which the chief moral disposition that a giver should possess is a feeling of unquestioning esteem towards the recipient. Gifts are conceived to flow upwards to worthy recipients (usually monks, nuns and Brahmans) out of esteem and devotion. Conversely, gifts made out of compassion or pity to the needy are not so highly valued.

Selflessness: Toward a Buddhist Vision of Social Justice
Cho, Sungtaek
The difficulty of developing a theoretical framework for Buddhism's engagement with contemporary social issues is rooted in the very nature of Buddhism as an ontological discourse aiming at individual salvation through inner transformation. It is my contention, however, that the concept of "selflessness" can become the basis of a Buddhist theory of social justice without endangering Buddhism's primary focus on individual salvation. In this article, I show how the key concept of selflessness can provide a viable ground for Buddhist social justice by comparing it with one of the most influential contemporary Western theories of social justice, that of the American philosopher John Rawls. Drawing on the bodhisattva ideal and the Buddhist concepts of "sickness" and "cure," I then demonstrate how selflessness can serve as a link that allows Buddhists to be socially engaged even while pursuing the goal of individual salvation.

Family Matters: Dramatic Interdependence and the Intimate Realization of Buddhist Liberation
Hershock, Peter D.
In this article, I assemble a set of narratives that will persuade us to refrain from seeing Buddhist families as either fundamentally biological or essentially cultural phenomena, but rather as dramatic communities in narrative motion away from *saṃsāra* toward *nirvāṇa*—communities intent on *anuttara samyak sambodhi* or utmost and all-encompassing enlightenment. Such a view of the family will stand in significant opposition to the interpretation of enlightenment as a peak and private experience; to the reduction (Buddhist) teachings to texts; and to the belief that it is on the basis of valorizing individuality and equality that we are best able to realize satisfyingly human community. Hopefully, it will also encourage us to question our own prejudices for minimally defining family and community in objective and institutional terms rather than in terms of dramatically exemplary or virtuosic relationships.

Nature, Nurture, and No-Self: Bioengineering and Buddhist Values
Barnhart, Michael G.

Saving the Rainforest of Ethics: Society, Urgency, and the Study of Asia
LaFleur, William R.

How to Reform a Serial Killer: The Buddhist Approach to Restorative Justice
Loy, David R.
This article considers how Buddhist perspectives on crime and punishment support the contemporary movement toward restorative (in place of retributive) justice. It begins by examining the two Pāli suttas that most directly address these issues: the *Angulimala Sutta*, about the reform of a serial killer, and the *Lion's Roar Sutta*, about the responsibility of a ruler. Then it looks at the *Vinaya*, which has many implications for our understanding of motivation and reform, and finally at traditional Tibet to see how its criminal justice system embodied these Buddhist perspectives. It concludes with some reflections on why our present criminal justice systems serve the purposes of the state better than the needs of offenders and their victims.

Volume 8 (2001)

Why the Dalai Lama Should Read Aristotle
McCarthy, Stephen
The purpose of this article is to discover a classical foundation for the establishment of universal human rights in Buddhism. Such a foundation must necessarily overcome the modern barrier imposed by the Asian values rhetoric and its claims that "Western," Lockean, and essentially private ideas of rights have no place in Asian "family-oriented" culture. To facilitate its purpose, this article will consider the modern, Lockean understanding of "rights" as the source of much of the Asian values' argument, and proceed to an examination into the compatibility of a Buddhist understanding of human rights with Aristotle's understanding of ethics and natural law. If it is possible to discover the source of universal human rights in Aristotle's writings, as well as discover a compatibility to Buddhist beliefs and practices, then we may ground a case for the idea of human rights existing prior to their modern Lockean origins and accessible to Buddhism.

Buddhist Contribution to Social Welfare in Australia
Patricia Sherwood
Edith Cowan University
This article outlines the contribution of Buddhist organizations in Australia to education and social welfare. It is argued that from the viewpoint of Buddhist organizations in Australia, they have always been concerned with social welfare and education issues, and this is not a new phenomenon. This is illustrated through examining services delivered by Buddhist organizations in Australia in nine areas: education of adults; education of children; working with the sick and dying in the community; working in hospitals and hospices; working in drug rehabilitation; working with the poor; working in prisons; speaking up for the oppressed; and working for non-human sentient beings. The worldviews of these Buddhist organizations that state social engagement has always been integral to their tradition will be articulated.

Volume 9 (2002)

The Value of Human Differences: South Asian Buddhist Contributions Toward an Embodied Virtue Theory

Mrozik, Susanne

What are virtues? Are these best described as cognitive and affective aspects of a person's psyche, or can virtues also be described as features, postures, and movements of a person's body? This article explores the relationship between virtues and bodies in South Asian Buddhist traditions. The article illumines several different ways in which Buddhist ethical discourse construes the nature of this relationship: (1) Bodies are the material effects of practicing virtues; (2) bodies are the material conditions for practicing virtues; (3) certain kinds of bodies can influence others to practice virtues; and (4) certain features, postures, and movements of bodies constitute in and of themselves virtues. The article foregrounds the corporeal specificity of ethical agents in order to consider how South Asian Buddhist ethical discourse can contribute to the development of an embodied virtue theory.

Did Śāntideva Destroy the Bodhisattva Path?

Wetlesen, Jon

The question in the title has recently been answered in the affirmative by Paul Williams in his book on *Altruism and Reality: Studies in the Philosophy of the* Bodhicaryāvatāra. Williams assumes that Śāntideva attempted to justify the bodhisattva's universal altruism on the basis of a reductive conception of a person, and that this entails a number of absurd consequences that are destructive of the bodhisattva path. Williams concedes that Śāntideva might have avoided these consequences if he had adopted a non-reductive conception of the person as a conventional truth, but Williams seems to assume that this would have to be an individualistic conception, and in that case it would have prevented Śāntideva from reaching his desired conclusion. I argue that there may be a way out of this dilemma if we interpret Śāntideva's conception of the person in the direction of an interpersonal holism. In this view, others are perceived not only as more or less similar to oneself, but as parts of oneself. The bodhisattva path is understood as a transformation from the small to the big self within the framework of conventional truth, and eventually to non-self within the highest truth. I believe that this approach takes better care of those few verses in chapter eight of Śāntideva's book, on which Williams has based his interpretation, and that it is supported by a number of other verses in this context, to which Williams has not paid much attention.

-

The Killing Test: The Kinship of Living Beings and the Buddha-legend's First Journey to the West

MacQueen, Graeme

As it has traveled, the Buddha-legend has carried complex messages and sets of ideas, among which is the kinship of living beings. When the story made its way to Europe in the medieval period in the form of Barlām and Josaphat, however, many of its messages were removed, and the kinship of living beings was one of the casualties. Concentrating on a particular episode in Barlām and Josaphat, I show how the kinship of living beings was progressively deleted. I then suggest that this removal was based, in part, on a historical practice used for the detection and repression of Manichaeism: the killing test. With the help of this mechanism of

inquisition and persecution, the Buddha-legend was prevented, until the nineteenth century, from transmitting one of its key messages to the West.

Volume 10 (2003)

Foundations of Ethics and Practice in Chinese Pure Land Buddhism
Jones, Charles B.
The primary goal of this project was to find a Chinese text that took on the relationship between human religious activity and the saving power of Amitābha in a systematic way. Alas, such a text has so far eluded me. However, by looking at several texts, I have been able to find hints and indications here and there which, added together, constitute a fairly complete and consistent soteriological scheme that relates self-power to other-power. Fully aware of the hermeneutical dangers one faces in collating proof-texts from works spanning greatly-separated times and places around the Chinese empire, I will venture to lay it out as best I can with some confidence that it indeed represents a characteristically Chinese way of approaching the relationship of self-power and other-power, human striving and the Buddha's original vow-power. I will do this by focusing on a particular arena of human religious activity: ethics and precepts, "ethics" indicating general norms of human behavior, and "precepts" meaning specific vows taken in ritual contexts.

From Vulnerability to Virtuosity: Buddhist Reflections on Responding to Terrorism and Tragedy
Hershock, Peter D.
Here, I want to reflect on how we—both privately and publicly—have been responding to the horrific events of September 11. The declared war on terrorism—a central part of our public response—has not ended, but has instead spread and intensified. Along with this, our "enemies" have multiplied. Parents, sons, and daughters continue to be killed, sacrificed singly or in small groups, by the dozens, or—as in Bali on October 12, 2002—by the hundreds. My intention is not to analyze the complex geopolitics of the "war on terror." Neither is it to critically assess either specific policy decisions or their effects on the quality of daily life and civil liberties. Instead, I want to offer some general observations about terrorism and tragedy and then, from a Buddhist perspective, to begin reflecting on our broad strategies for responding to them and to the realization of our individual and collective vulnerability.

Luminary Buddhist Nuns in Contemporary Taiwan: A Quiet Feminist Movement
Wei- Cheng, i
Luminary order is a well-respected Buddhist nuns'
order in Taiwan. In this essay, I will examine the phenomenon of Luminary nuns from three aspects: symbol, structure, and education. Through the examination of the three aspects, I will show why the phenomenon of Luminary nuns might be seen as a feminist movement. Although an active agent in many aspects, I will also show that the success of Luminary nuns has its roots in the social, historical, and economic conditions in Taiwan.

Volume 11 (2004)

Santi Asoke Buddhist Reform Movement: Building Individuals, Community, and (Thai) Society
Essen, Juliana M.
The late 1990s economic crisis in Southeast Asia marked a critical moment in Thailand's history. Now, many Thais pause to reevaluate their nation's development path and to consider alternatives for a primarily Buddhist, agrarian society. The Santi Asoke Buddhist Reform Movement in Thailand offers one such alternative. The Asoke group's aim is not a Western ideal—to accumulate high levels of material comfort, but a Buddhist ideal—to release attachment to the material world and attain spiritual freedom. Like other Buddhist approaches to development, Asoke-style development begins with personal spiritual advancement; yet it emphasizes worldly engagement in order to address contemporary social, economic, and environmental dilemmas. This article draws from ethnographic research at one Asoke community to illustrate how Asoke Buddhist beliefs and practices contribute to development on three levels: individual, community, and society.

Cultivation of Moral Concern in Theravāda Buddhism: Toward a Theory of the Relation Between Tranquility and Insight
Mills, Ethan
There are two groups of scholars writing on the two main types of Buddhist meditation: one group that considers insight (*vipassanā*) to be essential and tranquility (*samatha*) to be inessential in the pursuit of nirvana, and a second group that views both *samatha* and *vipassanā* to be essential. I approach an answer to the question of which group is correct in two steps: (1) an outline of the disagreement between Paul Griffiths (of the first group) and Damien Keown (of the second group); and (2), an augmentation of Keown's assertion that *samatha* can cultivate moral concern. I am not definitively solving the problem of the relationship between *samatha* and *vipassanā*, but rather I show that by making Keown's theory of the cultivation of moral concern more plausible we have more reasons to accept his larger theory of the importance of both *samatha* and *vipassanā*.

Reflection on Martha Nussbaum's Work on Compassion from a Buddhist Perspective
Eynde, Maria Vanden
The current philosophical debate between care and justice reflects the debate between an image of self that is either autonomous and invested with rights or a self that is contingent, feeling and thinking. Our goal is to bridge the polarization between the two ethical theories of care and justice. For this, an extended self image would be introduced, carrying traits of both views. We aim to show that Nussbaum's concept of compassion can bridge the dichotomy. But, rather than merely building on Nussbaum's findings, we think it is essential to investigate what Buddhism, as a philosophy where compassion is central, can bring to this project. The topic of this article then, is to relate Nussbaum's work on compassion with Buddhist theory, at the same time opening the subject matter to the potentialities that are at hand in Buddhist philosophy.

Critical Questions Towards a Naturalized Concept of Karma in Buddhism
Wright, Dale S.
In an effort to articulate a naturalized concept of karma for the purposes of contemporary ethical reflection, this article raises four critical questions about the Buddhist doctrine of karma. The article asks (1) about the advisability of linking the concept of karma to assurance of ultimate cosmic justice through the doctrine of rebirth; (2) about the effects of this link on the quest for human justice in the social, economic, and political spheres of culture; (3) about the kinds of rewards that the doctrine of karma attaches to virtuous action, whether they tend to be necessary or contingent consequences; and (4) about the extent to which karma is best conceived individually or collectively. The article ends with suggestions for how a non-metaphysical concept of karma might function and what role it might play in contemporary ethics.

The Criteria of Goodness in the Pāli *Nikāyas* and the Nature of Buddhist Ethics
Cea, Abraham Velez de
I start by discussing Damien Keown's important contribution to the field of Buddhist ethics, and I point out some difficulties derived from his criterion of goodness based on the identification of nirvana with the good and the right. In the second part, I expand Keown's conception of virtue ethics and overcome the difficulties affecting his criterion of goodness by proposing a heuristic distinction between instrumental and teleological actions. In the third part, I explore the early Buddhist criteria of goodness and argue that they do not correspond to a form of virtue ethics as Keown defines it, but rather to a particular system of virtue ethics with features of utilitarianism and moral realism. That is, a system where the goodness of actions is determined not only by the mental states underlying actions as Keown claims, but also by the content and the consequences of actions for the happiness of oneself and others.

A Survey of the Sources of Buddhist Ethics
Coghlan, Ian J.
This article surveys two sources of ethics in Theravāda Buddhism. Firstly, it briefly surveys the texts that record the process of the proclamation of training rules. Secondly, it investigates the main events which provoked proclamation. This process of setting down an ethical standard itself emerges from both an intuitive sense of ethics held by society and the realized ethics of the Buddha. Further, though the proclamation of the 227 vows is designed to restrain physical and verbal action, the underlying purpose of the vows is to control the mind's motivating unethical action. This survey will show that of the three roots of ignorance, aversion, and attachment, the vows are primarily directed to eliminating the root of attachment.

Can Killing a Living Being Ever Be an Act of Compassion? The Analysis of the Act of Killing in the Abhidhamma and Pāli Commentaries
Gethin, Rupert
In the Theravādin exegetical tradition, the notion that intentionally killing a living being is wrong involves a claim that when certain mental states (such as compassion) are present in the mind, it is simply impossible that one could act in certain ways (such as to intentionally kill). Contrary to what Keown has claimed, the only criterion for judging whether an act is "moral" (kusala) or "immoral" (akusala) in Indian systematic Buddhist thought is the quality of the intention that motivates it. The idea that killing a living being might

be a solution to the problem of suffering runs counter to the Buddhist emphasis on dukkha as a reality that must be understood. The cultivation of friendliness in the face of suffering is seen as something that can bring beneficial effects for self and others in a situation where it might seem that compassion should lead one to kill.

Buddhism and Death: The Brain-Centered Criteria
John- Meyer, Anderson L.
This essay explores the two main definitions of human death that have gained popularity in the western medical context in recent years and attempts to determine which of these criteria—"whole-brain" or "cerebral"—is best in accord with a Buddhist understanding of death. In the end, the position is taken that there is textual and linguistic evidence in place for both the "cerebral" and "whole-brain" definitions of death. Because the textual sources underdetermine the definitive Buddhist conception of death, it is left to careful reasoning by way of logic, intuition, and inference to determine which definition of death is best representative of Buddhism.

Volume 12 (2005)

No Real Protection without Authentic Love and Compassion
Makransky, John
The focus of modern technocratic societies on material means for well being tends to ignore the significance of motivation: What sort of motive force drives the social policies and development strategies of our societies, and how does that affect the outcome of our endeavors to establish social stability and well-being? This article will draw upon teachings from the *Ornament of the Mahāyāna Scriptures* (*Mahāyāna-sūtra-alaṃkāra*, ascribed to Maitreya circa the fourth century CE), teachings that focus on the motive power of boundless love and what happens where it is lacking. I will try to apply insights from that text to contemporary problems of social fragmentation and violence.

What's Compassion Got to Do with It? Determinants of Zen Social Ethics in Japan
Ives, Christopher
Judging from pronouncements by contemporary Engaged Buddhists, one might conclude that historical expressions of Zen social ethics have rested on the foundation of compassion and the precepts. The de facto systems of social ethics in Japanese Zen, however, have been shaped largely by other epistemological, sociological, and historical factors, and compassion should best be understood as a "theological virtue" that historically has gained specificity from those other factors.

Groundwork for a Metaphysic of Buddhist Morals: A New Analysis of puñña and kusala, in Light of sukka
Adam, Martin
This article offers a new basis for assessing the nature of Buddhist moral thinking. Although consistent with Damien Keown's view that Buddhist ethics may be considered a form of virtue ethics, the account outlined

here does not aim to determine which western ethical theory Buddhism most closely matches. It suggests instead that Buddhist discourse presupposes different kinds of moral agency, distinguishable on the basis of the spiritual status of the agent. The moral language characteristically employed in different texts of the Pāli Canon differs accordingly. This accounts for some of the difficulties experienced by modern authors attempting to make comparisons with western traditions. Apparent inconsistencies among the texts can be resolved if one takes careful note of the spiritual status of the moral agents under discussion. The argument is based upon an analysis of a particular conceptual schema found in the Pāli Canon, namely, the tetrad of four logical categories of action based upon the pair of the bright and the dark (sukka and kaṇha). This schema is employed in order to clarify the relationship of two more commonly discussed terms, puñña and kusala.

Filial Piety in Early Buddhism

Xing, Guang

Buddhist scholars like Kenneth Ch'en thought that filial piety was a special feature of Chinese Buddhism. Later, John Strong employed "popular Buddhist stories" to show that filial piety was also important in Indian Buddhism, but he asserted that it was "a Buddhist compromise with the Brāhmanical ethics of filiality operating at the popular level." On the other hand, Gregory Schopen, who mainly used Indian Buddhist epigraphical material in his research, pointed out the same idea but he could not find definitive support from the early Buddhist textual sources. My investigation of the early Buddhist texts and analysis of the relevant passages clearly shows that filial piety is one of the important aspects of the early Buddhist ethical teachings. Filial piety was practiced by the early Indian Buddhists (1) as a way of requiting the debt to one's parents; (2) as a chief ethical good action; and (3) as Dharma, the social order. And on this basis it also shows that the early Indian Buddhists practiced filial piety not as a "compromise with the Brāhmanical ethics of filiality" but as an important teaching taught by the master.

The Sociological Implications for Contemporary Buddhism in the United Kingdom: Socially Engaged Buddhism, a Case Study

Henry, Phil

This article addresses Buddhist identity in contemporary settings and asks what it means to be Buddhist in the West today. This is the overarching theme of my doctoral research into socially engaged Buddhism in the United Kingdom, which addresses the question of how socially engaged Buddhism challenges the notion of what it means to be Buddhist in the twenty-first century. The scope of this article is to portray part of that work, and, in so doing, it suggests methodological approaches for students of Western Buddhism, using my research into the identity of socially engaged Buddhists in the United Kingdom as a case study.

Volume 13 (2006)

Bodhisattva Precepts in the Ming Society: Factors behind their Success and Propagation
Chu, William
The wide popularization of versions of Bodhisattva precepts that were based on apocrypha coincided with certain medieval developments in technology and social/political developments. All these changes facilitated a much more pervasive "Confucianization" of Chinese society, notably during the Song dynasty (960-1279), and were accentuated in the Ming (1368-1643). Riding on these trends, it was only natural that the apocryphal Bodhisattva precepts that were so much tailored to Confucian ethical norms found a much greater popular basis at the same time. This article also takes a cultural comparativist perspective and analyzes the propagation of the same apocryphal precepts in Japan, which could also be explained by comparable conditions in political and technological infrastructure.

Aquinas and Dōgen on Poverty and the Religious Life
Mikkelson, Douglas K.
Recent efforts to articulate Buddhist ethics have increasingly focused on "Western" ethical systems that possess a "family resemblance" sufficient to serve as a bridge. One promising avenue is the employment of Aristotelian-Thomistic thinking in seeking to understand certain manifestations of Buddhism. More specifically, we can explore how the thinking of Thomas Aquinas may serve to illuminate the moral vision of the Zen Master Dōgen on specific topics, such as that of "poverty and the religious life." Two texts seem particularly conducive as foci for this approach, namely IIaIIae 186.3 of the *Summa Theologiae* and the *Shōbōgenzō Zuimonki*. This modus operandi reveals how Dōgen's views on poverty and the religious life are significantly similar to, and yet in certain respects distinctively different from, those of Aquinas.

***Musāvāda-virati* and "Privileged Lies"**
Duncan, J., Derrett, M.
A privileged lie cannot exist where (1) lies are totally forbidden, or (2) lying is so common that no excuse for it is expected. A lie is "privileged" where it is commonly excused, granted that lying in general is reprehended. A good illustration is to tell a terminally ill patient that there exist hopes of his recovery. In a system knowing privileged lies these are usually harmless to the hearer. The answer "Not at home" is conventional, a piece of politeness. "I do not know" may well be a lie but may avoid much trouble. In Buddhism, where there are no privileged lies, one may conclude that lies are so injurious that no convenience can excuse lying.

The *Saṃyukta-āgama* Parallel to the *Sāleyyaka-sutta* and the Potential of the Ten Courses of Action
Anālayo, Ven.
The present article offers a translation of the *Saṃyukta-āgama* parallel to the *Sāleyyaka-sutta* of the *Majjhima-nikāya* on the subject of the ten courses of action, followed by an examination of the differences found between the Chinese and Pāli versions. This comparison shows the degree to which oral transmission has influenced the shape of the two versions.

Introduction to "Zen Social Ethics: Historical Constraints and Present Prospects"
Leighton, Taigen Dan
This collection of articles is from a panel organized by Chris Ives for the Ethics Section of the American Academy of Religion meeting in Philadelphia in November, 2005. As Chair of that panel I offer this brief introduction. The topic addresses a clear concern, apparent to scholars but also to many practitioners, about the problematic approach to ethics of the Zen Buddhist tradition and the place of ethics in its modern context. One major impetus for this concern is the challenge to Japanese Zen from Brian Victoria in his *Zen at War*, and the revelation of the active support by eminent Zen figures for Japanese militarism and jingoism before and during World War II. One assumption of these articles is that Zen's historical ethical failings may be symptomatic of internal problematics in the very structure of Zen philosophy and discourse, perhaps more heightened in its interface with the West and modernity.

Zen as a Social Ethics of Responsiveness
Kasulis, T. P.
One reason traditional Chan or Zen did not develop a comprehensive social ethics is that it arose in an East Asian milieu with axiologies (Confucian, Daoist, and Shintō) already firmly in place. Since these value orientations did not conflict with basic Buddhist principles, Chan/Zen used its praxes and theories of praxis to supplement and enhance, rather than criticize, those indigenous ethical orientations. When we consider the intercultural relevance of Zen ethics today, however, we must examine how its traditional ethical assumptions interface with its Western conversation partners. For example, it is critical that Chan and Zen stress an ethics of responsiveness rather than (as is generally the case of the modern West) one of responsibility. This article analyzes special philosophical problems arising when one tries to carry Zen moral values without modification into Western contexts.

Satori and the Moral Dimension of Enlightenment
Wright, Dale S.
This essay addresses the question posed by Brian Victoria's description of "moral blindness" in twentieth-century Japanese Zen masters by claiming that since Zen monastic training does not include practices of reflection that cultivate the moral dimension of life, skill in this dimension of human character was not considered a fundamental or necessary component of Zen enlightenment. The essay asks what an enlightened moral sensitivity might require, and concludes in challenging the Zen tradition to consider re-engaging the Mahāyāna Buddhist practices of reflection out of which Zen originated in order to assess the possible role of morality in its thought and practice of enlightenment.

Wisdom, Compassion, and Zen Social Ethics: the Case of Chinul, Sŏngch'ŏl, and Minjung Buddhism in Korea
Park, Jin Y.
This essay examines the possibility of Zen social ethics by contemplating the relationship between wisdom and compassion in two Korean Zen masters, Pojo Chinul and T'oe'ong Sŏngch'ŏl. Unlike the common assumption that wisdom and compassion naturally facilitate each other in Zen practice, I contend that in both Chinul and Sŏngch'ŏl, they are in a relationship of tension rather than harmony and that such a tension provides a ground for Zen social ethics. In this context the Minjung Buddhist movement in contemporary

Korea is discussed as an example of Zen social activism that makes visible the social dimension of Zen philosophy and practice.

Not Buying into Words and Letters: Zen, Ideology, and Prophetic Critique
Ives, Christopher
Judging from the active participation of Zen leaders and institutions in modern Japanese imperialism, one might conclude that by its very nature Zen succumbs easily to ideological co-optation. Several facets of Zen epistemology and institutional history support this conclusion. At the same time, a close examination of Zen theory and praxis indicates that the tradition does possess resources for resisting dominant ideologies and engaging in ideology critique.

Saving Zen From Moral Ineptitude: A Response to Zen Social Ethics: Historical Constraints and Present Prospects
Maraldo, John C.
The four articles on the historical constraints and present prospects of a Zen social ethics are ethical essays in an exemplary sense: although they reflect on what Zen social ethics actually is or has been, their primary concern is with what a Zen social ethics could be or should be. Insofar as the articles are descriptive, they describe a lack or a failure of ethics in the Zen tradition, the failure for example to avert complicity in Japanese militarism and the suffering caused from it. Even where they point to ethical resources within the Zen tradition they do so in the awareness that such resources were not explored, much less utilized, in the past.

Volume 14 (2007)

Avoiding Unintended Harm to the Environment and the Buddhist Ethic of Intention
Harvey, Peter
This article reflects on how the mainly intention-based ethics of Buddhism relates to issues of causing unintended harm across a range of issues of relevance to environmental concern, such as species protection, resource depletion and climate change. Given our present knowledge, is environmental concern to be seen as morally obligatory for a Buddhist or only a voluntary positive action? Writers sometimes simply assume that Buddhist ethics are supportive of the full range of environmental concerns, but this needs to be critically argued. The article reflects on a range of principles of traditional Buddhist ethics, both Theravāda and Mahāyāna, and concludes that, in the present world context, Buddhist considerations urge not only that we should not deliberately harm any living being, but that we should also look after the biosphere-home that we share with other beings, by using our knowledge of unintended effects of our actions to modify our behavior, and that we should act positively to benefit others beings, human and non-human, and enhance their supportive environment. The article also considers issues such as Buddhism's attitude to wild nature, industrialization and "progress."

"Freedom of the Will" in the Light of Theravāda Buddhist Teachings

Harvey, Peter

A well known issue in Western Philosophy is that of "freedom of the will": whether, how and in what sense human beings have genuine freedom of action in the context of a broad range of external and internal conditioning factors. Any system of ethics also assumes that humans have, in some sense, a freedom to choose between different courses of action. Buddhist ethics is no different in this—but how is freedom of action to be made sense of in a system that sees human beings as an interacting cluster of conditioned and conditioning processes, with no substantial I-agent either within or beyond this cluster? This article explores this issue within Theravāda Buddhism and concludes that the view of this tradition on the issue is a "compatibilist" middle way between seeing a person's actions as completely rigidly determined, and seeing them as totally and unconditionally free, with a variety of factors acting to bring, and increase, the element of freedom that humans have. In a different way, if a person is wrongly seen as an essential, permanent Self, it is an "undetermined question" as to whether "a person's acts of will are determined" or "a person's acts of will are free." If there is no essential person-entity, "it" cannot be said to be either determined or free.

Do the Compassionate Flourish? Overcoming Anguish and the Impulse towards Violence

Frakes, Chris

In this article I argue that in order for compassion to be considered a virtue, Western philosophical accounts of compassion must be supplemented by Buddhist understandings. After examining two potential problems with compassion (that it may burden the compassionate agent with anguish such that s/he cannot flourish and that feeling compassion may give rise to violence on behalf of the suffering), I consider a way out of both of these problems. My central claim is that the proper emotion which demonstrates the virtue of compassion is that of equanimity.

Shakespeare, Buddha, and King Lear

Sterne, Melvin

Given Shakespeare's status as "the secular Bible," it is surprising that his work has not been examined more closely to consider its spiritual teachings. As Buddhist studies increase in popularity in the West, more and more Buddhist scholars are being drawn to evaluate Shakespeare's work in light of Buddhist traditions. Of special interest today is the perception of Shakespeare's works as points-of-resistance to the dominant global-consumerist ideology. According to Stanley Wells, Lear's "non-naturalistic interpretation of action" lends itself to the interpretation of its "moral and philosophical concepts." This article considers the developing relationship between Shakespeare and Buddhism, and through a close read of King Lear establishes some of the methods and questions which may prove Shakespeare fertile ground for Buddhist scholars.

What the Buddha Would Not Do, According to the *Bāhitika-sutta* and its *Madhyama-āgama* Parallel

Anālayo, Ven.

The *Bāhitika*-sutta of the *Majjhima-nikāya* presents an inquiry into the ethical conduct of the Buddha. Based on a translation of the *Madhyama-āgama* parallel to the *Bāhitika-sutta*, this inquiry will be examined, taking into account differences found between the Chinese and Pāli versions.

The Ethics of Knowledge and Action in Postmodern Organizations

M.Tophoff, Michael

Good Corporate Governance was explicitly formulated in the Sarbanes-Oxley Act, which became federal law in 2002. It includes ethical guidelines to regulate employee behavior and the interrelations between organizations and their shareholders. While these guidelines are exterior to the person, this article discusses the construct of an internal beacon for right managerial action, in the Buddhist sense, as well as ways not only to access it mentally but also to extend it into the outside world. Within this perspective, it also presents the ethical teaching of the Chinese Ming philosopher Wang Yangming (1472-1529). Although Wang is considered to be a Neo-Confucian philosopher, in this article he is considered a seminal thinker within the Chan Buddhist tradition Wang's method of self-cultivation is presented to access the person's innate knowledge which in itself implies right action.

Leaf Blowers and Antibiotics: a Buddhist Stance for Science and Technology

Tuladhar-Douglas, Will

Sustainable technology, like mindfulness, requires cultivation. It is a process of constantly attending in the face of considerable distraction, a process that leads to a self-balancing wholesome state that has beneficial properties for both self and others. This brief essay begins with a consideration of science, scientism and technology. I will then use a handful of examples to consider how technologies appear to behave autonomously, often perverting the good intentions of their inventor or revealing unexpected opportunities for wholesome behavior. In many cases, it seems that apparently neutral technologies fit together with unwholesome tendencies, locking humans and machines into an accelerating and apparently unstoppable destructive dance. I will then propose a general strategy for engaging technologies which draws on traditional Buddhist practices, with two particular objectives: to gain insight into, and maintain awareness of, the actual bias of any particular technology, and to discover tactics for interrupting the destructive cycles which are the cause of the ecological crisis in our world.

Compassionate Violence? On the Ethical Implications of Tantric Buddhist Ritual

Gray, David B.

Buddhism is often presented as a non-violent religion that highlights the virtue of universal compassion. However, it does not unequivocally reject the use of violence, and leaves open the possibility that violence may be committed under special circumstances by spiritually realized beings. This article examines several apologetic defenses for the presence of violent imagery and rituals in tantric Buddhist literature. It will demonstrate that several Buddhist commentators, in advancing the notion of "compassionate violence," also advanced an ethical double standard insofar as they defended these violent actions as justifiable when performed by Buddhists, but condemned them when performed by non-Buddhists.

Volume 15 (2008)

Cooking the Buddhist Books: The Implications of the New Dating of the Buddha for the History of Early Indian Buddhism

Prebish, Charles S.

On the surface, new dating for the Buddha's death doesn't seem terribly earthshaking, either for Indian Buddhist history or for ancillary studies such as a consideration of Upāli and his lineage of *Vinayadharas*. Yet it is. If there is a new date for the Buddha's demise, virtually everything we know about the earliest Indian Buddhism, and especially its sectarian movement, is once again called into question. Dates for the first, second, and third canonical councils—once thought to be certain—must now be reexamined. Kings who presided at these events must be reconsidered. Most importantly, the role of the great Indian King Aśoka, from whose reign much of the previous dating begins, needs to be placed under the scrutiny of the historical microscope again.

Deploying the Dharma: Reflections on the Methodology of Constructive Buddhist Ethics

Ives, Christopher

Recent Buddhist ethical argumentation has been hampered by a set of methodological issues. The Buddhist soteriological scheme offers at least a partial solution to several of those issues, and more importantly, provides a framework for more rigorous and systematic formulations of Buddhist ethics.

Guiding the Blind Along the Middle Way: A Parallel Reading of Suzuki Shōsan's *Mōanjō* and The Doctrine of the Mean

Sevilla, Anton Luis C.

Japanese intellectual culture is a mélange of many schools of thought—Shinto, many forms of Buddhism, Confucianism, and so on. However, these schools of thought are distinct in approach and focus, and key ideas of one school may even be found to be in contradiction with the key ideas of other schools of thought. Many have deliberately tried, with varying degrees of success, to reconcile these schools of thought, academically, politically, and so forth. But amidst these attempts, one that stands out for its uncontrived naturalness and vitality is that of Zen Master Shōsan.

The Relocalization of Buddhism in Thailand

Parnwell, Michael, Seeger, Martin

This article probes beneath the surface of the revitalized religiosity and thriving "civic Buddhism" that is identifiable in parts of Thailand's rural periphery today as a result of grassroots processes of change. It exemplifies Phra Phaisan Visalo's assertion that Thai Buddhism is "returning to diversity" and "returning again to the hands of the people." Using in-depth case studies of three influential local monks in the northeastern province of Yasothon, it develops three cross-cutting themes that are of significance not only as evidence of a process we term "relocalization" but also as issues that lie at the heart of contemporary Thai Theravāda Buddhism. The article explores how the teachings and specific hermeneutics of influential Buddhist thinkers like Buddhadāsa Bhikkhu, Phra Payutto and Samana Phothirak have been communicated, interpreted, adjusted and implemented by local monks in order to suit specific local realities and needs.

Added to this localization of ideas is the localization of practice, wherein the three case studies reveal the quite different approaches and stances adopted by a "folk monk" (Phra Khruu Suphajarawat), a "forest monk" (Phra Mahathongsuk) and what might loosely be termed a "fundamentalist monk" (Phra Phromma Suphattho) at the interface of monastery and village, or the spiritual (supramundane) and social (mundane) worlds. This articulation of Buddhism and localism in turn feeds the debate concerning the appropriateness or otherwise of social engagement and activism in connection with a monk's individual spiritual development and the normative function of the monk in modern Thai society.

Eight Revered Conditions: Ideological Complicity, Contemporary Reflections and Practical Realities
Salgado, Nirmala S.
Scholarly debates focusing on the "Eight Revered Conditions," a list of conditions suggestive of the dependence of nuns on monks in early Buddhism, have long been the focus of scholarly debates. These debates, centering on the legitimation of a patriarchal Buddhism, have reached an impasse. Here I argue that this impasse logically flows from questionable reconstructions of the imperative and authoritative nature of these eight conditions in early Buddhism, perceived as Buddhavacana, or the word of the Buddha. In contemporary Sri Lanka, practitioners' reflections on the eight conditions suggest that they function less as imperative injunctions than as markers defining social and moral boundaries, in terms of which monastics conceptualize their world. I demonstrate that scholarly presuppositions of the hierarchical nature of the controversial conditions are contested by perspectives of current praxis, and may also possibly be questioned, at least theoretically, by the process of reconstructing earlier Buddhist realities.

Buddhism and Speciesism: on the Misapplication of Western Concepts to Buddhist Beliefs
Sciberras, Colette
In this article, I defend Buddhism from Paul Waldau's charge of speciesism. I argue that Waldau attributes to Buddhism various notions that it does not necessarily have, such as the ideas that beings are morally considerable if they possess certain traits, and that humans, as morally considerable beings, ought never to be treated as means. These ideas may not belong in Buddhism, and for Waldau's argument to work, he needs to show that they do. Moreover, a closer look at his case reveals a more significant problem for ecologically minded Buddhists—namely that the Pāli texts do not seem to attribute intrinsic value to any form of life at all, regardless of species. Thus, I conclude that rather than relying on Western concepts, it may be preferable to look for a discourse from within the tradition itself to explain why Buddhists ought to be concerned about the natural world.

The Sixfold Purity of an Arahant According to the Chabbisodhana-sutta and its Parallel
Anālayo, Ven.
In continuation of two articles published in the last two issues of the *JBE*, in which I studied aspects of early Buddhist ethics based on comparing parallel versions of a discourse preserved in Pāli and Chinese, the present article examines the treatment of the six-fold purity of an arahant in the *Chabbisodhana-sutta* of the *Majjhima-nikāya* and in its *Madhyama-āgama* parallel, based on an annotated translation of the latter.

Did King Ajātasattu Confess to the Buddha, and did the Buddha Forgive Him?
Attwood, Jayarava Michael
Is it possible to counteract the consequences of a moral transgression by publicly acknowledging it? When he reveals to the Buddha that he has killed his father, King Ajātasattu is said to "*yathādhammaṃ paṭikaroti*." This has been interpreted as "making amends," or as seeking (and receiving) "forgiveness" for his crime. Successfully translating this phrase into English requires that we reexamine etymology and dictionary definitions, question assumptions made by previous translators, and study the way that *yathādhammaṃ paṭikaroti* is used in context. We can better understand confession as a practice by locating it within the general Indian concern for ritual purity—ethicized by the Buddha—and showing that the early Buddhist doctrine of kamma allows for mitigation, though not eradication, of the consequences of actions under some circumstances.

Volume 16 (2009)

Western Self, Asian Other: Modernity, Authenticity, and Nostalgia for "Tradition" in Buddhist Studies
Quli, Natalie E.
There has been considerable rancor and finger-pointing in recent years concerning the intersection of the West and Buddhism. A new wave of research has focused on Orientalism and the ways in which Western ideas about Buddhism, and even Western criticisms of Buddhism, have been appropriated and turned on their heads to produce a variety of hybrid traditions most often called Buddhist modernism and Protestant Buddhism. Western scholars and early adopters of Buddhism, as well as contemporary Western Buddhist sympathizers and converts, are regularly labeled Orientalists; Asian Buddhists like Anagārika Dharmapāla and D. T. Suzuki are routinely dismissed for appropriating Western ideas and cloaking them with the veil of tradition, sometimes for nationalistic ends, and producing "Buddhist modernism."

Violence and (Non-)resistance: Buddhist Ahiṃsā and its Existential Aporias
Kovan, Martin
This essay considers a paradigmatic example in Buddhist ethics of the injunction (in the five precepts and five heinous crimes) against killing. It also considers Western ethical concerns in the post-phenomenological thinking of Derrida and Levinas, particularly the latter's "ethics of responsibility." It goes on to analyze in-depth an episode drawn from Alan Clements's experience in 1990 as a Buddhist non-violent, non-combatant in war-torn Burma. It explores Clements's ethical predicament as he faced an imminent need to act, perhaps even kill and thereby repudiate his Buddhist inculcation. It finds a wealth of common (yet divergent) ground in Levinasian and Mahāyāna ethics, a site pregnant for Buddhist ethical self-interrogation.

Buddhist and Tantric Perspectives on Causality and Society
Kang, Chris
This article examines the articulation of causality from Buddhist and Indian Tantric perspectives, offering a potentially fresh look at this topic using epistemologies and insights outside the dominant Western paradigm. Reclaiming non-Western voices that analyze and intuit causality rooted in multidimensional

modes of knowing reveals new possibilities about the nature of reality and enables integral transformative actions for emancipating human suffering. In particular, I examine the genealogy of early Buddhist, Buddhist Tantric, Sāṃkhya, and Hindu Tantric perspectives, with reference to relevant internal philosophical debates, to explicate alternative viewpoints on causality and their implications for society.

Buddhism, Nonviolence, and Power
King, Sallie B.
Contemporary Buddhists have in recent decades given the world outstanding examples of nonviolent activism. Although these movements have demonstrated great courage and have generated massive popular support, sadly, none of them has, as yet, prevailed. In this article I will explore how nonviolent power was exercised in these cases. I will draw upon the work of nonviolent theorist Gene Sharp to help us understand the nature and sources of nonviolent power. I will then use that material to analyze the power dynamics of the Buddhist nonviolent struggles in Vietnam during the war years, and in Burma and Tibet today. I will also reflect upon Buddhist attitudes towards the wielding of nonviolent power in conflict situations.

The *Bahudhātuka-sutta* and its Parallels On Women's Inabilities
Anālayo, Ven.
The present article offers a comparative study of the *Bahudhātuka-sutta*, based on a translation of one of its parallels found in the *Madhyama-āgama* preserved in Chinese translation. The study focuses in particular on the dictum that a woman cannot be a Buddha, which is absent from the *Madhyama-āgama* version.

Attitudes Towards Nuns: A Case Study of the *Nandakovāda* in the Light of its Parallels
Anālayo, Ven.
The present article provides an annotated translation of the *Saṃyukta-āgama* parallel to the *Nandakovāda*-sutta of the *Majjhima-nikāya*, followed by a discussion of differences between these two versions that are relevant for an assessment of the attitude towards nuns in early Buddhist discourse. An appendix to the article also provides a translation of the Tibetan parallel to the *Nandakovāda-sutta*.

Volume 17 (2010)

The *Mūlasarvāstivāda Bhikṣuṇī* Has the Horns of a Rabbit: Why the Master's Tools Will Never Reconstruct the Master's House
Trinlae, Bhikṣuṇī Lozang
At the First International Congress on the Buddhist Women's Role in the Saṅgha held at the University of Hamburg in 2007, Venerable Samdhong Rinpoche offered the pronouncement, "Our efforts toward re-establishing the *Mūlasarvāstivāda bhikṣuṇī* ordination are not driven by Western influence or feminist concerns about the equality of the sexes—this issue cannot be determined by social or political considerations. The solution must be found within the context of the *Vinaya* codes" (Mohr and Tsedroen 256). Using the perspective and comparative analysis of contemporary moral theory, I argue to the contrary that restoration of *Mūlasarvāstivāda bhikṣuṇī* communities by *Vinaya* [discipline rules] alone is most unlikely,

if not entirely impossible, without a consideration of gender equality, and, by extension, social considerations and Western influence. Thus, *Vinaya* code compliance may be seen as a necessary but insufficient condition for producing *Mūlasarvāstivāda* (*Mula*) *bhikṣuṇī* communities. Furthermore, not only the result of *bhikṣuṇī Vinaya* restoration, but also the cause of it, a desire for its existence, is also very unlikely, if not entirely impossible, in a convention-determined Vinaya framework whose stance is self-defined as being mutually exclusive with post-conventional morality. A fundamental change of attitude embracing modern perspectives of women's rights is itself necessary.

Earlier Buddhist Theories of Free Will: Compatibilism

Repetti, Riccardo

This is the first part of a three-article series that examines Buddhist accounts of free will. The present article introduces the issues and reviews earlier attempts by Frances Story, Walpola Rāhula, Luis Gómez, and David Kalupahana. These "early-period" authors advocate compatibilism between Buddhist doctrine, determinism (the doctrine of universal lawful causation), and free will. The second article reviews later attempts by Mark Siderits, Gay Watson, Joseph Goldstein, and Charles Goodman. These "middle-period" authors embrace either partial or full incompatibilism. The third article reviews recent attempts by Nicholas F. Gier and Paul Kjellberg, Asaf Federman, Peter Harvey, and B. Alan Wallace. These "recent-period" authors divide along compatibilist and incompatibilist lines. Most of the scholarly Buddhist works that examine free will in any depth are reviewed in this series. Prior to the above-mentioned early-period scholarship, scholars of Buddhism were relatively silent on free will. The Buddha's teachings implicitly endorse a certain type of free will and explicitly endorse something very close to determinism but attempts to articulate the implicit theory bear significant interpretive risks. The purpose of this three-article series is to review such attempts in order to facilitate a comprehensive view of the present state of the discussion and its history.

Moving Forward by Agreeing to Disagree: A Response to "Healing Ecology"

Kao, Grace Y.

This article was the subject of discussion at the American Academy of Religion national meeting in Atlanta, October 31, 2010 on "Nondualist Ecology: Perspectives on the Buddhist Environmentalism of David Loy." Co-hosting were the Buddhist Critical-Constructive Reflection Group and the Comparative Religious Ethics Group.

Healing Ecology

Loy, David R.

This article was the subject of discussion at the American Academy of Religion national meeting in Atlanta, October 31, 2010 on "Nondualist Ecology: Perspectives on the Buddhist Environmentalism of David Loy." Co-hosting were the Buddhist Critical-Constructive Reflection Group and the Comparative Religious Ethics Group.

Founding Human Rights within Buddhism: Exploring Buddha-Nature as an Ethical Foundation

Sevilla, Anton Luis

In this article, I hope to suggest (1) a fertile ground for human rights and social ethics within Japanese intellectual history and (2) a possible angle for connecting Dōgen's ethical views with his views on private

religious practice. I begin with a review of the attempts to found the notion of rights within Buddhism. I focus on two well-argued attempts: Damien Keown's foundation of rights on the Four Noble Truths and individual soteriology and Jay Garfield's foundation of rights on the compassionate drive to liberate others. I then fuse these two approaches in a single concept: Buddha-nature. I analyze Dōgen's own view on the practice-realization of Buddha-nature, and the equation of Buddha-nature with being, time, emptiness, and impermanence. I end with tentative suggestions concerning how Dōgen's particular view on Buddha-nature might affect any social ethics or view of rights that is founded on it.

Meditation and Mental Freedom: A Buddhist Theory of Free Will

Repetti, Riccardo

I argue that central Buddhist tenets and meditation methodology support a view of free will similar to Harry Frankfurt's optimistic view and contrary to Galen Strawson's pessimistic view. For Frankfurt, free will involves a relationship between actions, volitions, and "metavolitions" (volitions about volitions): simplifying greatly, volitional actions are free if the agent approves of them. For Buddhists, mental freedom involves a relationship between mental states and "metamental" states (mental attitudes toward mental states): simplifying greatly, one has mental freedom if one is able to control one's mental states, and to the extent one has mental freedom when choosing, one has free will. Philosophical challenges to free will typically question whether it is compatible with "determinism," the thesis of lawful universal causation. Both Frankfurt's metavolitional approval and the Buddhist's metamental control are consistent with determinism. Strawson has argued, however, that free will is impossible, determinism notwithstanding, because one's choice is always influenced by one's mental state. I argue, however, that Buddhist meditation cultivates control over mental states that undermine freedom, whether they are deterministic or not, making both mental freedom and free will possible. The model I develop is only a sketch of a minimally risky theory of free will, but one that highlights the similarities and differences between Buddhist thought on this subject and relevantly-related Western thought and has explanatory promise.

Theravāda Buddhism and John Dewey's Metaethics

Neeman, Or

In this article I carry out a comparison between the metaethical views of John Dewey in "Theory of Valuation" and the ethical methodology of Theravāda Buddhism. I argue that the latter illustrates how Dewey's view of ethics may be applied. Specifically, his view is that ethics can be and ought to be a science, and that ethical knowledge, like all scientific knowledge, is causal. Thus, the focus of ethics is on the causes and effects of our actions. This includes a concrete analysis of desire and the context in which it arises. I further argue that the comparison with Dewey helps to transcend the debate over whether Buddhist ethics more closely resemble utilitarianism or Aristotelian ethics.

Volume 18 (2011)

The Question of Vegetarianism and Diet in Pāli Buddhism

Stewart, James J.

This article is concerned with the question of whether Pāli Buddhism endorses vegetarianism and therefore whether a good Buddhist ought to abstain from eating meat. A prima facie case for vegetarianism will be presented that relies upon textual citation in which the Buddha stipulates that a good Buddhist must encourage others not to kill. The claim that the Buddha endorses vegetarianism, however, is challenged both by the fact that meat-eating is permissible in the *Vinaya* and that the Buddha himself seems to have eaten meat. The article will suggest that this conflict emerges as a distinct ethical and legal tension in the canonical texts but that the tension may have arisen as a consequence of difficult prudential decisions the Buddha may have had to make during his ministry.

Bile & Bodhisattvas: Śāntideva on Justified Anger

Bommarito, Nicolas

In his famous text the Bodhicaryāvatāra, the 8th century Buddhist philosopher Śāntideva argues that anger towards people who harm us is never justified. The usual reading of this argument rests on drawing similarities between harms caused by persons and those caused by non-persons. After laying out my own interpretation of Śāntideva's reasoning, I offer some objections to Śāntideva's claim about the similarity between animate and inanimate causes of harm inspired by contemporary philosophical literature in the West. Following this, I argue that by reading Śāntideva's argument as practical advice rather than as a philosophical claim about rational coherence, his argument can still have important insights even for those who reject his philosophical reasoning.

Can Buddhism Inform the Contemporary Western Liberal Debate on the Distribution of Wealth?

Mosler, Caroline

The contemporary Western liberal debate on the distribution of wealth revolves around whether the right to property may be subordinated to the good of society. Both Liberal Egalitarians and Libertarians make various negative assumptions concerning individuals, rights and duties. Buddhism, on the other hand, can offer the debate, and thereby the topic of human rights, a different perspective on the role of rights and duties and can introduce to the debate the issue of social, economic and cultural rights ("socio-economic rights"), as laid out in the Universal Declaration of Human Rights (UDHR) or the International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights (ICESCR).

Mahāpajāpatī's Going Forth in the *Madhyama-āgama*

Anālayo, Ven.

The present article provides an annotated translation of the *Madhyama-āgama* account of the founding of the Buddhist order of nuns, followed by a discussion of some of its significant aspects, which open new perspectives on the way this event is presented in the canonical scriptures.

A Cross-Tradition Exchange Between Taiwan and Sri Lanka
Wei- Cheng, i
This article uses as an example an alms-offering ceremony that took place on October 5, 2010 to illustrate cross-tradition exchanges between Asian Buddhists of different geographic locations. This ceremony had been intended to give alms to all of the bhikkhunīs in Sri Lanka and was thus itself noteworthy. However, the attention of this article is on the two main players behind this ceremony. One is a Sri Lankan monk who has been a long term Theravāda missionary in Mahāyāna Taiwan, and the other is a Taiwanese nunnery which has not limited its works to Taiwan. This article wishes to shed light on cross-tradition exchanges among Asian Buddhists.

The Lorax Wears Saffron: Toward a Buddhist Environmentalism
Clippard, Seth Devere
This article argues for the reorientation of eco-Buddhist discourse from a focus on establishing textual justifications of what Buddhist environmental ethics says towards a discourse in which Buddhist rhetoric and environmental practice are intimately linked through specific communal encounters. The article first identifies and assesses two different strategies used by advocates of Buddhist environmentalism in Thailand, one being textual and the other practical. Then, after laying out the deficiencies of the textual strategy, the article argues that the practical strategy offers a more meaningful basis for a discourse of Buddhist environmental concern—one that accounts for the differences in Buddhist communities but does not discount the importance of key Buddhist concepts. This article will suggest that a rhetorical interpretation of environmental practices offers the most effective means of articulating the ethical foundations of religious environmentalism.

Volume 19 (2012)

Intellectual Property in Early Buddhism: A Legal and Cultural Perspective
Ven. Pandita (Burma)
University of Kelaniya
In this article, I examine the modern concepts of intellectual property and account for their significance in monastic law and culture of early Buddhism. As a result, I have come to the following conclusions: (1) the infringement of copyrights, patents, and trademarks does not amount to theft as far as Theravādin Vinaya is concerned; (2) because a trademark infringement involves telling a deliberate lie, it entails an offense of expiation (pācittiya), but I cannot find any Vinaya rule which is transgressed by copyright and patent infringements; and (3) although the Buddha recognized the right to intellectual credit, commentarial interpretations have led some traditional circles to maintain that intellectual credit can be transferred to someone else.

The Five *Niyāmas* as Laws of Nature: an Assessment of Modern Western Interpretations of Theravāda Buddhist Doctrine

Dhivan Thomas Jones
The Open University, UK

The doctrine of five *niyāmas*, or "orders of nature," was introduced to Westerners by Mrs. Rhys Davids in her Buddhism of 1912. She writes that the list derives from Buddhaghosa's commentaries, and that it synthesizes information from the piṭakas regarding cosmic order. Several Buddhist writers have taken up her exposition to present the Buddha's teaching, including that of karma, as compatible with modern science. However, a close reading of the sources for the five *niyāmas* shows that they do not mean what Mrs. Rhys Davids says they mean. In their historical context they merely constitute a list of five ways in which things necessarily happen. Nevertheless, the value of her work is that she succeeded in presenting the Buddhist doctrine of dependent arising (paṭicca-samuppāda) as equivalent to Western scientific explanations of events. In conclusion, Western Buddhism, in need of a worked-out presentation of paṭicca-samuppāda, embraced her interpretation of the five *niyāmas* despite its inaccuracies.

Ethical Confusion: Possible Misunderstandings in Buddhist Ethics

Stephen A. Evans

The running debate whether or not *puñña* and *kusala* refer to the same class of actions evinces a lack of clarity over the meaning of *puñña*, accompanied by unwarranted assumptions about motivation and by a tendency to conflate "karmic" results with what we would today consider ordinary consequences, that is, roughly, those accruing through material, social or psychological processes. The present article reviews the contributions of Keown, Velez de Cea, and Adam to the discussion, then argues that in the *Nikāyas* "*puñña*" almost always refers to the force of goodness generated by certain actions and issuing in pleasant karmic results, rather than to a class of actions; that in spite of the Buddhist belief that *puñña* is gained, such actions are not typically motivated by craving; and that conflating karmic results with ordinary consequences hampers our ability to understand Buddhist ethics. It is suggested that questions about the relations among the cluster of concepts that make up the mythology of kamma and *vipāka*, and their relationship to what we call morality or ethics, be asked anew.

Esoteric Teaching of Wat Phra Dhammakāya

Mano Mettanando Laohavanich
Pridi Banomyong International College,
Thammasat University

Thailand's controversial Wat Phra Dhammakāya has grown exponentially. In just three decades, it has come to have millions of followers in and outside of Thailand and over forty branches overseas. The esoteric teaching of meditation taught by the leaders of the community has inspired thousands of young men and women from various universities to sacrifice their lives to serve their Master, something that has never been seen before in Thailand or elsewhere in the Theravāda world. What is the nature of this esoteric teaching? Why is it so appealing to these young minds? These questions are discussed and analyzed by the author, who was one of Wat Phra Dhammakāya's founding members.

Did the Buddha Correct Himself?
Ven. Pandita (Burma)
University of Kelaniya, Sri Lanka
In this article, I look at two related issues in *Vinaya*, (1) the requirement of parental consent for all candidates wishing to join the Order and (2) the additional requirement of spousal consent for female candidates but no such requirement for male candidates, and I try to prove that both these regulations stemmed from the same principle.

The Story of Sudinna in the Tibetan Translation of the *Mūlasarvāstivāda Vinaya*
Giuliana Martini
Dharma Drum Buddhist College, Taiwan
This article, a companion to the study of the narrative that according to the canonical Vinaya accounts led to the promulgation of the rule on celibacy for Buddhist monks (first *pārājika*) published by Bhikkhu Anālayo in the same issue of the *Journal of Buddhist Ethics,* offers an annotated translation of the narrative as preserved in the Tibetan translation of the *Mūlasarvāstivāda Vinaya* (*'Dul ba),* in comparison with its Chinese parallel.

The Case of Sudinna: On the Function of *Vinaya* Narrative, Based on a Comparative Study of the Background Narration to the First *Pārājika* Rule
Ven. Anālayo
Center for Buddhist Studies, University of Hamburg
Dharma Drum Buddhist College, Taiwan
In this article I study the tale that according to the canonical *Vinaya* accounts led to the promulgation of the rule on celibacy for Buddhist monks, using this as an example to understand the function of Vinaya narrative.

Buddhism, Punishment, and Reconciliation
Charles K. Fink
Miami Dade College, Kendall Campus
One important foundation of Buddhist ethics is a commitment to nonviolence. My aim in this article is to work out the implications of this commitment with regard to the treatment of offenders. Given that punishment involves the intentional infliction of harm, I argue that the practice of punishment is incompatible with the principle of nonviolence. The core moral teaching of the Buddha is to conquer evil with goodness, and it is reconciliation, rather than punishment, that conforms to this teaching. I argue that a commitment to nonviolence requires not only that we refrain from inflicting intentional harm, but that we refrain from inflicting unnecessary harm, and that this has important implications concerning the practice of incapacitation. I analyze the concept of harm and argue that the Buddhist understanding of this notion leads to the conclusion that none of the standard justifications for punishment are compatible with the principle of nonviolence, properly understood.

Emotions, Ethics, and Choice: Lessons from Tsongkhapa

Emily McRae
University of Oklahoma

This article explores the degree to which we can exercise choice over our emotional experiences and emotional dispositions. I argue that we can choose our emotions in the sense that we can intentionally intervene in them. To show this, I draw on the mind training practices advocated by the 14th century Tibetan Buddhist yogin and philosopher Tsongkhapa (tsong kha pa blo bzang grags pa). I argue that his analysis shows that successful intervention in a negative emotional experience depends on at least four factors: the intensity of the emotional experience, one's ability to pay attention to the workings of one's mind and body, knowledge of intervention practices, and insight into the nature of emotions. I argue that this makes sense of Tsongkhapa's seemingly contradictory claims that the meditator can and should control (and eventually abandon) her anger and desire to harm others and that harmdoers are "servants to their afflictions."

Right View, Red Rust, and White Bones: A Reexamination of Buddhist Teachings on Female Inferiority

Allison A. Goodwin
College of Liberal Arts
National Taiwan University

Hundreds of psychological and social studies show that negative expectations and concepts of self and others, and discrimination based on the idea that a particular group is inferior to another, adversely affect those who discriminate as well as those who are subject to discrimination. This article argues that both genders are harmed by negative Buddhist teachings about women and by discriminatory rules that limit their authority, rights, activities, and status within Buddhist institutions. Śākyamuni Buddha's instructions in the *Tripiṭaka* for evaluating spiritual teachings indicate that because such views and practices have been proven to lead to harm, Buddhists should conclude that they are not the True Dharma and should abandon them.

Buddhist Hard Determinism: No Self, No Free Will, No Responsibility

Repetti, Riccardo

This is the third article in a four-article series that examines Buddhist responses to the Western philosophical problem of whether free will is compatible with "determinism," the doctrine of universal causation. The first article ("Earlier") focused on the first publications on this issue in the 1970s, the "early period." The second ("Paleo-compatibilism") and the present articles examine key responses published in the last part of the Twentieth and the first part of the Twenty-first centuries, the "middle period." The fourth article ("Recent") examines responses published in the last few years, the "recent period." Whereas early-period scholars endorsed a compatibilism between free will and determinism, in the middle period the pendulum moved the other way: Mark Siderits argued for a two tiered compatibilism/incompatibilism (or semi-compatibilism) that he dubs "paleo-compatibilism," grounded in the early Buddhist reductionist notion of "two truths" (conventional truth and ultimate truth); and Charles Goodman argued that Buddhists accept hard determinism—the view that because determinism is true, there can be no free will—because in the absence of a real self determinism leaves no room for morally responsible agency. In "Paleo-compatibilism," I focused on Siderits's reductionist account. The present article focuses on Goodman's hard determinism, and the fourth article will examine the most recent publications expressing Buddhist views of

free will. Together with my own meditation-based Buddhist account of free will ("Meditation"), this series of articles provides a comprehensive review of the leading extant writings on this subject.

The Burmese Alms-Boycott: Theory and Practice of the Pattanikujjana in Buddhist Non-Violent Resistance

Kovan, Martin

This essay presents a general and critical historical survey of the Burmese Buddhist alms-boycott (*pattanikujjana*) between 1990 and 2007. It details the Pāli textual and ethical constitution of the boycott and its instantiation in modern Burmese history, particularly the Saffron Revolution of 2007. It also suggests a metaethical reading that considers Buddhist metaphysics as constitutive of that conflict. Non-violent resistance is contextualized as a soteriologically transcendent ("nibbanic") project in the common life of believing Buddhists—even those who, military regime and martyred monastics alike, defend a fidelity to Theravāda Buddhism from dual divides of a political and humanistic fence.

Buddhist Reductionism and Free Will: Paleo-compatibilism

Repetti, Riccardo

This is the second article in a four-article series that examines Buddhist responses to the Western philosophical problem of whether free will is compatible with "determinism," the doctrine of universal causation. The first article focused on the first publications on this issue in the 1970s, the "early period"; the present article and the next examine key responses published in the last part of the Twentieth century and first part of the Twenty-first, the "middle period"; and the fourth article will examine responses published in the last few years. Whereas early-period scholars endorsed compatibilism, in the middle period the pendulum moved the other way: Mark Siderits argued for a Buddhist version of partial incompatibilism, semi-compatibilism, or "paleo-compatibilism," and Charles Goodman argued for a straightforward Buddhist hard determinism. The present article focuses on Siderits's paleo-compatibilism; the subsequent article focuses on Goodman's hard determinism.

If Intention Is Karma: A New Approach to the Buddha's Socio-Political Teachings

Pandita, Ven.

I argue in this article that early Buddhist ethics is one of absolute values and that we can consistently use those absolute values to interpret some early teachings that seemingly show an ethic of context-dependent and negotiable values. My argument is based on the concept of intention as karma, the implications and problems of which I have also discussed.

Thresholds of Transcendence: Buddhist Self-immolation and Mahāyānist Absolute Altruism, Part One

Martin Kovan

University of Melbourne

In China and Tibet, and under the gaze of the global media, the four-year period from February 2009 to February 2013 saw the self-immolations of at least 110 Tibetan Buddhist monks, nuns and lay-people. Underlying the phenomenon of Buddhist self-immolation is a real and interpretive ambiguity between personal, religious, altruistic and political suicide, and political suicide within the Buddhist saṅgha

specifically, itself reflected in the varying historical assessments of the practice and currently given by global Buddhist leaders such as His Holiness the 14th Dalai Lama and the Vietnamese monk and activist Thích Nhất Hạnh. Part One of this essay surveys the textual and theoretical background to the canonical record and commentarial reception of suicide in Pāli Buddhist texts, and the background to self-immolation in the Mahāyāna, and considers how the current Tibetan Buddhist self-immolations relate ethically to that textual tradition. This forms the basis for, in Part Two, understanding them as altruistic-political acts in the global repertoire of contention.

Volume 20 (2013)

The *Gurudharma* on *Bhikṣuṇī* Ordination in the *Mūlasarvāstivāda* Tradition
Bhikṣuṇī Jampa Tsedroen and Bhikkhu Anālayo
Academy of World Religions & Center for Buddhist Studies,
University of Hamburg
This article surveys the stipulation on *bhikṣuṇī* ordination made in the different *Vinayas* as part of a set of eight principles to be respected (*gurudharma*), and explores the possibility, indicated by the formulation of the relevant gurudharma, that a legally valid *Mūlasarvāstivāda bhikṣuṇī* ordination could be conducted by *bhikṣus* only.

The Compassionate Gift of Vice: Śāntideva on Gifts, Altruism, and Poverty
Amod Lele
Boston University
The Mahāyāna Buddhist thinker Śāntideva tells his audience to give out alcohol, weapons and sex for reasons of Buddhist compassion, though he repeatedly warns of the dangers of all these three. The article shows how Śāntideva resolves this issue: these gifts, and gifts in general, attract their recipients to the virtuous giver, in a way that helps the recipients to become more virtuous in the long run. As a consequence, Śāntideva does recommend the alleviation of poverty, but assigns it a much smaller significance than is usually supposed. His views run counter to many engaged Buddhist discussions of political action and lend support to the "modernist" interpretation of engaged Buddhist practice.

The Cultivation of Virtue in Buddhist Ethics
Charles K. Fink
Miami Dade College, Kendall Campus
One question pursued in Buddhist studies concerns the classification of Buddhist ethics. Damien Keown has argued that Aristotelian virtue ethics provides a useful framework for understanding Buddhist ethics, but recently other scholars have argued that character consequentialism is more suitable for this task. Although there are similarities between the two accounts, there are also important differences. In this article, I follow Keown in defending the aretaic interpretative model, although I do not press the analogy with Aristotelian ethics. Rather, I argue that Buddhist ethics corresponds to a more generic, act-centered virtue ethics. Buddhist moral reasoning is often strikingly consequentialist, but I argue that this does not support the

consequentialist interpretation. Analyzing the concept of right action must be distinguished from providing a justification for living a moral life and from formulating a procedure for making moral decisions.

Buddhism, Equality, Rights

Martin T. Adam
University of Victoria

How might rights be grounded in Buddhist doctrine? This article begins by attempting to demonstrate the conceptual link between the idea of equality and the ascription of rights in Western philosophic thought. The ideas of Thomas Hobbes are taken as an example. The article then proceeds to examine the possibility that Buddhist ideas of equality could serve as grounds for the attribution of rights in a similar manner. A number of senses of equality in Buddhism are identified. I argue that while these ideas of basic equality clearly underlie Buddhist morality, any attempt to found rights on such grounds should lead to a conception of rights that is truly universal in scope, notably including the animals. For a Buddhist believer in rights, rights-possession cannot be limited to human beings.

Consequentialism, Agent-Neutrality, and Mahāyāna Ethics

Charles Goodman
Binghamton University

Several Indian Mahāyāna texts express an ethical perspective that has many features in common with Western forms of universalist consequentialism. Śāntideva, in particular, endorses a strong version of agent-neutrality, claims that compassionate agents should violate Buddhist moral commitments when doing so would produce good results, praises radical altruism, uses a critique of the self to support his ethical views, and even offers a reasonably clear general formulation of what we call act-consequentialism. Meanwhile, Asaṅga's discussions of the motivation behind rules of moral discipline and the permissible reasons for breaking those rules suggests an interesting and complex version of rule-consequentialism. Evidence for features of consequentialism can be found in several Mahāyāna sūtras as well. In reading these sources, interpretations that draw on virtue ethics may not be as helpful as those that understand the texts as committed to various versions of consequentialism.

Impermanence, Anattā, and the Stability of Egocentrism; or, How Ethically Unstable Is Egocentrism?

Michael G. Barnhart
Kingsborough Community College/CUNY

Egocentrism has always been viewed as profoundly unethical, and thus a reason against ethical egoism. This article examines the arguments for such claims and finds them somewhat wanting. It then considers the positions that egocentrism is psychologically untenable and that it is philosophically unstable. Though it appears true that egocentrism is a psychologically unappealing position for many, it isn't universally so and may be adaptable to some dystopian situations. However, the claim that it is philosophically unstable may be more promising, and the article turns to Owen Flanagan's Buddhist-inspired discussion of the issue in his book The Bodhisattva's Brain. Flanagan argues that the notion of anattā offers an important reason for not taking oneself seriously and thus fatally undermines the meaningfulness of privileging one's own interests or concerns over others. The article examines this reasoning but concludes that Flanagan's interpretation of anattā may be too weak to support his refutation of egocentrism. The article concludes by suggesting a more extreme interpretation of anattā that Flanagan rejects and argues that it might both do the job and better resist philosophical criticism than its weaker cousin.

Buddha's Maritime Nature: A Case Study in Shambhala Buddhist Environmentalism

Barbra Clayton
Mount Allison University

This article describes the Buddhist environmental ethic of Windhorse Farm, a Shambhala Buddhist community in Atlantic Canada supported by ecosystem-based sustainable forestry and organic farming. The values, beliefs and motives for this project are described and contextualized within the Shambhala Buddhist tradition, and these results are discussed within the context of the debate in scholarly discussions of environmental Buddhism over whether interdependence or virtues such as compassion and mindfulness are more significant for a Buddhist environmental ethic. The results of this study suggest that both areteic features and the metaphysical position of interdependence play key roles in the Shambhala approach to environmentalism. Results also suggest that the Shambhala environmental ethic defies the theoretical demand for a fact/value distinction, and that this case study may indicate why Buddhist traditions tend to lack systematic treatments of ethics.

Resources for Buddhist Environmental Ethics

Christopher Ives
Stonehill College

In recent decades Buddhists have been turning their attention to environmental problems. To date, however, no one has formulated a systematic Buddhist environmental ethic, and critics have highlighted a number of weak points in Buddhist arguments thus far about environmental issues. Nevertheless, Buddhism does provide resources for constructing an environmental ethic. This essay takes stock of what appear to be the most significant of those resources, including the Buddhist anthropology, the tradition's virtue ethic, elements in Buddhist epistemologies, doctrines that make it possible to determine the relative value of things, the Four Noble Truths as an analytical framework, and bases for action if not activism.

The Dalai Lama and the Nature of Buddhist Ethics

Abraham Vélez de Cea
Eastern Kentucky University

This article clarifies the nature of Buddhist ethics from a comparative perspective. It contends that the Dalai Lama's ethics is best understood as a pluralistic approach to virtue ethics. The article has two parts. The first part challenges Charles Goodman's interpretation of Mahāyāna Buddhist ethics as an instance of consequentialism. This is done indirectly, that is, not by questioning Goodman's reading of Śāntideva and Asaṅga, but rather by applying to the Dalai Lama's ethics the same test that Goodman uses to justify his reading of Mahāyāna ethics as a whole. The second part examines the Dalai Lama's ethics in comparison to Christine Swanton, a representative of a pluralistic approach to virtue ethics in contemporary analytic philosophy. By comparing the ethics of the Dalai Lama and Swanton, the article does not wish to suggest that her pluralistic approach to virtue ethics is the closest western analogue to Buddhist virtue ethics. I use comparison, not to understand the Dalai Lama's ethical ideas from the perspective of Swanton's ethics, but rather to highlight what is unique about the Dalai Lama's approach to virtue ethics, which is pluralistic in a characteristically Buddhist way.

Liberation as Revolutionary Praxis: Rethinking Buddhist Materialism

James Mark Shields
Bucknell University

Although it is only in recent decades that scholars have begun to reconsider and problematize Buddhist conceptions of "freedom" and "agency," the thought traditions of Asian Buddhism have for many centuries struggled with questions related to the issue of "liberation"—along with its fundamental ontological, epistemological and ethical implications. With the development of Marxist thought in the mid to late nineteenth century, a new paradigm for thinking about freedom in relation to history, identity and social change found its way to Asia, and confronted traditional religious interpretations of freedom as well as competing Western ones. In the past century, several attempts have been made—in India, southeast Asia, China and Japan—to bring together Marxist and Buddhist worldviews, with only moderate success (both at the level of theory and practice). This article analyzes both the possibilities and problems of a "Buddhist materialism" constructed along Marxian lines, by focusing in particular on Buddhist and Marxist conceptions of "liberation." By utilizing the theoretical work of "radical Buddhist" Seno'o Girō, I argue that the root of the tension lies with conceptions of selfhood and agency—but that, contrary to expectations, a strong case can be made for convergence between Buddhist and Marxian perspectives on these issues, as both traditions ultimately seek a resolution of existential determination in response to alienation. Along the way, I discuss the work of Marx, Engels, Gramsci, Lukàcs, Sartre, and Richard Rorty in relation to aspects of traditional (particularly East Asian Mahāyāna) Buddhist thought.

Some Problems with Particularism

Damien Keown
Goldsmiths College, University of London

This article suggests that due to a restricted understanding of the nature and scope of ethical theory, particularism discounts prematurely the possibility of a metatheory of Buddhist ethics. The textual evidence

presented in support of particularism is reconsidered and shown to be consistent with a metatheoretical reading. It is argued that writers who have adopted a particularist approach based on W. D. Ross's "Principalism"—such as Tessa Bartholomeusz in her study of just war ideology in Sri Lanka—have failed to give a satisfactory analysis of the moral dilemmas they have identified. Although particularism rightly draws attention to stories as important sources of moral data, it fails to disprove that the diversity of such evidence can be explained by a single comprehensive theory.

Why Buddhism and the West Need Each Other: On the Interdependence of Personal and Social Transformation

David R. Loy

The highest ideal of the Western tradition has been the concern to restructure our societies so that they are more socially just. The most important goal for Buddhism is to awaken and (to use the Zen phrase) realize one's true nature, which puts an end to dukkha—especially that associated with the delusion of a separate self. Today it has become more obvious that we need both: not just because these ideals complement each other, but also because each project needs the other. The Western (now world-wide) ideal of a social transformation that institutionalizes social justice has achieved much, yet, I argue, is limited because a truly good society cannot be realized without the correlative realization that personal transformation is also necessary. On the other side, the traditional Buddhist emphasis on ending individual dukkha is insufficient in the face of what we now understand about the structural causes of dukkha. This does not mean simply adding a concern for social justice to Buddhist teachings. For example, applying a Buddhist perspective to structural dukkha implies an alternative evaluation of our economic situation. Instead of appealing for distributive justice, this approach focuses on the consequences of individual and institutionalized delusion: the dukkha of a sense of a self that feels separate from others, whose sense of lack consumerism exploits and institutionalizes into economic structures that assume a life (and motivations) of their own.

Mahāyāna Ethics and American Buddhism: Subtle Solutions or Creative Perversions?

Charles S. Prebish
Pennsylvania State University & Utah State University (Emeritus)

This article initially explores the notion of two distinctly different forms of upāya, first presented by Damien Keown in his 1992 volume The Nature of Buddhist Ethics, in which one form of skill-in-means is available only to bodhisattvas prior to stage seven of the bodhisattva's path and requires adherence to all proper ethical guidelines, while the second form of upāya is applicable to bodhisattvas at stage seven and beyond, and allows them to ignore any and all ethical guidelines in their attempts to alleviate suffering. This distinctly Mahāyāna interpretation of upāya is used to examine the presumably scandalous behavior of Chogyam Trungpa, Rinpoche and Richard Baker, Rōshi, two of the most popular and controversial figures in American Buddhism. The article concludes that we can at least infer that applied in the proper fashion, by accomplished teachers, the activities allowed by upāya do present possibly subtle explanations of seemingly inappropriate behaviors. On the other hand, if abused by less realized beings, we must recognize these acts as merely creative perversions of a noble ethical heritage.

Suffering Made Sufferable: Śāntideva, Dzongkaba, and Modern Therapeutic Approaches to Suffering's Silver Lining

Daniel Cozort
Dickinson College

Suffering's positive side has been beautifully elucidated by the eighth century Mahāyāna poet Śāntideva in his *Bodhicāryavatāra*. Dzongkaba Losang Drakpa, the founder of what came to be known as the Gelukba (*dge lugs pa*) order of Tibetan Buddhism, used Śāntideva's text as his main source in the chapter on patience in his masterwork, *Lam rim Chenmo*. In this article, I attempt to explicate Śāntideva's thought by way of the commentary of Dzongkaba. I then consider it in the context of what Ariel Glucklich has called "Sacred Pain"—the myriad ways in which religious people have found meaning in pain. I conclude with some observations about ways in which some Buddhist-inspired or -influenced therapeutic movements such as Mindfulness-Based Stress Reduction and Positive Psychology are helping contemporary people to reconcile themselves to pain or to discover that it may have positive value.

Buddhist Reflections on "Consumer" and "Consumerism"

Peter Harvey
University of Sunderland

This article starts with a characterization of "consumerism" and the idea of "the consumer." It then explores Buddhist attitudes on wealth and "Buddhist economics" before drawing on these to develop a critical assessment of consumerism as an ineffective and wasteful route to human happiness.

The Legality of *Bhikkhunī* Ordination

Bhikkhu Anālayo
Center for Buddhist Studies, University of Hamburg
Dharma Drum Buddhist College, Taiwan

This article examines the legal validity of the revival of the Theravāda *bhikkhunī* ordination that has had the 1998 Bodhgayā ordinations as its starting point.

Celebrating Twenty Years of the *Journal of Buddhist Ethics*

Damien Keown
Charles Prebish

An introduction to the special twentieth anniversary issue of the *Journal of Buddhist Ethics* by the founding co-editors.

The Metaphysics of No-Self: A Determinist Deflation of the Free Will Problem

Vishnu Sridharan

For over two millennia, the free will problem has proven intractable to philosophers, scientists, and lay people alike. However, Buddhism offers us unique insight into how, when, and why human agency matters to us. In his 2009 book, *Consequences of Compassion*, Charles Goodman argues that the ultimate nonexistence of the self supports the ultimate nonexistence of free will. Recently in this journal, Riccardo Repetti has critiqued Goodman's view and made the case that free will does, in fact, ultimately exist. This article first

illustrates how Repetti's view of the self is, actually, entirely consistent with Goodman's. It goes on to argue that Repetti misconstrues elements of hard determinism as entailing that our wills have no influence on final outcomes. Lastly, it shows how, if Goodman and Repetti are in agreement on the ultimate nonexistence of the self, as well as the causal efficacy of the will, their disagreement about the ultimate existence of free will may be inconsequential.

Reimagining Buddhist Ethics on the Tibetan Plateau

Holly Gayley
University of Colorado, Boulder

This article examines the ideological underpinnings of ethical reform currently underway in Tibetan areas of the PRC, based on a newly reconfigured set of ten Buddhist virtues and consolidated into vows taken *en masse* by the laity. I focus on texts of advice to the laity by cleric-scholars from Larung Buddhist Academy, one of the largest Buddhist institutions on the Tibetan plateau and an important source for an emergent Buddhist modernism. In analyzing texts of advice, I am interested in how leading Buddhist voices articulate a "path forward" for Tibetans as a people, calling simultaneously for ethical reform and cultural preservation. Specifically, I trace the tensions and ironies that emerge in their attempts to synthesize, on the one hand, a Buddhist emphasis on individual moral action and its soteriological ramifications and, on the other hand, a secular concern for the social welfare of the Tibetan population and the preservation of its civilizational inheritance. In doing so, I view ethical reform as part of a broader Buddhist response to China's civilizing mission vis-à-vis Tibetans and new market forces encouraged by the post-Mao state.

Irigaray's Meditations on the Duality of Sexuality in Buddhist Ethics

Sokthan Yeng
Adelphi University

I suggest that the tension surrounding Irigaray's interpretation of Tantric sexual meditation practices can be helpful for understanding how both Irigaray and Buddhist thinkers link sexuality to dualism—positively in the former and negatively in the latter. Contemporary Western debates about the merits or demerits of Irigarayan ethics can obfuscate this integral connection between sexuality and dualism. A Buddhist critique of Irigaray, however, can point to the problems within her ethics while being mindful of the relationship that she sought to establish. Likewise, Irigaray's insightful reading of Buddhism can help show why Buddhists would resist sexuality not necessarily because it is associated with sin, as it often is in the West, but because of the dualism that they think accompanies it. In other words, contrasting Irigaray's ethics of sexual difference with Buddhist ethics can provide a deeper understanding and appreciation of both.

The Revival of the *Bhikkhunī* Order and the Decline of the *Sāsana*

Bhikkhu Anālayo
Center for Buddhist Studies, University of Hamburg
Dharma Drum Buddhist College, Taiwan

In this article I study the revival of the *bhikkhunī* order in the Theravāda traditions and its supposed relation to a decline of the Buddha's dispensation.

Buddhism Between Abstinence and Indulgence: Vegetarianism in the Life and Works of Jigmé Lingpa
Geoffrey Barstow
Otterbein University
Tibetan Buddhism idealizes the practice of compassion, the drive to relieve the suffering of others, including animals. At the same time, however, meat is a standard part of the Tibetan diet, and abandoning it is widely understood to be difficult. This tension between the ethical problems of a meat based diet and the difficulty of vegetarianism has not been lost on Tibetan religious leaders, including the eighteenth century master Jigmé Lingpa. Jigmé Lingpa argues repeatedly that meat is a sinful food, incompatible with a compassionate mindset. At the same time, however, he acknowledges the difficulties of vegetarianism and refuses to mandate vegetarianism among his students. Instead, he offers a variety of practices that can ameliorate the inherent negativity of eating meat. By so doing, Jigmé Lingpa offers his students a chance to continue cultivating compassion without having to completely abandon meat.

Bad Nun: Thullanandā in Pāli Canonical and Commentarial Sources
Reiko Ohnuma
Dartmouth College
In Pāli literature, Thullanandā is well known for being a "bad nun"—a nun whose persistent bad behavior is directly responsible for the promulgation of more rules of the Bhikkhunī Pātimokkha than any other individually named nun. Yet these very same sources also describe Thullanandā in significantly more positive terms—as a highly learned nun, an excellent preacher, and one who enjoys significant support among the laity. In this article, I analyze the Pāli traditions surrounding Thullanandā. I argue that her portrayal is quite complex in nature and often extends beyond herself as an individual to suggest larger implications for the nature of monastic life and monastic discipline. In addition, once Thullanandā is labeled as a "bad nun," she becomes a useful symbolic resource for giving voice to various issues that concerned the early sangha. In both ways, Thullanandā reveals herself to be far more than just a "bad nun."

Volume 21 (2014)

Battlefield Dharma: American Buddhists in American Wars
Robert M. Bosco
Centre College
The Internet has become a space for today's American Buddhist soldiers to think through difficult ethical questions that cannot always be resolved on the battlefield. I argue that this emergent cyber-sangha of American Buddhist soldiers signifies the arrival of an important new feature on the landscape of American Buddhism. As Buddhism integrates ever more deeply into American life and collective consciousness, it forms links with American conceptions of national security, military values, and America's role on the world. When viewed in the larger social and cultural context of American Buddhism, the development of this cyber-sangha represents a new generation's answer to the predominantly anti-war Buddhism of 1960s and 1970s that continues to define Buddhism in the public imagination. We are thus beginning to perceive the faint

outlines of how American Buddhism might be changing—accommodating itself, perhaps—to a new post-9/11 nationalism.

Compassion in Schopenhauer and Śāntideva
Kenneth Hutton
University of Glasgow
Although it is well known that Schopenhauer claimed that Buddhism closely reflected his own philosophy, this claim was largely ignored until the mid-late Twentieth century. Most commentators on Schopenhauer (with some recent exceptions) since then have mentioned his Buddhist affinities but have been quite broad and general in their treatment. I feel that any general comparison of Schopenhauer's philosophy with "general" Buddhism would most likely lead to general conclusions. In this article I have attempted to offer a more specific comparison of what is central to Schopenhauer's philosophy with what is central to Mahāyāna Buddhism, and that is the concept of compassion.

Bhikkhave and Bhikkhu as Gender-inclusive Terminology in Early Buddhist Texts
Alice Collett
York St John University
Bhikkhu Anālayo
University of Hamburg
In what follows we examine whether the use of the vocative *bhikkhave* or the nominative *bhikkhu* in Buddhist canonical texts imply that female monastics are being excluded from the audience. In the course of exploring this basic point, we also take up the vocative of proper names and the absence of the term *arahantī* in Pāli discourse literature.

Attitudes Arising from Buddhist Nurture in Britain
Phra Nicholas Thanissaro
University of Warwick
Focus groups comprised of seventy-five self-identifying Buddhist teenagers in Britain were asked to discuss value domains that previous research has identified to be of special interest to Buddhists. These included personal well-being, the nature of faith, the law of karma, monasticism, meditation, home shrines, filial piety, generosity, not killing animals, and alcohol use. The findings suggest that some attitudes held by teenagers were conscious and intrinsically nurtured ("worldview") while others involved social constructs ("ideologies"). The study finds that parents and the Sangha are mainly responsible for shaping "ideological" patterns in young Buddhists whereas informal nurture by "immersion" (possibly facilitated by caregivers) may be responsible for "worldview" patterns.

The Role of Deterrence in Buddhist Peace-building
Damien Keown
University of London, Goldsmiths
This article proposes that military deterrence can be a legitimate Buddhist strategy for peace. It suggests that such a strategy can provide a "middle way" between the extremes of victory and defeat. Drawing on evidence from the Pāli canon, notably the concept of the Cakkavatti, it argues that the Buddha did not object

to kingship, armies or military service, and that military deterrence is a valid means to achieve the social and political stability Buddhism values.

Violence and Nonviolence in Buddhist Animal Ethics

James Stewart
University of Tasmania

Boiled alive for killing an ant. Suffering endless demonic flagellation for trading as a butcher. According to some Buddhist writings, these are just a few of the punishments bestowed upon those who harm animals. Are such promises sincere or are they merely hollow threats intended to inculcate good conduct? Are there other non-prudential reasons for protecting animals? How do these views differ from preceding Indian traditions? These are some of the questions addressed in this article. I will argue that the threat of a bad rebirth is a major factor in motivating Buddhists to abstain from animal cruelty. By comparing the *Vinaya* (both Mahāyāna and Theravāda) to the *Sūtra* literature I will argue that such claims may be exaggerations to motivate more compassionate conduct from Buddhist adherents. I also argue that Buddhist texts look unfavorably upon animal killing in a way unheard of in the Vedic religious tradition. Although there may be disagreement over what sort of harm may befall animal abusers, it is almost universally acknowledged amongst most Buddhist sects that animal killing is completely unacceptable. However, this pacifism lives in uneasy tension with the promise of extreme violence for impinging on these basic principles of nonviolence.

The Ethics (and Economics) of Tibetan Polyandry

Jonathan Stoltz
University of St. Thomas

Fraternal polyandry—one woman simultaneously being married to two or more brothers—has been a prominent practice within Tibetan agricultural societies for many generations. While the topic of Tibetan polyandry has been widely discussed in the field of anthropology, there are, to my knowledge, no contributions by philosophers on this topic. For this reason alone, my brief analysis of the ethics of Tibetan polyandry will serve to enhance scholars' understanding of this practice. In this article, I examine the factors that have sustained the practice of polyandry in Tibet but do so with the further aim of drawing attention to some of the key ethical implications of polyandrous marriage. I argue that the natural law criticisms raised against the practice of polyandry by St. Thomas Aquinas are unsuccessful, but I also argue that the utilitarian motivations for this marriage practice endorsed by agrarian Tibetans are also highly suspect.

Blossoms of the Dharma: The Contribution of Western Nuns in Transforming Gender Bias in Tibetan Buddhism

Elizabeth Swanepoel
University of Pretoria

This article investigates the nature of gender imbalance in Tibetan Buddhism, particularly pertaining to the unavailability of *bhikṣuṇī* ordination, and the specific role Western nuns have played in contributing to transforming this imbalance. The article postulates that male privilege continues to dominate the institutional cultures of religious life in Tibetan Buddhism. However, fertile tensions have of late emerged between an underground tradition of highly accomplished female practitioners and the institutional

preference for male practitioners. A revalorization process has been initiated in recent years by a number of Western female Buddhologists, some of whom are also fully ordained Tibetan Buddhist nuns. The article highlights the efforts of these accomplished nuns as well as a number of other prominent Western Tibetan Buddhist nuns.

Buddhist Practice as Play: A Virtue Ethical View

Meynard Vasen

The debate about which Western ethical theory is most suited to understand Buddhist ethics has been fruitful, because it places the Buddhist tradition in a light that brings out new features. In this article I take further Keown's view on Buddhist ethics by offering a virtue ethical interpretation of Buddhist ethics with *praxis*/practice as a central notion, and a form of naturalism as foundation. I draw on the notion of play, as developed by Gadamer and Wittgenstein, and on MacIntyre's view on virtues as grounded in practices, narratives, and traditions, as widening hermeneutical circles. I conclude by arguing that such an interpretation is a fruitful one, both in the sense that it increases our understanding and that it motivates to engage in Buddhist practice.

Escaping the Inescapable: Changes in Buddhist Karma

Jayarava Attwood

Early Buddhist karma is an impersonal moral force that impartially and inevitably causes the consequences of actions to be visited upon the actor, especially determining their afterlife destination. The story of King Ajātasattu in the Pāli *Samaññaphala Sutta*, where not even the Buddha can intervene to save him, epitomizes the criterion of inescapability. Zoroastrian ethical thought runs along similar lines and may have influenced the early development of Buddhism. However, in the Mahāyāna version of the *Samaññaphala Sutta*, the simple act of meeting the Buddha reduces or eliminates the consequences of the King's patricide. In other Mahāyāna texts, the results of actions are routinely avoidable through the performance of religious practices. Ultimately, Buddhists seem to abandon the idea of the inescapability of the results of actions.

Bhikkhunī Academy at Manelwatta Temple: A Case of Cross-Tradition Exchange

Cheng Wei-yi
Hsuan Chuang University

This article is the result of an investigation continued from an earlier article on an exchange between Buddhists in Taiwan and Sri Lanka ("A Cross-Tradition Exchange Between Taiwan and Sri Lanka," *Journal of Buddhist Ethics*, vol. 18, 2011). In that article, I investigated the exchange between a Mahāyāna Taiwanese nunnery and a Theravāda Sri Lankan missionary monk. After the initial exchange, described in the 2011 article, a more permanent institute for the education of Sri Lankan Buddhist nuns has been established. This article describes the cross-tradition exchange behind the founding of the educational institute and its implication for exchanges across different Buddhist traditions in Asia.

Dōgen's Primer on the Nonmoral Virtues of the Good Person

Douglas K. Mikkelson
University of Hawai'i at Hilo

The *Shōbōgenzō Zuimonki* provides a good introduction to Dōgen's ideas about the virtues possessed by "the good person." His depiction includes, but extends beyond, the conception of a "morally good" human being. This is evident by the number of "nonmoral" virtues that are manifest in the text. Edmund Pincoffs presents a schematization of numerous virtues based on his conception of virtues and vices as dispositional properties that provide ground for preference or avoidance of persons. This schematization seems especially well suited for an exploration and description of the nonmoral virtues that appear in the *Shōbōgenzō Zuimonki*.

Buddhism and Intellectual Property Rights: The Role of Compassion

Soraj Hongladarom
Chulalongkorn University

I offer the outline of a theory that justifies the concept of intellectual property (IP). IP is usually justified by a utilitarian claim that such rights provide incentives for further discovery and protect the innovator through a monopoly. I propose to broaden the protection offered by the IP regime. My argument is based on the concept of compassion (*karuṇā*), the aim of relieving suffering in all others. An analysis of how patented products originate shows that they typically depend not only on scientists in the laboratory, but on numerous factors and elements, many of which do not belong to the corporation in which the experiments are conducted. Because these elements have a necessary role in the discovery of inventions, they also deserve fair treatment. In practice, this could mean that the resulting patented product would be made more accessible to the general population and that the corporation would be more actively involved in society. In the long run, this could prove beneficial for all parties, including the patent holders themselves.

Thresholds of Transcendence: Buddhist Self-immolation and Mahāyānist Absolute Altruism, Part Two

Martin Kovan
University of Melbourne

In China and Tibet, and under the gaze of the global media, the five-year period from February 2009 to February 2014 saw the self-immolations of at least 127 Tibetan Buddhist monks, nuns, and lay-people. An English Tibetan Buddhist monk, then resident in France, joined this number in November 2012, though his self-immolation has been excluded from all accounts of the exile Tibetan and other documenters of the ongoing Tibetan crisis. Underlying the phenomenon of Buddhist self-immolation is a real and interpretive ambiguity between personal, religious (or ritual-transcendental), altruistic, and political suicide, as well as political suicide within the Buddhist sangha specifically. These theoretical distinctions appear opaque not only to (aligned and non-aligned, Tibetan and non-Tibetan) observers, but potentially also to self-immolators themselves, despite their deeply motivated conviction. Such ambiguity is reflected in the varying historical and current assessments of the practice, also represented by globally significant Buddhist leaders such as His Holiness the 14th Dalai Lama and the Vietnamese monk and activist Thích Nhất Hạnh. This essay analyses the symbolic ontology of suicide in these Tibetan Buddhist cases and offers metaethical and normative accounts of self-immolation as an altruistic-political act in the "global repertoire of contention" in order to clarify its claims for what is a critically urgent issue in Buddhist ethics.

Towards a Dialogue Between Buddhist Social Theory and "Affect Studies" on the Ethico-Political Significance of Mindfulness

Edwin Ng
Deakin University

This article stages a conversation between an emergent Buddhist social theory and current thinking in the humanities and social sciences on the affective and visceral registers of everyday experience—or what falls under the rubric of "affect studies." The article takes the premise that prevailing models of Buddhist social theory need updating as they remain largely confined to macropolitical accounts of power, even though they argue for the importance of a mode of sociocultural analysis that would anchor itself on the "self" end of the self–society continuum. The article will thus explore ways to develop a micropolitical account of the ethical and political implications of Buddhist spiritual-social praxis—specifically mindfulness training—by formulating some hypotheses for dialogical exchange between Buddhist understandings and the multidisciplinary ideas informing the so-called "affective turn."

Recent Buddhist Theories of Free Will: Compatibilism, Incompatibilism, and Beyond

Riccardo Repetti
Kingsborough College, CUNY

This is the fourth article in a four-article series that examines Buddhist responses to the Western philosophical problem of whether free will is compatible with "determinism," the scientific doctrine of universal lawful causation. The first article focused on "early period" scholarship from the 1970's, which was primarily compatibilist, that is, of the view that the Buddhist conception of causation is compatible with free will. The second and third articles examined "middle period" incompatibilist and semi-compatibilist scholarship in the remainder of the twentieth century and first part of the twenty-first. The present article examines work published in the past few years. It largely agrees that Buddhism tacitly accepts free will (although it also explores an ultimate perspective from which the issue appears moot), but mostly divides along compatibilist and incompatibilist lines, mirroring Theravāda and Mahāyāna Buddhist perspectives, respectively. Of the writers I emphasize, Gier and Kjellberg articulate both perspectives; Federman and Harvey advocate Theravāda compatibilism; and Wallace argues that although determinism and free will are incompatible, subtle complexities of Mahāyāna Buddhist metaphysics circumvent the free will and determinism dichotomy. Although the present article focuses on these writers, as the culminating article in the series it also draws on and summarizes the other articles in the series, and directs the reader to other recent period works that, due to space constraints, cannot be reviewed here.

Act and Result in Nikāyan Ethics

Stephen Evans

Scholars continue to debate the ethical priority of act versus result in Buddhist ethics. The present essay looks at the issue as an approach to exploring the connection between act and karmic yield: Why there should be such a connection at all? The priority question was not asked in the Nikāyas (or commentaries) and it seems to have been the same thing to say that an act was good and that it had happy karmic yield, suggesting a kind of identity between the two. Given the necessity and specificity of the connection—the yield must accrue and must accrue for this person—and the analogical resemblance between act and karmic

yield, a causal explanation seems unsatisfactory. Suspending such assumptions, the connection appears simply as an indissoluble unity. It is hypothesized here that the unity is grounded in a primordial cosmic order, which I call the "sacral dimension," conformity to which is by definition right and of necessity beneficial, violation of which is by definition wrong and of necessity harmful. Evidence for belief in such an order is found in the Nikāyas and supporting similarities noted in the Upaniṣads.

The Politics of "Compassion" of the Fourteenth Dalai Lama: Between "Religion" and "Secularism"

Masahide Tsujimura
Kobe University
Koyasan University

Since 1959, the Fourteenth Dalai Lama has expressed the view that democratic reforms should be gradually carried out in the Tibetan political system. He did this by enlarging the connotation of the traditional Tibetan concept of chos srid zung 'brel (union of dharma and polity). This article will examine how the Dalai Lama succeeded in maintaining the traditional political concept of chos srid zung 'brel in a modern Tibetan democracy by employing the idea of "compassion" to link "religion" and "secularism."

Female Monastic Healing and Midwifery: A View from the Vinaya Tradition

Amy Paris Langenberg
Eckerd College

Monastic lawyers who formulated the various classical Indian Buddhist *Vinaya* collections actively promoted the care of the sick within monastery walls and treated illness as a topic of great importance and relevance for monks and nuns but also mandated that monastics should exercise caution with respect to practicing the healing arts and provide medical care to lay people only on a restricted basis. A closer examination of *Vinaya* sources shows that this ambivalence is gendered in interesting ways. The *Vinaya* lawyers regulated nuns's involvement in the healing arts, and other types of service, with special care, suggesting that nuns were more likely than monks to take up community work, especially the work of healing. This study attempts to sort out the subtleties of *Vinaya* attitudes towards the public (as opposed to internal monastic) practice of medicine by nuns, suggesting that social constraints forced laywomen and nuns into relationships of collusion and mutual need and created a situation in which nuns were more likely than their male counterparts to engage in the healing arts. A female monastic ethic emphasizing reciprocity and mutual obligation made it doubly unlikely that Buddhist nuns would turn away from the medical needs of laywomen. Thus, a complex combination of factors accounts for the disproportionate focus on nuns in *Vinaya* prohibitions regarding the practice of the healing arts.

Karma and Female Birth

Bhikkhu Anālayo
Numata Center for Buddhist Studies, University of Hamburg;
Dharma Drum Buddhist College, Taiwan

With the present article I examine the notion that birth as a woman is the result of bad karma based on selected canonical and post-canonical Buddhist texts.

"We Love Our Nuns": Affective Dimensions of the Sri Lankan *Bhikkhunī* Revival

Susanne Mrozik
Mount Holyoke College

In this article I examine lay responses to the Sri Lankan *bhikkhunī* revival of the late 1990s. Drawing on ethnographic research conducted between 2010 and 2012, I argue that laity have very different concerns than do the scholars, activists, government officials, and monastic authorities engaged in public debate over the scriptural validity of the controversial revival. The primary concern of laity is whether or not they can get their religious needs met at their local *bhikkhunī* temple, not whether or not the *bhikkhunī* revival conforms to Theravāda monastic regulations (*Vinaya*). Taking a rural farming village as a case study, I focus particular attention on the affective ties between laity and nuns, demonstrating that laity in this village express their support for the *bhikkhunī* revival in the language of love (Sinhala: *ādayara*, *ādare*). I analyze what laity mean by the word "love" in the context of lay-nun relationships, and what this can tell us about the larger dynamics of the Sri Lankan *bhikkhunī* revival.

Rethinking the Precept of Not Taking Money in Contemporary Taiwanese and Mainland Chinese Buddhist Nunneries

Tzu-Lung Chiu
University of Ghent

According to monastic disciplinary texts, Buddhist monastic members are prohibited from accepting "gold and silver," and arguably, by extension, any type of money. This rule has given rise to much debate, in the past as well as in the present, particularly between Mahāyāna and Theravāda Buddhist communities. The article explores the results of my multiple-case qualitative study of eleven monastic institutions in Taiwan and Mainland China and reveals a hitherto under-theorized conflict between *Vinaya* rules and the bodhisattva ideal, as well as a diversity of opinions on the applicability of the rule against money handling as it has been shaped by socio-cultural contexts, including nuns' adaptation to the laity's ethos.

The Trolley Car Dilemma: The Early Buddhist Answer and Resulting Insights

Ven. Pandita (Burma)
University of Kelaniya

In this article, I attempt to give a Buddhist answer to the Trolley Car Dilemma posed by Michael J. Sandel and also present insights that I have discovered along the way.

Volume 22 (2015)

The Cessation of Suffering and Buddhist Axiology

Daniel Breyer
Illinois State University

This article examines Buddhist axiology. In section 1, the article argues against the dominant interpretations of what is the ultimate good in Buddhist ethics. In section 2, the article argues for a novel interpretation of Buddhist value theory. This is the Nirodha View, which maintains that for at least the Pāli Buddhist tradition,

the cessation of suffering is the sole intrinsic good. In section 3, the article responds to objections and briefly suggests that even non-Buddhists should take the Nirodha View seriously.

Predictions of Women to Buddhahood in Middle-Period Literature

Bhikkhunī Dhammadinnā
Dharma Drum Institute of Liberal Arts

This article studies narratives related to the topic of women receiving a prediction or declaration (*vyākaraṇa*) for Buddhahood. The texts in question—in their received form—have their place in the Indian Buddhist traditions of the Middle Period. The first episode taken up is the story of Princess Munī who receives the prediction of becoming the present Buddha Śākyamuni; this is found in the so-called "Scripture on the Wise and the Fool." The second episode is the story of Yaśomatī who receives the prediction that she will become the Buddha Ratnamati; this is found in the *Avadānaśataka*. When evaluating these comparatively rare instances of predictions received by women, two aspects come up for special consideration: (a) the textual significance of variations regarding the presence or absence of a change of sex, and (b) the epistemological and soteriological consequences for female audiences of women's narratives constructed by the third-person perspective of male monastic text transmitters. The variations document that the transmitters did not always perceive the transformation of sex into a male as a categorical necessity. This transformation may not have been integral to these narratives of the bodhisattva path as articulated by the textual communities in which these texts originated and circulated.

***Rimé* Revisited: Shabkar's Response to Religious Difference**

Rachel H. Pang
Davidson College

This article analyzes Shabkar Tsokdruk Rangdrol's (1781–1851) Tibetan Buddhist response to interreligious and intersectarian difference. While there exist numerous studies in Buddhist ethics that address the Buddhist perspective on contemporary issues such as abortion, euthanasia, and terrorism, there has been considerably less attention paid to Buddhist responses towards religious difference. Moreover, the majority of the research on this topic has been conducted within the context of Buddhist-Christian dialogue. This article examines Shabkar's non-sectarian ideas on their own terms, within the context of Buddhist thought. I demonstrate the strong visionary, apocalyptic, theological, and soteriological dimensions of Shabkar's *rimé*, or "unbiased," approach to religious diversity. The two main applications of these findings are: (1) they broaden the current academic understanding of *rimé* from being a sociological phenomenon to a theological one grounded in social and historical particularities; (2) they draw attention to the non-philosophical aspects of Buddhist ethics.

The *Cullavagga* on *Bhikkhunī* Ordination

Bhikkhu Anālayo
University of Hamburg

With this article I examine the narrative that in the *Cullavagga* of the Theravāda *Vinaya* forms the background to the different rules on *bhikkhunī* ordination, alternating between translations of the respective portions

from the original Pāli and discussions of their implications. An appendix to the article briefly discusses the term *paṇḍaka*.

Ethical Implications of *Upāya-Kauśalya*: Helping Without Imposing
Kin Cheung
Temple University
Upāya-kauśalya has been examined as a hermeneutical device, a Mahāyānic innovation, and a philosophy of practice. Although the paternalism of *upāya-kauśalya* employed in the *Lotus Sūtra* has been analyzed, there is little attention paid to bringing these ethical implications into a practical context. There is a tension between the motivation, even obligation, to help, and the potential dangers of projecting or imposing one's conception of what is best for others or how best to help. I examine this issue through various parables. I argue that ordinary people can use *upāya-kauśalya* and that the ethical implications of *upāya-kauśalya* involve closing two different gaps in knowledge. This has potential applications not just for individuals, but also for organizations like NPOs or NGOs that try to assist large communities.

The Four Realities True for Noble Ones: A New Approach to the *Ariyasaccas*
Ven. Pandita (Burma)
University of Kelaniya
Peter Harvey recently argued that the term *sacca* of *ariyasacca* should be interpreted as "reality" rather than as "truth," the common rendition. In this article, although I basically agree with him, I see quite different implications and come to a wholly new interpretation of the four *ariyasaccas*.

Nature's No-Thingness: Holistic Eco-Buddhism and the Problem of Universal Identity
Marek Sullivan
University of Oxford
"Holistic eco-Buddhism" has been roundly criticized for its heterodoxy and philosophical incoherence: the Buddha never claimed we should protect an "eco-self" and there are serious philosophical problems attendant on "identifying with things." Yet this essay finds inadequate attention has been paid to East Asian sources. Metaphysical issues surrounding eco-Buddhism, i.e., problems of identity and difference, universalism and particularity, have a long history in Chinese Buddhism. In particular, I examine the notion of "merging with things" in pre-Huayan and Huayan Buddhism, suggesting these offer unexplored possibilities for a coherent holistic eco-Buddhism based on the differentiating effects of activity and functionality.

The Metaphysical Basis of Śāntideva's Ethics
Amod Lele
Boston University
Western Buddhists often believe and proclaim that metaphysical speculation is irrelevant to Buddhist ethics or practice. This view is problematic even with respect to early Buddhism and cannot be sustained regarding later Indian Buddhists. In Śāntideva's famous *Bodhicaryāvatāra*, multiple claims about the nature of reality are premises for conclusions about how human beings should act; that is, metaphysics logically entails ethics for Śāntideva, as it does for many Western philosophers. This article explores four key arguments that

Śāntideva makes from metaphysics to ethics: actions are determined by their causes, and therefore we should not get angry; the body is reducible to its component parts, and therefore we should neither protect it nor lust after other bodies; the self is an illusion, and therefore we should be altruistic; all phenomena are empty, and therefore we should not be attached to them. The exploration of these arguments together shows us why metaphysical claims can matter a great deal for Buddhist ethics, practice and liberation.

The Eco-Buddhism of Marie Byles

Peggy James
University of Tasmania

Marie Beuzeville Byles (1900–1979) was a key figure in the historical development of Buddhism in Australia, and the nation's conservation movement. From the 1940s she began to develop an eco-Buddhist worldview and Buddhist environmental ethic that she applied in her day-to-day conservation activities and articulated over the course of four books on Buddhism and dozens of published articles. She is recognized in Australia for her Buddhist environmental thought, the influence that her ideas had in a key environmental debate of her day, and her international profile as a Buddhist. Most histories of modern eco-Buddhism, however, do not mention Byles's work, and there has thus far been little scholarly analysis of her writings. This article examines Byles's eco-Buddhist ideas and activities in detail and assesses the historical significance of her contribution.

***Puṇya* and *Pāp* in Public Health: Everyday Religion, Material Culture, and Avenues of Buddhist Activism in Urban Kathmandu**

Todd Lewis
College of the Holy Cross

In the dense settlements of old Kathmandu city, an urban ecology is fueled by abundant natural resources and sustained by a complex web of predator and prey species, all in a space dominated by human presence and practices. These include everyday activities in temples, roads, and homes that are rooted in Buddhist and Hindu doctrines. Both traditions emphasize non-violence (*ahiṃsā*) to all living beings, and adherents seek merit (*puṇya*) daily from feeding some of them. In light of the still chronic outbreaks of diseases like cholera, and especially in light of the threat of future avian-vector epidemics, a new avenue of doctrinal interpretation favoring human intervention might be developed based on the *Bodhicaryāvatāra*, an important Mahāyāna Buddhist text. In the spirit of "engaged Buddhism," the discussion concludes with suggestions on how Newar Buddhist teachers today can use their cultural resources to shift their community's ethical standpoint and take effective actions.

Buddha's Past Life as a Princess in the *Ekottarika-āgama*

Ven. Anālayo
University of Hamburg and Dharma Drum Institute of Liberal Arts

In the present article I study the *Ekottarika-āgama* version of a past life of the Buddha as a princess. I begin with some general observations on the gender of the Buddha's past lives as reported in *jātaka* narratives, followed by a translation of the relevant section from the *Ekottarika-āgama*. Then I compare this *Ekottarika-*

āgama version to three other versions of this tale preserved in Pāli and Chinese, in particular in relation to the way they deal with the dictum that a woman cannot receive a prediction of future Buddhahood.

A Love Knowing Nothing: Zen Meets Kierkegaard
Mary Jeanne Larrabee
DePaul University
I present a case for a love that has a wisdom knowing nothing. How this nothing functions underlies what Kierkegaard urges in *Works of Love* and how Zen compassion moves us to action. In each there is an ethical call to love in action. I investigate how Kierkegaard's "religiousness B" is a "second immediacy" in relation to God, one springing from a nothing between human and God. This immediacy clarifies what Kierkegaard takes to be the Christian call to love. I draw a parallel between Kierkegaard's immediacy and the expression of immediacy within a Zen-influenced life, particularly the way in which it calls the Zen practitioner to act toward the specific needs of the person standing before one. In my understanding of both Kierkegaard and Zen life, there is also an ethics of response to the circumstances that put the person in need, such as entrenched poverty or other injustices.

Becoming *Bhikkhunī*? *Mae Chis* and the Global Women's Ordination Movement
Lisa J. Battaglia
Samford University
Women's full ordination as Buddhist nuns (Pāli: *bhikkhunī*, Sanskrit: *bhikṣuṇī*) has been a contested issue across Buddhist traditions and historical periods. Today, there is a global movement to secure women's full participation in Buddhist monastic institutions. The present study examines this "*bhikkhunī* movement" in Thailand from the perspective of *mae chis*, Thai Buddhist female renunciates who abide by eight precepts yet do not have full ordination or ordination lineage. Employing an anthropological approach informed by postcolonial critical theory, my research reveals that *mae chis*, women who lead a Buddhist monastic lifestyle characterized by celibate practice and spiritual discipline, are not, on the whole, eager to relinquish their present status, fight against the existing socio-religious order, or pursue *bhikkhunī* ordination. A critical-empathic consideration of *mae chis*' apparent illiberal subjectivities regarding gender hierarchy, female renunciant identity, and women's liberation brings to light goals and strategies of the global *bhikkhunī* movement that do not necessarily resonate with the motivations, aims or cultural sensibilities of the Thai white-robed female renunciates.

Volume 23 (2016)

"To Whom Does Kisā Gotamī Speak?" Grief, Impermanence, and *Upāya*
Richard K. Payne
Institute of Buddhist Studies, at the Graduate Theological Union
This article develops a perspective on the nature of Buddhist pastoral care by considering the needs of the bereaved. Differentiating the interpretive frameworks of different audiences and understanding different contexts of interpersonal relations are necessary for effective pastoral care. A distinction between the goal

of realizing impermanence and the goal of resolving mourning is heuristically useful in theorizing Buddhist pastoral care. The discussion also seeks to underscore the value of upāya as a positive moral injunction on teachers, indicating the need to properly match their audience and to employ the textual tradition responsibly.

Buddhist Nuns' Ordination in the Mūlasarvāstivāda *Vinaya*Tradition: Two Possible Approaches
Bhikṣuṇī Jampa Tsedroen
Academy of World Religions and Numata Center for Buddhist Studies, University of Hamburg
This article examines the possibilities of reviving the Mūlasarvāstivāda lineage of fully ordained nuns (*bhikṣuṇī*). It explores two ways to generate a "flawless and perfect" Mūlasarvāstivāda *bhikṣuṇī* vow, either by Mūlasarvāstivāda monks alone or by Mūlasarvāstivāda monks with Dharmaguptaka nuns ("ecumenical" ordination). The first approach is based on a *Vinaya* passage which traditionally is taken as the *Word of the Buddha*, but which, from a historical-critical point of view, is dubious. The second approach is not explicitly represented in the *Vinaya* but involves "re-reading" or "re-thinking" it with a critical-constructive attitude ("theological" approach). Each approach is based on my latest findings from studying the Tibetan translation of the *Bhikṣuṇyupasaṃpadājñāpti* and related commentaries.

Facing Death from a Safe Distance: *Saṃvega* and Moral Psychology
Lajos Brons
Nihon University and Lakeland University
Saṃvega is a morally motivating state of shock that—according to Buddhaghosa—should be evoked by meditating on death. What kind of mental state it is exactly, and how it is morally motivating is unclear, however. This article presents a theory of *saṃvega*—what it is and how it works—based on recent insights in psychology. According to dual process theories there are two kinds of mental processes organized in two "systems": the experiential, automatic system 1, and the rational, controlled system 2. In normal circumstances, system 1 does not believe in its own mortality. *Saṃvega* occurs when system 1 suddenly realizes that the "subjective self" will inevitably die (while system 2 is already disposed to affirm the subject's mortality). This results in a state of shock that is morally motivating under certain conditions. *Saṃvega* increases mortality salience and produces insight in suffering, and in combination with a strengthened sense of loving-kindness or empathic concern both mortality salience and insight in suffering produce moral motivation.

On Compassionate Killing and the *Abhidhamma*'s "Psychological Ethics"
Damien Keown
University of London Goldsmiths
Is compassionate killing really psychologically impossible, as the *Abhidhamma* claims? Previously I discussed a *Vinaya* case that seemed to show the contrary. Reviewing my conclusions in the light of commentarial literature, Rupert Gethin disagreed and restated the *Abhidhamma* position that killing can never be motivated by compassion. This article supports my original conclusions and argues further that the *Vinaya* case reveals underlying problems with the *Abhidhamma*'s "psychological ethics."

The Going Forth of Mahāpajāpatī Gotamī in T 60

Bhikkhu Anālayo
University of Hamburg

In what follows I translate a discourse preserved as an individual translation in the Taishō edition under entry number 60, which reports the going forth of Mahāpajāpatī Gotamī. Following that is a discussion concerning the different attitudes toward women that emerge from this discourse and a comparison to the current setting in Thailand.

Volume 24 (2017)

Tradition, Power, and Community among Buddhist Nuns in Sri Lanka

Nirmala S. Salgado
Augustana College

This article focuses on the relationship between two aspects of monastic comportment among Buddhist nuns in Sri Lanka. How nuns present themselves is embedded both in a discourse of power and in a discourse of morality. Their comportment is the subject of public debate insofar as it relates to disputes about tradition and the recognition of the higher ordination of Theravāda nuns. Yet that comportment also relates to the cultivation of moral dispositions (*sīla*), such as restraint and discipline, which are intrinsic to tradition and the daily work of nuns in the communal life of a nunnery. The article argues that nuns live a communal form of life in which their cultivation of moral dispositions relates to questions about power and tradition that they cannot ignore, even though they may seek to do so.

Right Speech Is Not Always Gentle: The Buddha's Authorization of Sharp Criticism, its Rationale, Limits, and Possible Applications

Sallie B. King
Georgetown University

What is Right Speech and how should it be applied in the multiple challenges of social and political life? Examining passages from the Pāli canon shows that although Right Speech is normatively truthful and gentle, the Buddha endorsed "sharp" speech when it was beneficial and timely. He both permitted and modeled direct, sharp criticism of the person whose words or actions were harmful. The monks were taught to use such speech even though it might disturb their equanimity and are seen as having a moral duty to do so. Good moral judgment is needed to determine when sharp speech should be used. Applying the analysis to the question of how Buddhists should respond to the harmful words and actions of Donald Trump, the study finds that the norms of Right Speech entail using sharp speech in this case. In responding to supporters of Donald Trump, the study finds benefit in avoiding sharp speech in an effort to build mutual understanding and heal the deep divisions in contemporary American society. An exception is made for hate speech which is seen as needing to be immediately confronted.

In the Midst of Imperfections: Burmese Buddhists and Business Ethics

Pyi Phyo Kyaw
King's College, University of London

This article looks at interpretations by Buddhists in Burma of right livelihood (*sammā-ājīva*) and documents the moral reasoning that underlies their business activities. It explores different ways in which Buddhists in Burma, through the use of Buddhist ethics and practices, resolve moral dilemmas that they encounter while pursuing their livelihood. I give a brief summary of the existing scholarship on Buddhist economics and on economic action in Burma, exemplified by the work of E. F. Schumacher and Melford Spiro respectively. In so doing, I wish to highlight a difference between the approaches of the existing scholarship and that of this article: the existing scholarship analyzes economic issues from the perspective of normative ethics; this research analyzes them from the perspective of descriptive ethics, looking at how Buddhists interpret and apply Buddhist ethics in their business activities, in the midst of moral, social, and economic imperfections. The research presented draws on semi-structured interviews and fieldwork conducted in Burma in the summer of 2010 and relates the interpretations given to the relevant Buddhist literature, the textual authorities for doctrines such as morality (*sīla*).

A Buddhist Typology of Inherent Values

Eran Laish
Leipzig University

Intentions and actions are basic elements in Buddhist ethical models. Yet, how are the values of those decided? This article asserts that some of the inherent qualities of lived experience are the basic factors that determine the value of ethical motives and ethical behavior. The examination of Buddhist descriptions of lived experience reveals two complementary types of inherent values—values that accompany individual phenomena and values that indicate structural aspects of human consciousness. Both types manifest certain inherent possibilities of awareness that are necessary for the appearance of ethical values. The first kind of inherent values consists of distinct feelings and volitions, while the second kind includes dualistic and non-dualistic aspects of awareness. By considering these two kinds, it becomes possible to understand how ethical differences are based on distinctions between felt qualities, and how some of these qualities lead to the culmination of the Buddhist path—abiding in non-dual awareness without affective and cognitive afflictions.

Canonical Exegesis in the Theravāda Vinaya

Bhikkhu Brahmāli
Bodhinyana Monastery
Bhikkhu Anālayo
University of Hamburg

In the present article the two authors examine dimensions of the canonical exegesis found embedded within the text of the Theravāda *Vinaya*. In part one, Bhikkhu Anālayo examines the word-commentary on the rules found in the *Suttavibhaṅga*. In part two, Bhikkhu Brahmāli takes up the function of narrative portions in the *Khandhakas*.

Guṇaprabha on Monastic Authority and Authoritative Doctrine

Paul Nietupski
John Carroll University

This essay is based on sūtras 70–102 in Guṇaprabha's seventh century *Vinayasūtra*, his *Autocommentary*, and the associated sections in all Indian and Tibetan commentaries on the *Vinayasūtra*. In this excerpt Guṇaprabha and the commentators include remarks on the requirements for monastic community authority and references to relevant authoritative doctrines. The guidelines for monastic authority include applications of procedures in medieval Indian monastic life, including prerequisites and exceptions in the ordination process. The references to authoritative doctrine in Guṇaprabha's and the commentators' works include comments on the interface of ethics, concentration, and wisdom, and how ethical guidelines are based on the correct understanding of epistemological value as presented in canonical treatises on doctrine.

Quitting the Dhamma: The Ways of Forsaking the Order According to the Early *Vinaya*

Ven. Pandita (Burma)
University of Kelaniya

In this article, I argue that in the early *Vinaya*, contrary to the commentarial tradition: (1) two ways of forsaking the Order, equally valid, co-exist; and (2) nuns who have left the Order may be re-ordained without guilt.

On the Good in Aristotle and Early Buddhism: A Response to Abraham Vélez

Damien Keown
University of London, Goldsmiths

In an earlier publication I compared Aristotelian and Buddhist concepts of the consummate good. Abraham Vélez de Cea has claimed I misrepresent the nature of the good by restricting it to certain psychic states and excluding a range of other goods acknowledged by Aristotle and the Buddha. My aim here is to show that my understanding of the good is not the narrow one Vélez suggests. The article concludes with some observations on the relationship between moral and non-moral good in Buddhism.

Capital Punishment: a Buddhist Critique

Martin Kovan
University of Melbourne

Capital punishment is practiced in many nation-states, secular and religious alike. It is also historically a feature of some Buddhist polities, even though it defies the first Buddhist precept (*pāṇatipātā*) prohibiting lethal harm. This essay considers a neo-Kantian theorization of capital punishment (Sorell) and examines the reasons underwriting its claims (with their roots in Bentham and Mill) with respect to the prevention of and retribution for crime. The contextualization of this argument with Buddhist-metaphysical and epistemological concerns around the normativization of value, demonstrates that such a retributivist conception of capital punishment constitutively undermines its own rational and normative discourse. With this conclusion, the article upholds and justifies the first Buddhist precept prohibiting lethal action in the case of capital punishment.

Dharma Dogs: Can Animals Understand the Dharma? Textual and Ethnographic Considerations
James Stewart
University of Tasmania
Pāli textual sources occasionally mention the existence of unusual animals with an aptitude for the Buddha's dharma. In the *Jātaka*, clever animals do good deeds and are thus reborn in better circumstances. In the *Vinaya*, the Buddha declares to a serpent that he should observe Buddhist holy days so he can achieve a human rebirth. But can animals develop spiritually? Can they move towards enlightenment? In this article I will be examining textual and ethnographic accounts of whether animals can hear and understand the dharma. Using ethnographic research conducted in Sri Lanka, I will show that although animals are thought to passively benefit from being in proximity to dharma institutions, there seems to be agreement amongst the monks interviewed that animals cannot truly understand the dharma and therefore cannot practice it. Animals are therefore severely hampered in their spiritual advancement. However, these ethnographic and textual findings do indicate that passively listening to dharma preaching, whether it is understood or not, has spiritually productive consequences.

Dependent Origination, Emptiness, and the Value of Nature
David Cummiskey and Alex Hamilton
Bates College
This article explains the importance of the Buddhist doctrine of dependent origination to contemporary environmental ethics and also develops a Buddhist account of the relational, non-instrumental, and impersonal value of nature. The article's methodology is "comparative" or "fusion" philosophy. In particular, dependent origination and Nāgārjuna's doctrine of emptiness are developed in contrast to Aldo Leopold and J. Baird Callicott's conception of deep ecology, and the Buddhist conception of value is developed using Christine Korsgaard's Kantian analysis of the distinction between intrinsic/extrinsic value and means/ends value.

Volume 25 (2018)

The Case for Reviving the Bhikkhunī Order by Single Ordination
Bhikkhu Anālayo
Numata Center for Buddhist Studies, University of Hamburg
In this article I examine the legal validity of reviving the Theravāda Order of *bhikkhunīs* by an act of single ordination, granted by *bhikkhus* on their own. My presentation responds to criticism voiced by Bhikkhu Ṭhānissaro of this possibility of restoring the missing one out of the four assemblies in the Theravāda tradition.

Borrowing a Prophetic Voice, Actualizing the Prophetic Dimension: Rita Gross and Engaged Buddhism
Charles R. Strain
DePaul University
"I am taking permission, as a Buddhist," Rita Gross boldly affirmed, "to use the prophetic voice." More than any other engaged Buddhist scholar she made this voice an explicit part of her work. This article explores the prophetic voice/dimension within Buddhism by pushing further along the path that Gross has blazed. This involves, *first*, a return to the classical Hebrew prophets where, arguably, the religious dimension of the prophetic voice is most clearly presented. The *second* section deconstructs the misogynistic narratives that pervade the prophetic literature and their theology of *retributive* justice and then offers an argument about what is salvageable in the prophet's raw speech. The *third* section examines how Gross applies a prophetic method to the deconstruction of the androcentric views and the patriarchal structures of all schools of Buddhism. The final, *fourth*, section comes to terms with the religious chords sounding in the prophets' declamations. It does so by examining three aspects of the prophetic mode of being religious: allegiance to the God of Exodus, the practice of grief, and the practice of hope. In each case it suggests what challenges these modes of being religious present to engaged Buddhists.

It Wasn't Me: Reply to Karin Meyers
Rick Repetti
Kingsborough Community College
City University of New York
This is my reply to Karin Meyers, "False Friends: Dependent Origination and the Perils of Analogy in Cross-Cultural Philosophy," in this Symposium. Meyers generally focuses on exegesis of what Early Buddhists *said*, which reasonably constrains what we may think about them if we are Buddhists. I agree with and find much value in most of her astute analyses, here and elsewhere, so I restrict my reply here to where we disagree, or otherwise seem to be speaking past, or misunderstanding, each other. In this regard, I focus on three of her claims. Meyers argues that (1) Buddhist dependent origination is not determinism; (2) attempts at naturalizing Buddhism threaten to run afoul of her hermeneutics; and (3) I seem to err on both fronts. However, I have emphasized that I am not a determinist, and I am not as concerned with what Buddhists did say about causation and agency. As a philosopher, I am mainly concerned with what philosophers can say about them. Thus, Meyers's criticisms of my work seem predicated on interpretations of ideas I do not exactly espouse. Thus, the "Repetti" that Meyers primarily critiqued, as the title to this Reply (hopefully humorously) makes clear, wasn't me! Whether I have failed to make my ideas clear, she has failed to accurately interpret them, or some combination of both, I am uncertain. Thus, I focus on trying to clarify those ideas of mine that Meyers seems to interpret in a way that I do not.

It Wasn't Us: Reply to Michael Brent
Rick Repetti
Kingsborough Community College
City University of New York
In "Confessions of a Deluded Westerner," Michael Brent insists no contributions to *Buddhist Perspectives on Free Wil*l (Repetti) even *address* free will because none deploy the criteria for free will that Western (*incompatibilist*) philosophers identify: the ability to do *otherwise* under identical conditions, and the ability

to have one's choices be *up* to oneself. Brent claims the criteria and abilities in that anthology are criteria for intentional action, but not all intentional actions are *free*. He also insists that Buddhism, ironically, cannot even accept intentional action, because, on his analysis, intentionality requires an agent, which Buddhism rejects. I have four responses: (i) Brent ignores the other half of the debate, *compatibilism*, in both Western and Buddhist philosophy, represented in the anthology by several contributors; (ii) the autonomy of Buddhist meditation virtuosos is *titanic* compared to Brent's autonomy criteria, which latter are relatively mundane and facile, rather than something Buddhists fail to rise up to; (iii) such titanic Buddhist autonomy challenges, and possibly defeats, all major Western arguments against free will; and (iv) several contributors address the possibility of agentless agency. These responses could have been taken right out of the anthology, not only from my contributions.

A Role for Primordial Wisdom in the Buddhist Free Will Controversy

Marie Friquegnon
William Paterson University

In *Buddhist Perspectives on Free Will* (Repetti), I set forth my position on Buddhism and free will in terms of three ways of understanding the issue of freedom in Buddhism. Here I first offer a sketch of that threefold analysis, and then I analyze certain key passages in some of the other essays in that collection through that lens. Each of these three ways of understanding Buddhist conceptions of freedom harmonizes with some of the essays. I then analyze Śāntideva's view on the acceptability of the action of the bodhisattva who shot a pirate to save 500 people; I contrast that with Śāntarakṣita's view; and I try to dissolve an apparent contradiction. I then take Śāntideva's use of *upāya* (skillful means) in the pirate case and apply it to his position on free will. Lastly, I conclude by suggesting that the way out of some of the discrepancies in the analysis of free will in Buddhism may be resolved by appealing to primordial wisdom as a hypothetical construct, making reference to what appears to be an analogous use of the concept of a hypothetical construct that may be found in Aquinas.

False Friends: Dependent Origination and the Perils of Analogy in Cross-Cultural Philosophy

Karin Meyers
Centre for Buddhist Studies
Kathmandu University

Cross-cultural philosophical inquiry is predicated on the possibility of drawing analogies between ideas from distinct historical and cultural traditions, but is distorted and constrained when those analogies are overdrawn. In considering what Buddhists might have to say about free will, scholars tend to draw analogies between dependent origination and distinctively modern naturalistic ideas of universal causation. Such analogies help promote the idea of Buddhism as a "scientific religion" and help justify the impulse to naturalize Buddhism (or to simply ignore its un- or super-natural elements) in order to make it a more credible conversation partner. By tracing some of the early history of the idea of dependent origination, this essay discusses how and why these analogies have been overdrawn. It addresses why this matters to the inquiry into free will and other cross-cultural philosophical engagements with Buddhism. With respect to naturalizing Buddhism, it argues that decisions about what to exclude from serious consideration (such as karma and rebirth) necessarily influence how we understand ideas (such as dependent origination) we deem

more congenial (and thus essential), and that by excluding those we do not find congenial, we foreclose opportunities to submit our own philosophical assumptions to scrutiny and to be genuinely transformed by our encounter with Buddhism.

Buddhist Philosophy, Free Will, and Artificial Intelligence

James V. Luisi
Independent Scholar

Can Buddhist philosophy and Western philosophical conceptions of free will intelligently inform each other? Repetti has described one possible Buddhist option of solving the free will problem by identifying a middle path between the extremes of rigid determinism, as understood by the hard determinist, and random indeterminism, as understood by the hard indeterminist. In support of this middle path option, I draw upon ideas from the fields of artificial intelligence, quantum computing, evolutionary psychology, and related fields that together render coherent the ideas that determinism may be non-rigid and that indeterminism may be non-random, on the one hand, and upon Buddhist ideas, such as interdependence, the four-cornered negation, and what Repetti describes as the Buddhist conception of causation as "wiggly," to argue that Buddhist philosophy has much to contribute to the field of artificial intelligence, on the other hand. Together, I suggest, the Buddhist philosopher and the software expert would form an ideal team to take on the task of constructing genuine artificial intelligence capable of the sort of conscious agency that human beings apparently possess.

Freedom through Cumulative Moral Cultivation: Heroic Willpower (*Vīrya*)

Jonathan C. Gold
Princeton University

Although abstract speculation on "freedom of the will" is hard to find in premodern Buddhist writings, this is not for Buddhists' lack of attention to responsibility and effortful moral acts. This article studies early teachings on the *dharmas* called "effort" (*vyāyāma*) and "heroic will-power" (*vīrya*), which are key to such quintessential Buddhist lists as the Eightfold Path, the Four Right Endeavors, and the Perfections cultivated by a bodhisattva. A look at effortful action as treated in traditional Buddhist texts helps to show why the western philosophical preoccupation with "free will" is not self-evidently worthwhile from a practical or moral perspective. Effort on the Buddhist path accumulates into moral strength through numerous and different kinds of enactments at the level of individual mental events. The goal of this model of practice is that one arrives at the ability to transcend the busy, messy work of having to *decide* to act morally—one's virtue becomes spontaneous. This structure suggests that not only is the capacity for moral choice not a necessary precondition of effective practice or moral significance; it may get in the way.

The Healing Paradox of Controlled Behavior: A Perspective from Mindfulness-Based Interventions

Asaf Federman
Sagol Center for Brain and Mind, Muda Institute, IDC Herzliya
Oren Ergas
Beit Berl College, Israel

In this article, we discuss the issue of free will as it may be informed by an analysis of originally Buddhism-based meditative disciplines such as mindfulness-based stress reduction (MBSR), mindfulness-based

cognitive therapy (MBCT), and related mindfulness-based interventions (MBIs) that are deployed in a variety of therapeutic contexts. We analyze the mechanics of these forms of mindfulness meditation, paying particular attention to the ways in which they appear to enable individual practitioners to reduce a variety of otherwise unwholesome mental and behavioral factors, such as habituated or conditioned dispositions to reactivity, that are intuitively associated with increasingly ineffective agency or diminished free will, while increasing wholesome mental and behavioral tendencies, such as spontaneous responsiveness. We pay particular attention to a somewhat paradoxical way in which direct efforts at control are counter-productive, on the one hand, while meditative practices designed to cultivate "choiceless awareness," a sort of non-control associated with a non-judgmental acceptance of things beyond our control, tend to indirectly increase self-regulative abilities, on the other hand.

Confessions of a Deluded Westerner

Michael Brent
University of Denver

In this article, I aim to make two general points. First, I claim that the discussions in Repetti (*Buddhist Perspectives on Free Will: Agentless Agency?*) assume different, sometimes conflicting, notions of free will, so the guiding question of the book is not as clear as it could be. Second, according to Buddhist tradition, the path to enlightenment requires rejecting the delusional belief in the existence of a persisting self. I claim that if there is no persisting self, there are no intentional actions; and, if there are no intentional actions, there is no hope for Buddhist enlightenment. Thus, rejecting the allegedly delusional belief in a persisting self has disastrous consequences, both for the existence of intentional action and for Buddhist soteriology.

Tracing the Trajectory of Buddhist Free Will Theorizing

Katie Javanaud
Keble College, Oxford

This article documents the key trends and developments in the history of Buddhist free will theorizing, indicating potential new avenues for research. Part 1 traces the debate from its origins in the late 19th century to the present day. Though scholarship remains divided as to whether a Buddhist free will problem can even be formulated, this article contends that such skeptical arguments can be defeated. An important aspect of Buddhist free will debates concerns the commensurability of causal determinism and dependent origination: by evaluating their similarities and differences it becomes clear that dependency relations encompass, but are not limited to, causal relations. Part 2 examines psychological/spiritual responses to the problem, where the focus has shifted away from metaphysics. Finally, this article initiates an exploration into the prospects of articulating a pan-Buddhist response to the free will problem.

Symposium on *Buddhist Perspectives on Free Will: Agentless Agency?*

Rick Repetti
Kingsborough Community College
City University of New York

This special issue of the *Journal of Buddhist Ethics*, Volume 25, is a symposium on the anthology, *Buddhist Perspectives on Free Will: Agentless Agency?* (Repetti), and on the topic reflected by that title, more broadly,

based on an Author Meets Critics session of the 2018 American Philosophical Association Eastern Division meeting organized by Christian Coseru. To orient readers new to the topic, I first sketch what some of the issues are regarding Buddhist perspectives on free will. Second, I briefly describe the anthology, and third, I introduce the several contributions to this symposium. As I am sympathetic to most of the articles here, I only respond briefly to them in this introduction, giving some reasons for my approval. Two articles here, however, are significantly critical of either the anthology as a whole (Brent), or critical of my contributions to it (Meyers). I respond separately to each of them in the last two articles in the symposium. Together with this introduction, all the included articles are original.

The Wisdom of Need: Basic Goods Provision in Buddhist Economic Ethics

Kenneth A. Reinert
Schar School of Policy and Government
George Mason University

Human beings have basic needs, and these needs must be addressed through the provision of basic goods and services. This article reviews the role of basic goods in Buddhist economic ethics, both traditional and contemporary. It suggests that basic goods provision deserves particular attention in economic considerations and that such attention is fully consistent with both Buddhist economic ethics and the idea of moral minimalism in political philosophy. The article proposes and discusses basic goods in the form of "eight requisites," a modification of the traditional Buddhist "four requisites" of food, clothing, shelter, and medicine.

Social Inequalities and the Promotion of Women in Buddhism in Thailand

Manuel Litalien
Nipissing University

Studies have shown that religion can support or hinder social development (Haynes 2007; Tomalin 2013). This article makes a case in favor of how, in Thailand, the demands for greater justice and gender equality have engaged groups of women to seek higher Buddhist ordination as a means to better promote human and social development. Equal religious philanthropic contribution between men and women is presented as a component to democratic participation in the struggling political Kingdom of Thailand. The study finds that the women's Buddhist movement in Thailand capitalizes on the limited welfare resources offered by the government, along with the current institutionalized politics of religious diversity, as defined in the Thai constitution. To present the inequalities and challenges faced by Thai Buddhist women, the function of the Thai Buddhist monastic community (*saṅgha*) will be portrayed as an organization promoting an "inequality regime." The governing structural configuration of the *saṅgha* will be presented as reinforcing social roles divided by oppressive gender conceptions. The Buddhist institution's inequality regime will be depicted in light of its refusal to ordain *bhikkhunīs*. The exclusion of Thai Buddhist nuns is situated in eight different lenses: namely, biological, ritual, scriptural, cultural, political, institutional, historical, and legal contexts. Finally, the vital sustainable core to these women is introduced as both a global and a local network of Buddhist women. This is better known as a glocalization strategy for the promotion of gender equality in Theravāda Buddhism.

The Place of Socially Engaged Buddhism in China: Emerging Religious Identity in the Local Community of Urban Shanghai

Weishan Huang
Chinese University of Hong Kong

This article aims to analyze a realization of socially engaged Buddhism outside of Buddhist monasteries in China by using the case studies of Tzu Chi Foundation. Since the 2000s, state-led religious charities have been gradually implemented among Han Buddhist monasteries in China. With a renewal of the religious idea of "Humanistic Buddhism," temples have set up guideline to conduct their charitable work. At the same time, Buddhist communities have become more diversified due to the international immigration of Buddhist groups. While social service is the central focus of Tzu Chi Foundation worldwide, I raise the question of how a global movement of moral reform and social service can help us re-think the normative account of "public engagement" in a highly regulated and censored society such as China. Based on the ethnographic work, I argue the successful structural adaption of the Tzu Chi movement corresponding with, first, the promotion of socially engaged Buddhism, which aligns with state policy and interests. Secondly, the timely change of organizational missions corresponding with the shift in social identity of urban residents from "Work Units" to "Communities" in urban Shanghai.

Burning for a Cause: Self-immolations, Human Security, and the Violence of Nonviolence in Tibet

Antonio Terrone
American Theological Library Association

In Tibetan areas of the People's Republic of China, more than 150 Tibetans have immolated themselves in the past decade to protest what they perceive as limited religious, cultural, and civil rights. Revered as national heroes in exile and compassionate human rights fighters among Euro-American audiences, Tibetan self-immolators are considered mere terrorists in China. This article brings studies in terrorism into its analysis of the Tibetan self-immolation crisis, examining the ways in which both are heightened by modern communication technology and media. Rejecting any interpretation that aligns self-immolation with suicide terrorism, I argue that although Tibetan self-immolators uphold Buddhist scriptural principles of bodhisattvic self-sacrifice, their martyrdom is nevertheless a form of violence with far ranging causes, both political and religious.

The Politics of Buddhist Relic Diplomacy Between Bangladesh and Sri Lanka

D. Mitra Barua
Cornell University

Buddhists in Chittagong, Bangladesh claim to preserve a lock of hair believed to be of Sakyamuni Buddha himself. This hair relic has become a magnet for domestic and transnational politics; as such, it made journeys to Colombo in 1960, 2007, and 2011. The states of independent Ceylon/Sri Lanka and East Pakistan/Bangladesh facilitated all three international journeys of the relic. Diplomats from both countries were involved in extending state invitations, public exchanges of the relic and a state-funded, grand scale display of the relic. This article explores the politics of such high profile diplomatic arrangements. For the Bangladeshi Buddhist minority, these international relic exchanges help them temporarily overcome their marginalized position in a predominantly Muslim society and generate religious sympathy among the

Buddhist majority in Sri Lanka. Such Buddhist fellowship and sympathy results in sponsorship for Bangladeshi Buddhist novices to attend monastic trainings in Sri Lanka and the donation of Buddhist ritual artifacts like Buddha statues, monastic robes, begging bowls, and so forth, for Buddhist institutions in Bangladesh. But how do the relic exchanges benefit the Islamic state of Bangladesh and the Sri Lankan government? That question leads to an analysis of the relic exchanges in relation to global and trans-national politics. I argue that the repeated exchanges of the relic are part and parcel of creating "good" governance images for both Sri Lankan and Bangladeshi governments for both a domestic and transnational audience respectively.

Geopolitics of Buddhism

André Laliberté
University of Ottawa

This article argues that Buddhists still lack an international organization that could help them present a unified voice the way that the World Council of Churches does for non-Catholic Christians, or the Organisation of Islamic Cooperation, for all Muslims, whether they are Sunni or Shia. There exist international organizations that claim to speak on behalf of Buddhists the world over, but they compete against each other. The basis of this competition has little to do with the differences between the Mahāyāna, Theravāda, and Vajrayāna schools, but owes a lot more to competition between Asian great powers, in particular China and India. The article will demonstrate this by first presenting an historical account of the different attempts to create a unified Buddhist international organization, along with different transnational Buddhist institutions. Then it will review the divisions that have prevented, so far, the creation of such an organization.

Prolegomenon to Thinking about Buddhist Politics

André Laliberté
University of Ottawa

Introduction to a special issue of the *Journal of Buddhist Ethics*: "Buddhism and Politics."

The Authorship of the *Vinaya* and *Abhidhamma* Commentaries: A Response to von Hinüber

Ven. Pandita (Burma)
University of Kelaniya

Von Hinüber claims in his recent article, "Early Scripture Commentary," which is included in *Brill's Encyclopedia of Buddhism*, that: (1) Buddhaghosa is the author of the commentaries on four *nikāyas*, but (2) not of other commentaries traditionally attributed to him. I agree with (1) but not with (2). On the contrary, I believe it is highly probable that the *Vinaya* and *Abhidhamma* commentaries have come from Buddhaghosa. I will give in this article the reasons for this belief.

Mindfulness and the Psychology of Ethical Dogmatism

Josef Mattes
University of Vienna

Motivated by recent controversies concerning the relationship between modern mindfulness-based interventions and Buddhism, this article discusses the relationship between mindfulness and dogmatism in

general, and dogmatism in ethics in particular. The point of view taken is primarily that of the psychology of judgment and decision making: Various cognitive illusions affect the feelings of righteousness and certainty that tend to accompany ethical and moral judgments. I argue that even though there is some evidence that mindfulness practice improves judgment and decision making, this improvement is rarely as strong as is implied in various contributions to the above-mentioned controversies. In addition, I reflect on claims that "the original teachings of the Buddha" justify the moral stances taken. I argue that these stances likely arise, at least in part, due to the cultural transmission of cognitive dissonance of early Christianity rather than being inherent in the Buddha's teachings.

The *Atipada* Problem in Buddhist Meta-Ethics

Gordon F. Davis
Carleton University

We can express a wide range of objections to philosophical views by saying a view "goes too far"; but there is a more specific pitfall, which opens up when a philosopher seeks to generalize some form of anti-realism in such a way that it must itself be pronounced groundless or incoherent by its own standards. In cases where this self-stultification looks impossible to overcome without revising the view in question, it can be called the *atipada*problem. Signifying a risk of "overstepping," this Sanskrit label reflects a particular relevance to Mahāyāna ethicists who seek to enlarge the scope of compassion by enlarging the meaning of emptiness (*śūnyatā*) to the point where all truths and ideals are pronounced ultimately empty, and likewise, at least ipso facto, the ideal of compassion itself. This incarnation of the problem is left unresolved by several recent defenders of Madhyamaka ethics, as well as by one recent interpreter of Vasubandhu; meanwhile, some Buddhist ethicists who try to avoid theorizing at this "ultimate" level run into the same general problem nonetheless. More than a specialized meta-ethical puzzle, this problem threatens to undermine central Buddhist ideals in precisely those contexts where philosophical ethics is invoked to vindicate them; however, rather than disposing us to foreswear meta-ethics in an attempt to avoid the problematic views in question, the problem should lead us to expand the scope of Buddhist meta-ethics.

Prison and the Pure Land: A Buddhist Chaplain in Occupied Japan

Melissa Anne-Marie Curley
Ohio State University

In November 1945, the United States military took over the use of Tokyo's Sugamo Prison in order to house those charged by the Allied Powers with war crimes. For close to three years, Hanayama Shinshō served as the prison's volunteer Buddhist chaplain, attending thirty-six executions. Hanayama did not protest the imposition of the death penalty but this essay argues that in his work as chaplain he nonetheless resisted the carceral logic shaping life and death inside Sugamo by mobilizing the ritual and narrative repertoire of Pure Land Buddhism. In Hanayama's framing, Sugamo was a site of liberation as well as confinement, affording the condemned a unique opportunity to reflect upon the past and commit themselves to a different future, even in death. As Hanayama tells it, the peace discovered by the dead was an absolute peace, transcending politics; he also insists, however, on a connection between this absolute peace and the ordinary peace that the living might hope to secure. The article concludes with a consideration of the political and ethical implications of Hanayama's reading of the dead as having "found peace" in light of larger

conversations about how best to remember—or forget—the nation's dark past, and what it means to share responsibility for crimes against humanity.

Beyond Precepts in Conceptualizing Buddhist Leadership
Phra Nicholas Thanissaro
University of Warwick
Monastic *saṅgha* members may be seen as monopolizing leadership in traditional forms of Buddhism. The usual Theravādin justification for this is that monastics keep a greater number of precepts than laypeople and therefore provide a higher standard of ethical leadership as well as being symbols of their religion. Such allocation of authority to monks breaks down where the monastic-lay distinction blurs. This article presents a review of the literature of anthropological and attitude research findings to explore how the demand for alternative modes of leadership, such as charismatic, visionary, servant, facilitative, strategic, or participative leadership or management, has opened up opportunities for lay people to take more prominent roles in Buddhist leadership in Western Buddhism as well as contemporary Asian contexts.

Who Are the *Chabbaggiya* Monks and Nuns?
Ven. Pandita (Burma)
University of Kelaniya
Modern scholarship has chosen to treat the *chabbaggiya* monks and nuns, commonly found in *Vinaya* narratives, as of fictitious nature. In this article, I argue against this modern contention.

Is a Buddhist Praxis Possible?
Charles R. Strain
DePaul University
The question that forms the title of this essay may well evoke an instant response: "Of course, why not?" This answer assumes a vague and quite elastic understanding of praxis. Latin American Liberation theologians saw praxis, to the contrary, as arising from a dialectic of critical reflection and practice. Following the example of Liberation Theology, this article argues the thesis that the pieces of the puzzle of an adequate critical reflection on *Buddhist* praxis exist but they have yet to be put together into a Buddhist theory of political transformation akin to any number of Liberation Theologies. The following definition of praxis serves as a heuristic device to examine engaged Buddhist theoretical contributions to a Buddhist praxis: *Praxis is action that is: (1) symbolically constituted; (2) historically situated; (3) critically mediated by a social theory; and (4) strategically and politically directed.* After examining each of these components in turn, the article concludes by asking what might be the "vehicle" of a distinctively Buddhist praxis.

Foxes, Yetis, and Bulls as Lamas: Human-Animal Interactions as a Resource for Exploring Buddhist Ethics in Sikkim
Kalzang Dorjee Bhutia
Occidental College
Sikkimese Bhutia language oral traditions feature an abundance of stories related to human-animal interactions. In order to begin to critically consider the significance of these interactions, this article will engage with these oral traditions and what they can tell us about local traditions of Buddhist ethics. Although

some of these tales seem anthropocentric because humans overpower and outwit animals, others are more ambiguous. In this ethical universe, foxes, yetis, and magical bulls all act as agents and, at times, religious teachers, reminding humans of the Buddhist theme of interconnectedness in their interactions with the environment. This article is a starting point for considering how such tales can act as a rich resource for negotiating ambiguous forms of ecocentrism in local Buddhist practice and narrative in the Eastern Himalayas.

Language, Reality, Emptiness, Laughs
Soraj Hongladarom
Chulalongkorn University
Laughter, especially in connection with philosophy, reality, or language, is not much discussed in the vast literature of Buddhism. In the few places where it is discussed, however, there are two strands. On the one hand, laughter is frowned upon when it is seen as an attraction that leads one astray from the path. This is evident in the *Tālapuṭa Sūtra*, where the Buddha says that actors and comedians would find it very difficult to enter the Path. It is also found in the *Vinaya*, where the emphasis is on the proper behavior of monks. The Buddha often rebukes monks who laugh out loud in the villages where householders can see them. The other strand views laughter more positively. This strand is found more in the Mahāyāna literature, where the Buddha laughs when he realizes emptiness, that nothing is substantial. The attitude of Buddhism toward laughter is conditional. Laughter and playfulness have a soteriological role to play as a skillful means, and Buddhism is not always serious.

The Ruination of a Dead Nun's Stupa: Does This Really Evince the Suppression of Nuns?
Ven. Pandita (Burma)
University of Kelaniya
It is firstly Horner, and later Schopen, who have expressed negative opinions on a story in the *Vinaya*. I argue, however, that the aforesaid story, at least its Pāli version, is not so bad as it sounds if we interpret it properly.

Volume 26 (2019)

A Comparative Analysis of Sustainability Views across the Saemaul Movement in South Korea and the Sarvodaya Shramadana Movement in Sri Lanka
Jungho Suh
University of Adelaide
This article compares and contrasts the Saemaul Movement in South Korea and the Sarvodaya Shramadana Movement in Sri Lanka. The article identifies and polarizes sustainability views played out from each of the two rural development movements, making use of content and discourse analysis techniques. Although the two movements commonly emphasize the mobilization of human resources available in rural villages, both are premised on contested sustainability views. The Saemaul Movement has been driven by a solely growth-oriented developmentalism and has strived for affluent rural villages whereas the Sarvodaya Shramadana Movement has been guided by a Buddhist ethic and has pursued a "no-poverty and no-affluence" society.

The former is hardly concerned with the ecological dimension of sustainability, while the latter is very concerned about it. The former tends to risk eroding social capital whereas the latter weighs the overriding importance of social capital. The Sarvodaya Shramadana Movement recognizes interdependence between the economic, ecological, and social dimensions of sustainability, and also endeavors to put a holistic sustainability view into practice.

Buddhism and Capital Punishment: A Revisitation
Martin Kovan
University of Melbourne
The first Buddhist precept prohibits the intentional, even sanctioned, taking of life. However, capital punishment remains legal, and even increasingly applied, in some culturally Buddhist polities and beyond them. The classical Buddhist norm of unconditional compassion as a counterforce to such punishment thus appears insufficient to oppose it. This article engages classical Buddhist and Western argument for and against capital punishment, locating a Buddhist refutation of deterrent and Kantian retributivist grounds for it not only in Nāgārjunian appeals to compassion, but also the metaphysical and moral constitution of the agent of lethal crime, and thereby the object of its moral consequences.

The Experience of *Dukkha* and *Domanassa* among *Puthujjanas*
Ashin Sumanacara
Mahidol University
In the Pāli canon, the terms *dukkha* and *domanassa* are used with reference to different types and degrees of suffering that must be understood according to context. This article first examines the meaning of *puthujjana* in the Pāli *Nikāyas*. It then analyses the contextual meanings of *dukkha* and *domanassa*, including a discussion of their types based on a thorough investigation of the Pāli *Nikāyas*. Finally, it examines the explanation in the Pāli *Nikāyas* of the arising of *dukkha* and *domanassa*, and, in particular, how lust, hatred, delusion and some other negative emotions are considered to cause physical pain and mental pain among *puthujjanas*.

Sexual Misconduct in Early Buddhist Ethics: A New Approach
Ven. Pandita (Burma)
University of Kelaniya
In this article, I argue that (1) rape is not covered by the concept of sexual misconduct prohibited by the Third Precept of the universal Five Precepts morality in Buddhism; and (2) many problematic issues surrounding this precept go away when we interpret it in this way.

Western Buddhism in the Local Context of the Russian Federation: The Case of the Russian Association of Diamond Way Buddhists of the Karma Kagyu Tradition
Valentina Isaeva
Saint-Petersburg State University
How Buddhist organizations adapt to new environments appears to be the key question defining their activities and the possibility that they will attract new followers. This article considers the case of the Russian Association of Diamond Way Buddhists of the Karma Kagyu tradition in the context of the social and cultural milieu of the Russian Federation. In particular, it looks at significant features of historical development and

legislative regulation of the religious sphere in Russia and how Diamond Way as a Western Buddhist organization has implemented culture politics to correlate its ethics with the local environment and to create cultural coherence with the broader Russian society. The research explicates four main guidelines of the culture politics of Diamond Way: (1) integration into the sociocultural environment of the city and the country; (2) assertion of its traditionality on the territory of the Russian Federation; (3) political neutrality in the public sphere; and (4) a variety of leadership styles.

Disengaged Buddhism
Amod Lele
Boston University
Contemporary engaged Buddhist scholars typically claim either that Buddhism always endorsed social activism, or that its non-endorsement of such activism represented an unwitting lack of progress. This article examines several classical South Asian Buddhist texts that explicitly reject social and political activism. These texts argue for this rejection on the grounds that the most important sources of suffering are not something that activism can fix, and that political involvement interferes with the tranquility required for liberation. The article then examines the history of engaged Buddhism in order to identify why this rejection of activism has not yet been taken sufficiently seriously.

The Global Refugee Crisis and the Gift of Fearlessness
Christina A. Kilby
James Madison University
This article is a critical-constructive application of the Buddhist ethical concept of the gift of fearlessness (*abhayadāna*) to the global refugee crisis and to nativist policy responses. Investigating classical South Asian literary sources on the gift of fearlessness, typically glossed as the offer of refuge or protection to those in danger, I present today's refugee as situated at the nexus of two types of fear: the fear that drives vulnerable people to flee from harm and the fear that drives a potential refuge-offering state to close its borders or build walls. I argue that the gift of fearlessness, if extended beyond its classical scope to include the challenges of xenophobia and terrorism threats, is a capacious framework through which to probe the moral contours of contemporary refugee policy and the security concerns of states.

Volume 27 (2020)

Can an Evil Person Attain Rebirth in the Pure Land? Ethical and Soteriological Issues in the Pure Land Thought of Peng Shaosheng (1740-1796)
Hongyu Wu
Ohio Northern University
In Pure Land literature in China, it is not uncommon to find accounts about morally flawed or evil persons attaining rebirth in the Pure Land. The rebirth of evil persons in the Pure Land, in fact, is an issue that can work both for and against Pure Land proponents. On the one hand, the soteriological inclusiveness of evil persons can be employed by promoters to prioritize Pure Land belief and practice over other forms of

Buddhist thought and practice. On the other hand, belief in the saving power of Amitābha Buddha might discourage people from doing good or, even worse, legitimize evil behavior—a point that critics both within and outside the Buddhist community were quick to point out. The moral failures of Pure Land practitioners surely garnered criticism and hostility that were directed both toward the individual and toward the Pure Land teachings—and, as Pure Land beliefs and practices in China were not sectarian, the misconducts of the Pure Land practitioners could eventually damage the reputation of the whole Buddhist community. This article focuses on Peng Shaosheng, a Confucian literatus turned Buddhist layman and a prominent advocate of Pure Land practice, to examine how he employed a syncretic approach by drawing on concepts such as karmic retribution, sympathetic resonance (*ganying*), no-good (*wushan*), and ultimate good (*zhishan*) to develop a scheme that neither denied the saving power of Amitābha Buddha and supremacy of Pure Land practice nor endorsed "licensed evil."

The Buddha versus Popper: When to Live?

Jongjin Kim
Korea University
Rohit Parikh
The Graduate Center and Brooklyn College, City University of New York

We discuss two approaches to life: presentism and futurism. We locate presentism within various elements of Buddhism, in the form of advice to live in the present and not to allow the future to hinder us from living in the ever present now. By contrast, futurism, which we identify with Karl Popper, advises us to think of future consequences before we act, and to act now for a better future. Of course, with its emphasis on a well-defined path to an ideal future ideally culminating in enlightenment, Buddhism undoubtedly has elements of futurism as well. We do not intend to determine which of these two approaches to time is more dominant in Buddhism, nor how the two approaches are best understood within Buddhism; but simply we intend to compare and contrast these two approaches, using those presentist elements of Buddhism as representative of presentism while contrasting them with those elements of futurism to be found in Popper and others. We will discuss various aspects of presentism and futurism, such as Ruth Millikan's Popperian animal, the psychologist Howard Rachlin's social and temporal discounting, and even the popular but controversial idea, YOLO (you only live once). The primary purpose of this article is to contrast one with the other. The central question of ethics is: How should one live? Our variation on that question is: When should one live? We conjecture that the notion of flow, developed by Csikszentmihalyi, may be a better optimal choice between these two positions.

The *Saṃgha* and the Taxman: A Tibetan Regent's Economic Reforms and the Ethics of Rulership

William K. Dewey
Rubin Museum of Art

This article examines how Tibetan Buddhists believed a state should be governed justly by considering the political agenda of the regent Ngawang Tsültrim (1721–1791) and how he was influenced by the Indian *nītiśāstra* tradition and similar indigenous traditions of ethical rule. *Nītiśāstra* originally, under Kauṭilya, promoted wealth and power. Later proponents (both Hindu and Buddhist) more strongly emphasized the primacy of *Dharma* and justice for the poor, and in this form it most influenced Tibetan Buddhist political thought, including the legislative decrees of Ngawang Tsültrim. He tried to relieve the Tibetan peasants from

the heavy tax and labor obligations of the Tibetan social system and otherwise pursued economic justice. In so doing, he also wanted to ensure that resources continued to flow to the *Saṃgha*, the supreme field of merit. Accordingly, the decrees targeted aristocratic rather than monastic corruption. They prioritized the maintenance and reform of existing economic obligations over economic development or redistribution of wealth. Ngawang Tsültrim's decrees demonstrate a tension within the *nītiśāstra* tradition which can also be found when today's religions (including socially engaged Buddhism) pursue goals of social justice. These goals may conflict with the goal of spreading the faith, and especially with the social and financial structures that support religious institutions but may be responsible for social ills.

Violent Karma Stories in Contemporary Sinhala Buddhism

James Stewart
Deakin University

Buddhism is a religion normally respected for its message of non-violence. In this article I will discuss how images of violence are used as a means to compel Buddhists to act in accordance with Buddhist ethical principles. This will be shown through the examination of a contemporary newsarticle series from the popular Sinhala language *Lankādīpa Irida* periodical. In it, we find a series of karma stories that illustrate how examples of violence can be found in modern Buddhistic narratives, both in written and pictorial forms. In this article it will be argued that these modern narratives have a precedent in much earlier, and in some cases ancient, Buddhist writings and art. I will argue that these modern narratives deviate from canonical karma stories in that they focus on the maturation of karma in this life while the former focus on the afterlife. The purpose of these modern stories is to assure the reader of the reality of karma and to entertain the reader with gruesome stories that feature the death of moral transgressors.

Tilling the Fields of Merit: The Institutionalization of Feminine Enlightenment in Tibet's First Khenmo Program

Jue Liang and Andrew S. Taylor
University of Virginia

This article documents the history and social effects of the khenmo (*mkhan mo*) program at Larung Gar (*Bla rung sgar*), the first institution in Tibet to systematically grant nuns advanced Buddhist degrees. We argue that Jigme Phuntsok (*'Jigs med phun tshogs*, 1933-2004), Larung's founder, started the program in hopes of challenging the public perception of women as incapable of advanced learning. Legitimating nuns as a field of merit for donors represented an important step in his larger project of changing the status of nuns and women in Tibetan society more generally. We begin with a brief history of Larung, demonstrating how Jigme Phuntsok's singular vision of gender equality in Buddhist education and practice led to the arrival of thousands of nuns to his small encampment. We proceed to give an overview of the khenmo program, including its curriculum and degree requirements. We conclude with an examination of the social effects of the khenmo movement, exploring how the presence of educated nuns is changing both women's self-understandings of their own practice and lay attitudes toward women's religious capacities.

Climate Justice: Some Challenges for Buddhist Ethics

Simon P. James
Durham University

It has often been suggested that the Buddhist teachings can help us to meet the moral challenges posed by the climate crisis. This article, by contrast, addresses some challenges the topic of climate justice presents for Buddhist ethics. Two arguments to the effect that Buddhist ethics is incompatible with calls for climate justice are considered and rejected. It is then argued that for Buddhists such calls must nonetheless take second place to the paramount concern with overcoming suffering.

True Love for the Artificial? Toward the Possibility of Bodhisattva Relations with Machines

Thomas H. Doctor
Kathmandu University Centre for Buddhist Studies at Rangjung Yeshe Institute

Given our increasing interaction with artificial intelligence and immersion in virtual reality, which epistemic and moral attitudes towards virtual beings might we think proper, relevant, and fulfilling? That is the basic question that this article wishes to raise. For the main part, it presents a descriptive analysis of our current situation, which is meant to expose features of artificial intelligence (AI) and virtual reality (VR) that seem both salient and easily aligned with central Buddhist concerns. Developed without any requirement for, or expectation of, the existence of real subjects and selves, Buddhist views and practices clearly resonate with the assumptions of unreal mind and mere appearance that are associated with AI and VR. Yet Buddhists famously also declare that the illusion-like nature of things does not negate, but in fact entails, universal care and deep meaning. I conclude by suggesting that such doctrinal claims may be tested for practical relevance in the present and emerging world of interconnectivity and illusion.

Volume 28 (2021)

Is Buddhism Individualistic? The Trouble with a Term

Donna Lynn Brown
University of Manitoba

Western scholars have been calling expressions of Buddhism "individualistic"—or denying the charge—since the 1800s. This article argues that "individualism" and related terms are sometimes problematic when applied to Buddhism. Because they are associated with Western modernity, they contribute to hegemonic discourses about Asia and Buddhism, skew representations, and reinforce stereotypes. Because their referents have been many and varied—including escaping caste and family, asociality, lay practice, and racism—their use leads to imprecision, confusion, and lack of comparability among analyses. And because they have moral connotations, they can blend observation with valuation and polemic. The article examines selected scholarly works that maintain or deny that Buddhism is individualistic, highlights problems associated with the term, and concludes that, in many cases, more precise and less value-laden descriptors should be found.

Coronavirus and Ill-fated Crowns: Buddhist Lessons in Pandemics and Politics

Alexander McKinley
Loyola University Chicago

Synthesizing three retellings of the story about the Buddha curing a plague in the ancient city of Vesāli, this article argues that lessons from the narrative can help us analyze the modern coronavirus pandemic and critique political responses to it. From the ancient Pāli commentary of Buddhaghosa to Sinhala vernacular retellings by a medieval monk named Buddhaputra and a colonial-era layman named Vijēvikrama, the critical force of the story has seemingly grown over time. Along the way, these authors emphasize how the endless expansion of the city due to the material desires of its rulers was bound to exacerbate suffering by their grasping at impermanent forms. This philosophical insight is applicable to current problems, where the limitless materialism of global capitalism has also been overextended, altering climates and ecologies to generate new pathogens like the coronavirus. Countries that promised uninterrupted economic growth during the pandemic have in turn suffered its worst consequences. The story of Vesāli therefore remains ripe for many more retellings in the modern world, teaching that attention to a higher ideal of transcendent truth is more fruitful than material enrichment alone.

Aesthetic Emotions: The Existential and Soteriological Value of *Saṃvega/Pasāda* in Early Buddhism

Lisa Liang and Brianna K. Morseth
Dharma Realm Buddhist University

Across the globe, our continued existence in light of present conditions is uncertain. Rapid spread of disease and risk of complications endanger the human population. Such challenging circumstances may shock and devastate us, inducing mass panic and pandemonium amid the pervasive threat of pandemic. Yet according to Buddhist philosophy, existential unease can also spawn deep transformation. In this article, we examine a pair of aesthetic emotions (*saṃvega/pasāda*) from the early Buddhist tradition that together hold the potential to induce critical reflection and productive engagement in response to existential threat. By referring to *saṃvega/pasāda* as aesthetic emotions, we intend to draw out their distinctive, often visually-oriented soteriological function. While initially disorienting and perhaps even paralyzing, *saṃvega* and *pasāda* are ultimately reorienting and motivating factors on the path to liberation from the suffering entailed by cyclic existence.

Living with the Mountain: Mountain Propitiation Rituals in the Making of Human-Environmental Ethics in Sikkim

Kalzang Dorjee Bhutia
University of California Los Angeles

In 2019, a debate erupted in the eastern Himalayan Indian state of Sikkim over whether the Indian Government should allow climbers to attempt to summit Mount Kanchenjunga, the world's third highest mountain, located on the western border of Sikkim and Nepal. For local communities in Sikkim, Kanchendzonga, as the mountain is known, is seen as the protector deity of the land and its human and nonhuman inhabitants. Summiting him is considered deeply disrespectful. Ritual and textual traditions in contemporary west Sikkim provide insight into how local Buddhists create and reaffirm their relationship with Kanchendzonga and provide context for understanding the 2019 debates. These traditions outline

appropriate ethical behavior and function pedagogically to demonstrate how the mountain and humans have historically engaged in forms of reciprocal care, healing, and protection, and how they can continue to do so, thereby ensuring a generative future for all of Sikkim's transdimensional residents.

On Pāli *Vinaya* Conceptions of Sex and Precedents for Transgender Ordination
Brenna Grace Artinger
Independent Scholar
In this article I evaluate ideas of sex and behavior in Pāli *Vinaya* texts in order to better understand the roles of such terms and their consequences on monastic inclusion. I then contend with the ramifications of such terms on present-day considerations of ordination for transgender individuals, and the ways in which Vinaya texts provide legal precedent for such possibilities.

Buddhist Ethics as Moral Phenomenology: A Defense and Development of the Theory
Colin Simonds
Queen's University at Kingston
This article defends and develops the categorization of Buddhist ethics as moral phenomenology. It first examines the use of the term in Western philosophical settings and compares it to how the term is employed in Buddhist settings. After concluding that Western ethical comportment and Buddhist moral phenomenology are commensurate terms, it explores how moral phenomenology has been understood in Buddhist contexts and considers the evidence scholars have used to make this interpretation. The article then looks to the Tibetan Buddhist tradition for further evidence of a moral phenomenological approach to Buddhist ethics and analyzes further proof of this interpretation. Finally, issues that emerge from a moral phenomenological approach to ethics are addressed from a Tibetan Buddhist perspective to strengthen this interpretation and offer moral phenomenology as a viable alternative ethical system.

Aquinas and Mipham on Military and Punitive Violence: A Tribute to Michael Jerryson
Damien Keown
Goldsmiths, University of London (*Emeritus*)
The claim that Buddhism is exclusively a "religion of peace" has been shown to be untenable. Buddhism now faces the challenge of explaining how the pacifist spirit of its teachings can be reconciled with its well-documented recourse to military and punitive violence. Buddhism is not the only religion to face this challenge, and we first consider the Christian stance on violence as formulated by St. Thomas Aquinas before turning to the views of the Tibetan polymath Jamgön Mipham. We consider to what extent the views of the two thinkers are compatible and conclude with a suggestion as to how what Michael Jerryson calls "the quandary of Buddhism and violence" might be resolved.

Volume 29 (2022)

Collapsing Space and Time: Thich Nhat Hanh's Ecological Humanism
Victor Thasiah
California Lutheran University
Identifying with non-human organisms, such as flora and fauna, and non-living members of the natural world, such as winds and clouds, was central to Thich Nhat Hanh's (1926–2022) practice of Buddhism and conduct of resistance during the Vietnam War. This deep affinity with nature enabled him to "become himself" and sustain his public service and humanitarian work under duress. We examine Nhat Hanh's extended accounts of identifying with the natural world during the war, relevant material from his 1962–1966 memoirs and 1963 poem "Butterflies over the Golden Mustard Fields." They set out what we call his ecological humanism, his paradoxical overcoming of self-alienation through a close rapport with relatively wild nature. With no critical biography yet available, this focused, ecocritical interpretation, the first of its kind on Nhat Hanh during this major period, contributes to a better sense of the making of this global Buddhist influencer, who at the time was nominated by Martin Luther King, Jr. for the Nobel Peace Prize.

Taking Animals Seriously: Shabkar's Narrative Argument for Vegetarianism and the Ethical Treatment of Animals
Rachel H. Pang
Davidson College
Shabkar Tsokdruk Rangdrol's (1781-1851) collected works present one of the most sustained treatments of vegetarianism and animal ethics in Tibetan literature. His arguments for vegetarianism adopt two main formats: philosophical prose and narrative. In this essay, I analyze Shabkar's implicit argument for vegetarianism and the ethical treatment of animals in the narrative passages of his autobiography that describe his interactions with animals. By including animals as significant interlocutors in his autobiography, Shabkar reframes the relationship between animals and humans to be less anthropocentric and more based on the ideal of impartiality (*phyogs ris med pa*). In turn, this serves as an implicit narrative argument for the adoption of a vegetarian diet. This mode of argumentation differs from the majority of arguments for vegetarianism in Tibetan Buddhist literature which tend to be more philosophical in nature. Shabkar's narrative mode of argument is an example of the "act of social imagination" first identified by Charles Hallisey and Anne Hansen in South and Southeast Asian Buddhist narratives. These types of narratives cultivate an ethical ideal in an audience by prompting the audience into an "act of social imagination" that in turn forms the foundation for moral agency.

Principles for Jōdo Shinshū Social Engagement
Jeff Wilson
Renison University College, University of Waterloo
Despite omission from much of the record of scholarship on Engaged Buddhism, Jōdo Shinshū Buddhism has significant potential for positive involvement with social causes. Here I propose six principles based on elements of the Jōdo Shinshū teachings that might inspire or inform efforts at reducing harm in the world.

I further provide some examples of social engagement from Jōdo Shinshū history that demonstrate how they might be applied.

Ethos of the Great Perfection: Continual Mindfulness According to Patrul's Foundational Manual
Marc-Henri Deroche
Kyoto University
This article investigates the role of mindfulness in the so-called foundational practices exposed in Dza Patrul Orgyan Jigme Chökyi Wangpo's (1808–1887) famous manual, *Words of My Perfect Teacher*, which belongs to the Dzogchen lineage of the *Heart Essence of the Vast Expanse* within the Nyingma tradition of Tibetan Buddhism. It argues that, according to these spiritual instructions, the continual exercise of mindfulness, meta-awareness, and carefulness forms the "ethos of the Great Perfection"—the constant ethical base and the consistent way of life that supports the path of Dzogchen. Sources of *Words of My Perfect Teacher* (including Śāntideva's *Bodhicaryāvatāra*) and selected passages are analyzed in order to elucidate Patrul's moral philosophy of mindful awareness and self-examination. The mnemonic, reflective, and attentional facets of the cultivation of mindfulness all work to internalize the ethical principles that govern the conduct of life, shaping new habits, exercising free will, and forming moral agency. They define the very ethos that articulates the value system and the re-orientation of attention. Such deliberate moment-by-moment mindfulness paves the way for discovering "instantaneous awareness," the distinctive feature of Dzogchen, and for resting in its uninterrupted flow, from within to respond compassionately to other individuals and various circumstances.

Volume 30 (2023)

Beyond Queen and King: Democratizing "Engaged Buddhism"
Donna Lynn Brown
University of Manitoba
What counts as Buddhist social engagement? Why, in Buddhist Studies, do certain forms of engagement and certain Buddhists often not count? This article argues that the limits that scholars Christopher S. Queen and Sallie B. King placed around Buddhist engagement in the 1990s—limits that produced a rough consensus in Buddhist Studies—should be democratized to include all Buddhists and their social engagement. For years, criticism of these limits and research that circumvents them have appeared without seriously undermining them. However, 2022 may mark a turning point. In that year, two publications, by Paul Fuller and Alexander Hsu, offered comprehensive and convincing arguments for considering all Buddhists' socially oriented activities "engaged." This article examines the consensus on the nature of Buddhist engagement, its origins in activism, research that dissents from it, and critiques it has faced. The article assesses dissent and critiques and considers why, until recently, they have had little effect. It then discusses why Fuller's and Hsu's publications represent a turning point and proposes new areas of research beyond those even these two scholars suggest.

Engaged Buddhism at Sixty-Five: Nuancing The Consensus

Christopher Queen
Harvard University

After more than 65 years of public activism and social service by engaged Buddhists in Asia and the West, it is time to reconsider the nature of engaged Buddhism and how faithfully it has been represented by scholars. In "Beyond Queen and King: Democratizing 'Engaged Buddhism,'" Donna Lynn Brown argues that the category should be expanded to include "overlooked Buddhists" who may have traditional, ethnic, national, state-supported, or conservative orientations; those who perform social service; and those who engage in violence. Furthermore, Brown claims that engaged Buddhism is a narrative imposed by Western scholars on Asian Buddhists who may not know or approve of it. In this response, I will focus on three characteristics of engaged Buddhism that Brown and other scholars she cites have misunderstood or rejected in their critique: (1) the practice of compassionate service by engaged Buddhists; (2) the commitment of engaged Buddhists to nonviolent social change; and (3) the decentralized, hybrid, and evolving nature of engaged Buddhist ideology and praxis which reflects the contribution of voices and values from Asia and the West.

Are Ethnocentric/Nationalist Buddhists Engaged Buddhists? Certainly Not.

Sallie B. King
James Madison University

This is a brief response to Donna Lynn Brown's article, "Beyond Queen and King: Democratizing 'Engaged Buddhism'," (*Journal of Buddhist Ethics* Vol. 30, 2023) and indirectly to others who have argued that ethnocentric and/or nationalist Buddhism could be a part of Engaged Buddhism. To this question, I will argue that this is not possible. Secondarily, I take up the question of the "oneness" of Engaged Buddhism.

***Lta sgom spyod gsum*: A Tibetan Approach to Moral Phenomenological Praxis**

Colin H. Simonds
Queen's University at Kingston

This article unpacks the Tibetan framework of *lta sgom spyod gsum*, or view, meditation, action, and relates it to the Buddhist ethical project of moral phenomenology. It first investigates how the framework has been defined and used both descriptively and practically in Tibetan primary texts. It then nuances this usage by identifying key aspects of its deployment in Tibetan contexts, including how view is prioritized among the three limbs, how the unity of view and action is the intended fruition of practice, and how there is a specific order of operations in its implementation. This article then relates *lta sgom spyod gsum* directly to the ethical project of moral phenomenology and demonstrates how it can be mobilized as the practical arm of this unique¬ly Buddhist ethical theory. Thus, this article presents a robust reading of *lta sgom spyod gsum* in Tibetan Buddhist contexts, contributes to the ongoing development of the ethical theory of moral phenomenology, and provides further avenues for engaging the Tibetan Buddhist ethical tradition with the moral issues facing us today.

"Meditation Sickness" in Medieval Chinese Buddhism and the Contemporary West

C. Pierce Salguero
The Abington College of Penn State University

A certain percentage of people report experiencing adverse mental and physical side effects from practicing meditation. Contemporary scientific literature and personal reports from meditators are beginning to document the phenomenon, but centuries-old Buddhist texts also warned about the dangers of "meditation sickness." Writings from medieval China not only identify the adverse mental and physical symptoms that can arise in the course of meditation practice, but also explain why these occur and how they can be effectively treated. Might these materials contain important therapeutic in-formation that is relevant for meditators today? What would be required to make this historical knowledge accessible for contemporary practitioners and clinicians? And do our disciplinary norms as religious studies scholars even allow us to ask such questions?

Legal Reasoning About Displacement and Responsibility: A Dialogue Between the Buddhist Monastic Discipline and IHL

Christina A. Kilby
James Madison University

Civilian displacement is a common consequence of armed conflict with grave humanitarian implications. In this article, I analyze Buddhist codes of monastic discipline in order to illuminate how these legal traditions have reasoned about the significance of home and the harms of displacement. I then bring my findings into conversation with the legal reasoning that international humanitarian law (IHL) requires of parties to armed conflict whose decisions may result in displacement of civilians. I argue that both IHL and the Buddhist monastic codes take into account responsibility for the causes of harm, for direct harm, and for the reverberating fallout of harm. By exploring the ethical values and reasoning habits that these two traditions hold in common, Buddhist actors—in military and civil society—may strengthen their commitment to prevent displacement and to protect displaced people and their hosts during times of conflict.

The Missing and Their Families: Buddhism and the Role of Ritual in Processing Grief and Ambiguous Loss

Alex Wakefield
Independent Scholar

This article considers the support that Buddhist ritual practices may offer families and relatives of missing people. Families of missing individuals experience a specifically defined form of grief known as ambiguous loss. Such loss is usually denied the traditional funerary or commemorative practices of other forms of bereavement. Nevertheless, psychologists and humanitarian organizations stress the importance of such practices and their socio-cultural context as a way for families to effectively process ambiguous loss. I highlight the value in these practices coming from Buddhist religious groups within Buddhist communities, while noting that disappearances often present exceptionally difficult circumstances for many religious traditions, including Buddhism. Examples are drawn from the Pāli *Nikāyas* supporting the argument for a "reconfiguration" of ritual to meet these needs, and case studies are cited to demonstrate religious communities supporting, via ritual practices, families of missing individuals. I therefore propose

ritual as an element of Buddhist praxis that may effectively address the psychological and social requirements for families of missing people.

The Function and Contemporary Role of *sikkhāpaccakkhāna* (Abandoning the Training Rules) in the Pāli Canon
Chandima Gangodawila
Ronin Institute
This article examines the intricacies of abandoning the monastic training rules (*sikkhāpaccakkhāna*) in key Pāli *sūtta* and *Vinaya* texts to better understand how these textual sources, in addition to early modern Sri Lankan monastics as well as the contemporary *saṅgha*, have understood the abandonment of the training rules not as a spiritual failure, but rather as a set of pragmatic monastic principles that emphasize the retention of monkhood and the continuity of the *Buddhasāsana*. To demonstrate this, I propose an innovative approach to examining the first *pārājika* (concerning sexual intercourse) in relation to the *sikkhāpaccakkhāna* by considering Pāli *sūttas*, *Vinaya* texts, and the example of noncelibate seventeenth-century Laṅkān *gaṇinnānse* (non-*bhikkhu* monks). I conclude by arguing that the contemporary Sri Lankan *saṅgha* can use *sikkhāpaccakkhāna* to avoid falling into the first *pārājika*, which provides a basis for reordination and thus a more human-centered framework for supporting the stability and duration of the *Buddhasāsana*.

Indian Traditionalism in Eihei Dōgen's *Shoaku makusa*
Victor Forte
Albright College
Eihei Dōgen's *Shōbōgenzō* fascicle *Shoaku makusa* ("Not Producing Evil"), was presented during the early period of his career, while leading a small group of monastic and lay followers at the Kōshōji temple in Kyoto. Derived from the early Buddhist universal precept and inspired by the Indian ideal of bodhisattvic moral freedom within the *dharmadhātu*, this work primarily served as a corrective for antinomian inherent awakening doctrine. The ethical implications of this corrective are best understood in the context of Indian Mahāyāna philosophy, an often-overlooked influence on Dōgen's thought. Not only are such influences to be found in the *Shoaku makusa* fascicle, but throughout Dōgen's career, in earlier works like the *Shōbōgenzō zuimonki*, and later fascicles like *Sanjūshichihon bodaibunpō*, "The Thirty-seven Factors of Awakening," and *Hotsu bodaishin*, "Raising the Mind of Enlightenment," which were also concerned with the meaning of moral practice from an Indian Buddhist standpoint.

Volume 31 (2024)

Phases of the Buddhist Approach to the Environment
Johannes Cairns
University of Helsinki
Various typologies of Buddhist ecophilosophies have been proposed but they have overlooked temporal dynamics and the relationship between beliefs and practice. I address this research gap by proposing a

three-tier diachronic scheme. The first premodern phase featured a mixed bag of attitudes and behaviors in relation to ecology, with some being supportive of environmental ethics and others subversive. The second phase arose with the early counterculture environmental movement and consisted of ecophilosophies and activism with limited influence. The third phase started in the mid-1990s with political acknowledgement of the ecocrisis and has gained momentum. It consists of global adoption of ecophilosophies and environmental practices, including conservative Asian organizations, and new radical ecology. The dynamics indicate that a tradition of accommodating to prevailing political paradigms may have obstructed Buddhist environmentalism in the past but could facilitate it in the future.

From Metaphors to Life in Tibetan Settlements and Back Again: Space, an Important Factor for Resilient Response to the Suffering Caused by Armed Conflict

Diane Denis
Rangjung Yeshe Institute, Katmandu University

This article is concerned with the interface between Buddhism and humanitarian principles in the context of the forced displacement of civilians due to armed conflict. It seeks to highlight how humanitarian activities can be informed by a resilience-oriented language and by its landscape of dignity. At issue are not only the repercussions of wartime violence, but also the problems of how we conceive the harm done and its effects, and how we account (or not) for resilient responses. By drawing on the spiritual, philosophical, and psychological insights of Tibetan Buddhist textual traditions, some effects of violations of international humanitarian law (IHL) are addressed. Inspired by Lewis's ethnographic research in Tibetan settlements, this article focuses on the metaphor of space and related life-enhancing "technologies." In so doing, it also contributes to the discussions over some of the potential problems with the trauma/victim narrative as addressed by sociologist Fassin. The main aim is to contribute to scholarly discussions on forced displacement, and to inform aid agencies and policy-makers who can contribute to lessening the suffering of all those who may be involved or unwillingly caught in armed conflict.

Becoming a Student, Remaining a Student, Never Less than a Student: A Special Issue in Honor of Charles Hallisey

Karen Derris, University of Redlands
Natalie Gummer, Beloit College
Maria Heim, Amherst College

This Special Issue in honor of Charles Hallisey is edited by three friends and colleagues who began studying with him in the 1990's. We asked twenty-four contributors—drawn from Hallisey's students and colleagues—to reflect in short essays on how Charles Hallisey's work on "moral anthropology" has influenced their work in Buddhist ethics and literature. Hallisey's felicitations of two of his own teachers begin the collection, and an Afterword by Wendy Doniger completes it. We also include a consolidated transcript based on two interviews with Hallisey conducted by Natalie Gummer in the Summer and Fall of 2023. This introduction sets out some of the interventions of Hallisey's work in Buddhist ethics and the major themes of the contributors.

Emptiness and Otherness: A Comparison Between the "Gift Debate" in French Postmodern Thought and *Dāna-Pāramitā* in Mahāyāna Buddhism

Mingyi Xiao
University of California, Santa Barbara

This article delves into the intersection of Western postmodern thought's "gift debate," rooted in Marcel Mauss's work and continued by Jacques Derrida and Jean-Luc Marion, and Mahāyāna Buddhism's practice of *dāna* (almsgiving). Examining parallels, the article identifies resonances in two dimensions. Firstly, in the realm of truth, the wisdom of "three-fold emptiness" in Madhyamaka Buddhism offers insights into the paradoxical nature of the gift, reconciling Derrida's scarcity and Marion's abundance perspectives. Secondly, ethically, the emphasis on the "other" in the gift prompts reflection on dāna's motives, deepening our understanding of self-other relationships in Buddhism. This exploration seeks to facilitate a comparative dialogue between postmodern thought and Mahāyāna Buddhism, unraveling philosophical, ethical, and religious dimensions within the act of giving.

"The Shadow of the Whip:" *Memento Mori* in Dōgen's *12 Fascicles Collection* (十二巻本集)

Steven Heine
Florida International University

This article offers a reexamination and reevaluation of the philosophical meaning and significance of Dōgen's 道元 (1200-1253) last text that was left unfinished shortly before he died and was lost for centuries after that. The main message of the work concerns the inviolability of karmic causality (*inga* 因果) and the need to offer sincere repentance (*zange* 懺悔) for offenses committed. For various reasons, I refer to the final text as the *12 Fascicles Collection* (*Jūnikanbon-shū* 十二巻本集) instead of using the customary moniker of the "12-fascicle *Shōbōgenzō*" (Jūnikanbon *Shōbōgenzō* 十二巻本正法眼蔵), which implies it is one of several versions of Dōgen's masterwork. The title of this article, drawn from a passage in the "Shime (Four Horses)" fascicle of the *Collection*, highlights that a true Buddhist practitioner learns to respond to an awareness of the imminence of finitude and mortality like a proverbial splendid horse that spontaneously "races off upon seeing the shadow of the whip" (*mi ben'ei nigyō* 見鞭影而行). This image suggests the steed does not suffer the rider's reprimands, or to put it another way, a true aspirant need not be prodded to obey the law of causality because he knows how to conduct himself in a principled way in every circumstance. The *12-Fascicles Collection* should also be seen as the result of Dōgen's effort to curate the legacy of his general instructional outlook by rewriting or recasting some of his earlier essays and themes while crafting a timeless primer of basic Buddhist tenets. Its *memento mori* approach has a resonance with Kamakura-period deathbed practices and morality tales (*setsuwa bungaku* 説話文学).

Buddhist Performing Arts: Thematizing Gender and Developing a New Pedagogy in Modern Thai Buddhism

Martin Seeger
University of Leeds
Apirak Chaipanha
Burapha University
Naris Charaschanyawong
Independent Scholar

This article sets out to describe and reflect on the development, execution, and impact of two devised theatre performances that the authors of this article designed as an innovative and effective way of engaging audiences with Buddhist teachings and gender issues in Thai Buddhism. Based on long-term research into the biographies, soteriological practice and teaching, and veneration of historical Thai female Buddhist practitioners, each of these two plays was staged publicly twice in or near Bangkok in 2018 and 2019 respectively. We will discuss how the educational potential of performing arts can be harnessed to change understandings of audiences and performers or, at least, prompt their curiosity in the study of Buddhism, both as a doctrinal system and in terms of aspects of current religious practices, understandings, and perceptions

Economic Justice in the Buddhist Tradition

Christopher Queen
Harvard University

Buddhism is widely associated today with progressive values and exemplary models of economic life. The idea of "Buddhist economics" was paired with the slogan "small is beautiful" by the economist E. F. Schumacher in 1973. Voluntary simplicity, renunciation, and a middle path between self-indulgence and self-denial are seen as keys to sustainable levels of acquisition and consumption. Buddhist kindness and compassion are thought to inspire charitable giving to the poor, and right livelihood to promote occupations of service to society. Yet the history of Buddhist economics does not always support these assumptions. Traditional beliefs in karma and merit-making do not align with modern ideas of justice. We examine the Buddhist record in areas of social equality, property, natural resources, products, wealth, income, jobs, and taxation. Each section surveys Buddhist economics in the Theravāda cultures of South and Southeast Asia; the Mahāyāna cultures that flourished in India, China, Tibet, and East Asia; and the modern period, marked by the rise of Engaged Buddhism in Asia and the West. At each stage we find distinctive teachings and practices in the economic sphere.

Buddhism and the State: *Rājadhamma* after the *Sattelzeit*

Lajos Brons

Rājadhamma is a list of ten royal virtues or duties that occurs in the *jātaka* tales and that has been influential in Southeast Asian Buddhist political thought. Like pre-modern political thought in Europe—that is, thought before the *Sattelzeit*—Buddhist political thought lacks a concept of the "state" and is concerned with kings and similar rulers. Here I propose a modernized interpretation of *rājadhamma* as virtues/duties of the state.